A Critical History of Social Work, The Canadian Salvation Army, and Female Sexual "Deviance" in Canada, 1886-1940

by

Bonnie Sawyer
B.A., University of Guelph, 2012

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in the Department of History

Supervisory Committee

A Critical History of Social Work, The Canadian Salvation Army, and Female Sexual "Deviance" in Canada, 1886-1940

by

Bonnie Sawyer
B.A., University of Guelph, 2012

Supervisory Committee

Dr. Lynne Marks (Department of History)
Supervisor

Dr. Annalee Lepp (Department of Women's Studies)
Departmental Member

Abstract

Supervisory Committee
Dr. Lynne Marks (Department of History)
Supervisor
Dr. Annalee Lepp (Department of Women's Studies)
Departmental Member

Canadian historians tend to present the field of social work that emerged in the early twentieth century as a secular and scientific advancement from inefficient, religious charity work that predated it. This thesis not only challenges the binary thinking as it pertains to social work and charity, but argues that social work was established in Canada by religious groups, many of which were evangelical, such as the Canadian Salvation Army. Introduced to American social work theories and methods in the late nineteenth century, the Canadian Salvation Army incorporated the theory of "feeblemindedness," and the methods of casework and classification, into their traditional discourses on, and practices with, female sexual "deviants" in the early-twentieth century. From 1910 to 1940, there was a transition period between the dominance of evangelical charity and that of secular social work, in working with female sexual "deviants," throughout which evangelicals braided religious discourses with those of scientific social work. By 1940 secular social workers had won the battle for supremacy, and as a result, the dehumanization of sex workers and unmarried mothers increased as they went from being understood as victims/sinners who could be fully reclaimed, to biologically inferior and subjected to forced institutionalization and sterilization.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Introduction

In 1887, the Canadian Salvation Army proclaimed that "underneath the seemingly moral surface of our national life, there is a terrible under-current of unclean vice with all its concomitant evils of ruined lives, desolated hearth-stones, prostituted bodies, decimated constitutions, and early dishonoured graves."[1] They continued: "...our Canadian cities, fair and comely and Christian as they confessedly appear to be, bear upon their streets and hide beneath their immoral houses troops of girls – and many of them mere children – who are earning the wages of sin."[2] Using discourse that was typical of late-nineteenth century evangelicals, the Salvation Army alleged that women were "falling" into sex work in increasing and alarming numbers, and it was their mission to do the work of God by rescuing these supposedly helpless and pitiable creatures. Throughout the nineteenth century and into the twentieth century, many religious groups, including the Catholic Church and a range of Protestant denominations, both evangelical and non-evangelical, directed social services for sex workers, unmarried mothers, and other female sexual "deviants" in Canada. This thesis focuses specifically on the work of Protestant evangelicals, one of the most active religious groups in the field of saving "fallen women." Understanding these women as victims and sinners who could be fully reclaimed through an acceptance of God, evangelicals established rescue homes in which they taught discipline, domestic skills, and the word of God. The Canadian Salvation Army, a leader in evangelical rescue work, boasted fourteen rescue homes across the country by 1910. Dominant narratives, both popular and academic, suggest that, at this moment of institutional expansion, social workers suddenly appeared and took over services for female sexual "deviants." Many

1"Our Rescue Home," *The War Cry*, 24 December 1887, 1.
2Ibid.

historians claim that social workers, armed with the doctrines of "science" and "secularism," transformed backward and inefficient religious-based social services into modern and progressive ones. These assertions may, however, simply be ploys to celebrate the advent of science and secularism and do not reflect the more complex dynamics that led to the rise of social work in Canada.

Social work was largely introduced in Canada by evangelicals as part of their spiritual mission in the early 1900s. Influenced by the creation of social work in the United States, evangelicals incorporated American social work concepts and practices into their work in Canada long before secular social work was established. In the 1900s, the Canadian Salvation Army, for example, incorporated the American social work concept of "feeblemindedness" and the social work practices of classification and casework into their work with female sexual "deviants." These new concepts and practices did not replace traditional ones, but were integrated with them, creating a fusion of evangelical and scientific discourses. It was not until the 1920s that secular social workers formed a cohesive group in Canada due, in part, to the establishment of secular social work programs at the University of Toronto in 1914, McGill University in 1918, and the University of British Columbia in 1926. Evangelical and secular social workers utilized the same scientific concepts and practices; the only striking difference between the two was the role of God and the notion of reclamation in their work. As the field of secular social work grew, its adherents began to distance themselves from evangelical social work and to claim that religion should not be involved in scientific treatment. The two groups of social workers battled for dominance, and by 1940, secular social workers had come out on top. Government officials had been persuaded that the care of sex workers and unmarried mothers should be the prerogative of secular social workers.

The rise of social work in Canada significantly impacted female sexual "deviants," as it further dehumanized sex workers and unmarried mothers. These women went from being understood as victims and sinners to being viewed as biologically defective sub-humans. Services for them, including voluntary stays at rescue homes, were transformed into "treatments," including long-term involuntary

institutionalization and surgical sterilization. Female sexual "deviants" were not passive victims, however. Some utilized the social services offered for their own purposes, while others resisted in a variety of ways, including making formal complaints, evading rules, leaving institutions, and occasionally through acts of violence.[3] While the voices of women who experienced early social work practices have faded to distant echoes, it is the task of the historian to revive these women's experiences and write them back into history. One of the aims of this revised history of social work in Canada is to consider such experiences.

The first chapter of this thesis provides a historiographical overview, an explanation of the historical sources researched, as well as a discussion of the author's relationship to the topic. The historiographical section of this chapter examines four distinct, but related, bodies of secondary literature including works that have explored the Canadian Salvation Army, the Social Gospel, the rise of social work, and the history of female sexual "deviance" in Canada. I argue that this literature lacks nuance in its one-dimensional portrayals of evangelicals and female sexual "deviants" and presents false binaries between religious and scientific discourses in the early twentieth century. I propose a new way of thinking about both sex workers and evangelical rescue workers that recognizes their often complex motivations, and that illuminates the integration of scientific and religious practices, methods, and ideologies related to female sexual "deviance." The chapter also discusses the primary sources consulted for this thesis. It is argued that, while many of the historical sources, such as the Salvation Army's *War Cry*, are problematic due to their propagandistic character, when read critically, they are useful for gaining an understanding of the Army's attitudes toward female sexual "deviants," details about the services it provided, and the transition to secular social work practices. I also present my personal biases. I approach the topics of female sexual "deviance" and institutional reformatories not only from an academic perspective, but also from a personal perspective. I provide a brief overview of my personal experiences and indicate how they have shaped my analysis.

[3]Regina G. Kunzel, *Fallen Women, Problem Girls: Unmarried Mothers and the Professionalization of Social Work, 1890-1945* (Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1995), 98-102.

Covering the period between 1886 and 1910, the second chapter examines the Salvation Army's attitudes toward sex workers and the services the organization provided for them. It also explores the experiences of inmates in the Army's early reform institutions. While much has been written on evangelical reformers' attitudes toward sex workers and unmarried mothers, the literature often presents an over-simplistic interpretation of reformers as either heroes or villains. This chapter offers a more complicated and nuanced analysis. Salvationist ideology is explored not in order to condemn or praise, but in an attempt to understand evangelical women's motivations in engaging in women's reform work, and how such motivations led to a wide range of experiences for inmates.[4] This chapter also examines the services offered to "fallen women" by the Canadian Salvation Army through its rescue homes. It identifies when and where homes were built in Canada from 1886 to 1911, and investigates how these homes were designed, how they acquired inmates, what services they offered, their approach to treatment, as well as the experiences of Salvation Army Officers and rescue home inmates.

Chapter three explores the second phase of the Canadian Salvation Army's attitudes toward and the services offered to female sexual "deviants" in the period between 1910 and 1940. It examines the Army's shift in focus from sex workers to unmarried mothers, along with the creation, and running of, maternity hospitals. The lived experiences of inmates in Army maternity hospitals are also discussed. The chapter then argues that, through the incorporation of the methods and theories employed by social workers in the United States, as well as the establishment of some of Canada's first social work institutions, the Canadian Salvation Army, along with other evangelical organizations, largely introduced the field of social work into Canada. The Army's adoption of the theory of "feeblemindedness" and the practices of classification and casework are explored in order to demonstrate how evangelicals braided American social work discourses into their own. After introducing American social work into Canada, evangelical social workers began to face competition from secular social workers around the 1920s. This

[4]This thesis explores the work of female evangelicals among sex workers because, within the Salvation Army, men participated in reform activities geared toward men, and women in reform activities geared toward women. While Salvationist males could discuss and create approaches to reforming sex workers, only women dealt with sex workers in practice.

chapter highlights the similarities and differences between the two groups and describes their long and contentious battle for dominance, which secular social workers achieved by 1940. It is demonstrated that "secularization" did not occur as early, or as quickly, as some scholars suggest.

Finally, it is argued that the rise of social work in Canada led to an increase in the dehumanization of female sexual "deviants."While evangelicals braided eugenic understandings with humanizing religious understandings, the medical-scientific community relied solely on eugenic and other supposedly "objective" scientific concepts. They understood sex workers and unmarried mothers as "mental defectives" who could not be cured or reclaimed, and advocated involuntary institutionalization and sterilization, which continued in British Columbia until 1986. Even after this period, the legacies of “scientific” social work and eugenic ideas have remained with us, and continue to shape, and negatively affect those defined as “sexual deviants.”

Chapter 1: Historiography and Methodology

Historiography

This thesis engages with four historiographies that, while separate, also intersect. These include the historiography of the Canadian Salvation Army, the Social Gospel, social work, and female sexual "deviance." The first of these, the historiography of the Canadian Salvation Army, is extremely sparse. In 1952, Salvation Army member Arnold Brown wrote the organization's first history titled, *"What Hath God Wrought?": The History of The Salvation Army in Canada: 1882-1914*. While the work provides important dates and events associated with the church's evangelical work, it does not document the Army's vast social reform efforts, does not include citations of any sort, and aims to simply praise the Army's work without offering any sort of critique or analysis.

In 1968, Stephen Ashley, a graduate student at the University of Guelph, wrote his M.A. thesis on the early years of the Toronto Salvation Army, the period from 1882 to 1896. He argues that, throughout this early period, the Canadian Salvation Army differed significantly from its British headquarters. Although the methods used to organize the body were Boothian in inspiration, he explains that the Canadian Commissioner adopted a milder form of discipline than that favoured by the General. The flexibility of his more relaxed command gave birth to a Salvationist movement quite different from the British model, although the mission of the Canadian movement remained the conversion of the sinful masses.[1]

In 1977, R.G. Moyles, another member of the Canadian Salvation Army, published *The Blood and Fire in Canada: A History of the Salvation Army in the Dominion, 1882-1976*. Moyles explores the Army's particular approach, social outreach activities, and provincial variance, while applying academic conventions such as proper citations and a full bibliography. Like Brown, however, he offers little critical analysis and the work comes across as a progressive narrative of the organization.

[1]Stephen M. Ashley, "The Salvation Army in Toronto, 1882-1896," M.A. thesis, University of Guelph, 1969, 19.

In 1992, Lynne Marks published an essay titled, "The 'Hallelujah Lasses': Working-Class Women in the Salvation Army in English Canada, 1882-1892," in *Gender Conflicts: New Essays in Women's History*. She examines the unique gender roles that existed in the Army in an effort to understand the "nature of working-class women's involvement in English-Canadian religious life."[2] More specifically, Marks analyzes the ways in which the organization not only allowed, but required, women to behave in ways that challenged traditional gender expectations. She suggests that the Army provided women with unconventional roles, due to its belief in abandoning all self-interest and dedicating one's life to serving God, despite middle-class notions of femininity. Furthermore, Marks argues that women who chose to take on these roles within the Salvation Army demonstrated a rejection or indifference toward dominant gender expectations.

Four years later, in 1996, Marks published a book titled, *Revivals and Roller Rinks: Religion, Leisure, and Identity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Small-Town Ontario*. The work strives to understand the "meaning and impact of late-nineteenth century Protestant culture on the lives and identities of Ontarians."[3] In order to accomplish this, Marks goes beyond studying church attendance and explores the role of gender, class, and leisure activities in three Ontario towns. She analyzes the role of working-class individuals in the Canadian Salvation Army in order to demonstrate a lack of adherence to mainstream Protestant culture at the local level. In presenting this argument, Marks offers information on the Army's unique approach to evangelicalism, its gender and class make-up, and its appeal to women who joined its ranks.

The most recent work on the Canadian Salvation Army sheds light on the Army's services for immigrants in the early twentieth century. In 2007, Myra Rutherdale published an article titled, "'Canada Is No Dumping Ground': Salvation Army Immigrants, Public Discourse and the Lived Experiences of Women and Children Newcomers, 1900-1930," in *Histoire Sociale/Social History*. The article explores

---

[2]Lynne Marks, "'The 'Hallelujah Lasses': Working-Class Women in the Salvation Army in English Canada, 1882-1892," in *Gender Conflicts: New Essays in Women's History*, eds. Franca Lacovetta and Mariana Valverde (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992), 67.

[3]Lynne Marks, *Revivals and Roller Rinks: Religion, Leisure, and Identity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Small-Town Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 4.

the immigration of British residents to Canada between 1900 and 1930 under the auspices of the Canadian Salvation Army. Through case studies of 200 single females and 200 children who emigrated from Britain as sponsors of the Army, Rutherdale argues that the newcomers successfully and independently adapted and prospered in Canada. Significant insight into the Canadian Salvation Army is offered throughout, as the author describes its immigration work, including its goals and approach to evangelicalism, as well as its relationship with the government.[4]

In 2012, Ashley Forseille completed her MA thesis titled, "'Reading Between the Lines:' Religion, Courtship, and Correspondence in the Salvation Army, 1906-1910." Forseille examines conceptions of courtship and marriage through the love letters of two Canadian Salvationists, Henry Tutte and Edith Willey. She offers insight into the Army's ideological understandings of marriage and love, how the Army officially and unofficially regulated the relationships of its members, as well as into the lives of Salvationist Officers.[5]

Ashley, Marks, Rutherdale, and Forseille are the only academic historians who have written about the Canadian Salvation Army. Clearly, there is much work to be done. The literature does not provide an analysis of the history of Army's social services, particularly those for "fallen women." Moyles' work only explores three aspects of early Salvation Army social services: the Grace Hospitals, the Prison Gate, and immigration services. "Fallen women" are mentioned only briefly in the small section on Grace Hospitals, and much is left to be investigated about the services offered to unmarried mothers and sex trade workers. Marks also briefly mentions the rescue work of female Salvationists in the context of her discussion of social work and gender roles and claims that it was not a popular line of work in the Army in the late nineteenth century. She highlights the fact that the Salvation Army had difficulty attracting and retaining women to the field of social services for "fallen women." But what the actual services involved is not analyzed. This thesis will add important information on the Army's attitudes toward "fallen women"

[4] Myra Rutherdale, "'Canada Is No Dumping Ground:' Salvation Army Immigrants, Public Discourse and the Lived Experiences of Women and Children Newcomers, 1900-1930," *Histoire Sociale/Social History* 79 (May 2007): 75-115.

[5] Ashley Forseille, "'Reading Love Between the Lines': Religion, Courtship, and Correspondence in the Salvation Army, 1906-1910," M.A. thesis, University of Victoria, 2012.

and the services offered to them. It will also analyze the ways in which Salvation Army social services evolved throughout the Social Gospel era and how the organization reacted to the creation of social work.

The most recent historiography on the Social Gospel in Canada was written in the 1980s and 1990s. This literature builds on earlier hagiographical narratives and top-down approaches which focused solely on male elites. Despite the advances scholars have made in expanding academic understandings of the Social Gospel era, the literature is limited by its reliance on a binary framework of the secular versus the religious. Scholars have focused on whether or not Canada was secular or religious following the Social Gospel era, a debate known as the "secularization debate." One group of historians, including Richard Allen, Ramsay Cook, and David Marshall, argue that the motivation behind the Protestant church's focus on social reform was due to a fear of losing power in public life to new scientific discourses.[6] In 1985, Cook published *The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada*, in which he suggests that Darwinian science and historical criticism of the Bible led to a religious crisis in the Christian churches and to an attempt to "salvage Christianity by transforming it into an essentially social religion."[7] Similarly, David Marshall claims in *Secularizing the Faith* that "[c]lergymen in Canada unwittingly contributed to the process of secularization in their quest to make religion conform to the needs and demands of the modern world."[8] All three scholars also argue that the Social Gospel era was the last period in which the Christian churches held a dominant position in public life – that following the Social Gospel era, Canada began to secularize. Cook states that the Christian response to the religious crisis "resulted in Christianity becoming less rather than more relevant."[9] Allen similarly claims that the Social Gospel "encouraged the development of a secular society."[10]

---

[6]See Richard Allen, *The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada 1914-1928* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971); Ramsay Cook, *The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985); and David B. Marshall, *Secularizing the Faith: Canadian Protestant Clergy and the Crisis of Belief, 1850-1940* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992).
[7]Cook, *The Regenerators*, 4-5.
[8]Marshall, *Secularizing the Faith*, 8.
[9]Cook, *The Regenerators*, 4-5.
[10]Allen, *The Social Passion*, 356.

After Allen, Cook, and Marshall established one academic interpretation of the Canadian Social Gospel in the1970s, 1980s, and early 1990s, literature began to be published that opposed their analysis. In 1996, Nancy Christie and Michael Gauvreau published *A Full-Orbed Christianity: The Protestant Churches and Social Welfare in Canada, 1900-1940*. The introduction boldly declares that, "[w]e have taken as our starting-point the injunction of Ramsay Cook and David Marshall, the most recent proponents of the secularization thesis in Canada," and marches right into battle.[11] The authors challenge "the assumptions of the secularization thesis that the decade of the 1920s was a period of drift for the Canadian churches and that social evangelism was the catalyst which ultimately led to the irrelevance of Christianity in the wider culture."[12] Their work suggests that the Protestant church entered the realm of social reform not out of fear, but out of genuine belief in the new scientific discourses. It also demonstrates that the Protestant church remained a dominant power in the realm of social services after the Social Gospel era had subsided. The authors go so far as to claim that "the period between 1900 and 1940 represented the apogee of the cultural authority of the churches."[13]

Other scholars joined the debate over secularization. In 2002, Margeurite Van Die published an article in Nancy Christie's edited collection, *Households of Faith: Family, Gender, and Community in Canada, 1760-1969*, which problematizes the concept of secularization in mid-Victorian Brantford, Ontario.[14] In 2004, Catherine Gidney published *A Long Eclipse*, which explores the role of Protestantism on Canadian campuses and argues that a "vision of a moral community informed by liberal Protestantism was dominant in the early years of the twentieth century" and remained an "animating presence" as late as the 1960s.[15] By arguing that universities in Canada could not be considered predominantly secular until the late 1960s, she is contesting the popular notion that secularization followed the Social Gospel era.

---

[11]Nancy Christie and Michael Gauvreau, eds., *A Full-Orbed Christianity: The Protestant Churches and Social Welfare in Canada* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1996), xi.
[12]Ibid.
[13]Ibid., xii.
[14]Marguerite Van Die, "Revisiting 'Separate Spheres': Women, Religion and the Family in Mid-Victorian Brantford, Ontario," In *Households of Faith: Family, Gender, and Community in Canada, 1760-1969*, ed. Nancy Christie, 234-263 (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002), 236.
[15]Catherine Gidney, *A Long Eclipse: The Liberal Protestant Establishment and the Canadian University, 1920-1970* (London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004), xxiv.

Gidney offers a sharp critique of the secularization thesis in her introduction and asserts that scholars need a "new approach that does not assume an inevitable link between modernity and religious privatization but that focuses instead on the public voice of religion."[16]

In 2005, Marguerite Van Die added to her previous challenge to the secularization thesis with the publication of *Religion, Family and Community in Victorian Canada*. The book explores how evangelical Protestant religious rituals, beliefs, and traditions served as cultural resources which individuals used to provide meaning and reshape identity as they negotiated transformations throughout their lives.[17]In the introduction, Van Die states that, "one has to look beyond the sermons, theological treatises, personalities, and ecclesiastical institutions whose study has shaped much of what one Canadian historian has rightly called 'the strained and somewhat inclusive debate over 'secularization'."[18] She also highlights the importance of the concept of "lived religion," which shifts attention away from institutions and theology to studying religion as "a living and mutating phenomenon that allowed people to deal with the contradictions and tensions inherent in their culture as they made connections between their own family situation, the wider society, and God."[19] Overall, the work complicates over-simplistic assumptions that religion became less important in people's lives with the rise of modernity.

In this messy and convoluted debate, scholars have misinterpreted each other's works and have defined "secularization" and "religion" differently, making the discussion rather futile. In 1992, Marshall argued that secularization is an extremely complex process, which involves the replacement of religious or supernatural explanations with scientific ones, the laicization of social institutions and functions, the loss of Christian religion's monopoly position, the modernization of belief and worship practices, and a decline in church involvement.[20] He added that, "to argue that society is becoming increasingly secular

[16]Ibid., xx.
[17]Marguerite Van Die, *Religion, Family, and Community in Victorian Canada: The Colbys of Carrollcroft* (London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005), 4.
[18]Ibid., 8.
[19]Ibid.
[20]Marshall, *Secularizing the Faith*, 7.

does not mean that religious faith and institutions disappear."[21] Ramsay Cook borrowed Owen Chadwick's definition of secularization as "a growing tendency of mankind to do without religion, or to try to do without religion."[22] Cook further pointed out that secularization does not merely involve changes in religious ideas or doctrine, but "a shift from a religious explanation of man's behaviour and relationships to a non-religious one."[23]

In their 1996 work, *A Full-Orbed Christianity*, Christie and Gauvreau suggest that Marshall and Cook had made a different argument. Christie and Gauvreau define secularization as "positing that modernization, generally defined as industrialization, urbanization, and the expansion of the capitalist market economy, necessarily diminishes the social significance of religion – if not giving rise to outright belief – by producing new forms of social differentiation, an individualist ethos, and cultural pluralism."[24] They criticize scholars for portraying secularization as "a linear, irreversible process driven by economic causes," for essentializing churches and religious institutions as passive entities which are simply acted upon, and for suggesting that churches and religion are immobile.[25] While Christie and Gauvreau do not adequately assess or accurately characterize Marshall's and Cook's arguments, they highlight the complexities of the role of the church and religion during the Social Gospel era, specifically in the area of social reform.

This thesis, like the work of Van Die, Gidney, as well as Christie and Gauvreau, contests the over-simplistic assertions of the secularization thesis and shows the dynamic relationship between religion and the realities of everyday life. It also suggests that the debate over the Social Gospel be reframed. Much of the literature aims to show that the Christian church either lost its social dominance following the Social Gospel era or that its monopoly continued. Such over-simplifications and binary understandings of the secular and religious are not accurate or useful. There is ample evidence to indicate

[21]Ibid., 18.
[22]Cook, The *Regenerators*, 5.
[23]Ibid.
[24]Christie and Gauvreau, *A Full-Orbed Christianity*, 7.
[25]Ibid., 7-9.

that, while the Christian church's power was declining in certain respects, it also continued, perhaps thrived, in other areas. It is important that historians explore the complexities of the churches' role within, and following, the Social Gospel era in order problematize the conventional notion that the introduction of scientific discourse led to secularization. In doing so, the term "secularization" might be revealed as misrepresentative. Although Cook and Marshall tried to redefine the term for their own purposes, connotations attached to such a word cannot simply be erased. The term "secularization" implies an end of religion and therefore, promotes a progressive narrative. It also implies that religious belief was decreasing when, in fact, that is debateable.

This thesis draws on Robert Orsi's conceptualization of religion. Orsi, in *Lived Religion in America*, explains that, "[o]ur current critical vocabulary encodes such dualism [between 'Christian' and 'secular'], reifies discrete segments of experience, and erects boundaries that do not exist in the real world and that belie the protean nature of religious creativity."[26] He goes on to argue that, "[t]he analytical language of religious studies, organized as it still is around a series of fixed, mutually exclusive, and stable polar opposites, must be reconfigured in order to make sense of religion as lived experience. A new vocabulary is demanded to discuss such phenomena, a language as hybrid and tensile as the realities it seeks to describe."[27] This thesis will follow Orsi's injunction to discuss religion as a dynamic phenomenon.

This thesis also aims to support Christie and Gauvreau's claim that the Protestant church remained a dominant player in the Canadian social service sector until 1940. While their work offers a broad intellectual and cultural history of religion and social services, this thesis aims to offer a more detailed, cultural and social history of the religious nature of social services through a case study of the Canadian Salvation Army's services for sex trade workers and unmarried mothers. Providing such a case study will shed light on the intricacies and specifics of how Protestant churches melded the social sciences into their evangelical discourses and remained influential until the late 1930s. It will ultimately

[26]Robert A. Orsi, "Everyday Miracles: The Study of Lived Religion," in *Lived Religion in America: Toward a History of Practice*, ed. David D Hall, 3-22 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), 11.
[27]Ibid.

demonstrate the lack of validity of the "secularization thesis" as it has been applied to the historiography of the Social Gospel. While evangelicalism did vanish from dominant social service discourses after the 1930s, it continued to play an important role in non-dominant social service discourses, and Christian principles continue to shape modern social work discourses to this day.

The conceptual binary between the secular and the religious is also present in the historiography of social work in Canada. The majority of scholars characterize evangelical charity as non-scientific and religious, and social work as scientific and secular. This is highly inaccurate as social work was largely introduced in Canada by evangelical individuals and organizations; it began as an aspect of evangelical charity and only in the 1930s did non-evangelical individuals and organizations emerge to challenge earlier forms of social work. It is only recently that Canadian scholars have begun to highlight the overlap between evangelicalism and early social work.

In 1992, John R. Graham published an article titled "The Haven, 1878-1930: A Toronto Charity's Transition from a Religious to a Professional Ethos," which examines the ideological transformations of The Haven, a rescue home for "fallen women" in Toronto. While the article offers significant insight into how the creation of social work impacted the treatment of "fallen women," it falls into the trap of presenting the transition of the home via an over-simplistic binary model of scientific, secular discourse replacing non-scientific, evangelical charity. For example, Graham fails to emphasize the religious nature of early social work, and in doing so contributes to the idea that it emerged as a purely secular field. In his introduction, Graham problematically states that by the 1930s, "religiously-motivated volunteers had been replaced by professionals trained in secular social work."[28] Graham further suggests that social work "replaced" evangelical charity, neglecting to highlight the significant period in which evangelicalism and social work were amalgamated. Social work was a part of evangelical charity until evangelicalism was gradually weeded out of the field. Graham states that The Haven "made the final break from its religious past in 1937 when it decided to confirm its mandate to working exclusively with the so-called 'mentally

[28]John R. Graham, "The Haven, 1878-1930: A Toronto Charity's Transition from a Religious to a Professional Ethos," *Histoire sociale-Social History*, 25, no. 50 (November 1992): 283.

retarded'."[29] It is inaccurate to state that religious ideology had vanished, when in fact it was evangelicalism that was discarded, not religious belief.

Another work that perpetuates binary thinking with respect to the relationship between evangelical charity and social work is Gale Wills' *A Marriage of Convenience: Business and Social Work in Toronto, 1918-1957*, published in 1995. In the introduction, the author does state that "Christian moral reform was the initial influence" in social work and that "Christian motives for social work never disappeared completely."[30] However, Wills then presents social work as a secular and scientific alternative to evangelical charity. She claims that "professional social work became, above all, a secularization of moral reform and a reaction against the evangelical purpose imposed by organized religion."[31]

Other works have presented the relationship between evangelical charity and social work as less oppositional and have highlighted the overlap between religion and social work in Canada. Doug Owram's, *The Government Generation*, is a history of intellectual reformism in Canada in the first half of the twentieth century, in which Owram examines the "impulse toward reform by means of state intervention from a particular group of intellectuals."[32] Regarding efforts to reform social services, Owram argues that evangelical reformers lost power to secular "professional" social workers in the 1920s. While he acknowledges that voluntary religious social services organizations remained important, there was, by the twenties, a "reliance on a core of full-time, paid, professionally trained social workers."[33] This analysis complicates the binary relationship between evangelical reform and secular social work by demonstrating that there was a long transition period that included overlap between religious and secular initiatives. The main problem with Owram's analysis is his time frame. The research for this thesis demonstrates that secular social workers did not claim superiority over social services in Canada until the

---

[29]Ibid., 138.
[30]Gale Wills, *A Marriage of Convenience: Business and Social Work in Toronto, 1918-1957* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995), 8.
[31]Ibid.
[32] Doug Owram, *The Government Generation: Canadian Intellectuals and the State, 1900-1945* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986), xi.
[33]Ibid., 123.

1940s. The findings of Christie and Gauvreau support this time frame. Therefore, I suggest that Owram's dates for "secularization" are a bit early; that the transition occurred in the late 1930s instead of the 1920s.

In *A Full-Orbed Christianity*, Christie and Gauvreau argue that "almost every facet of social investigation and policymaking fell under Christian leadership" prior to 1940.[34] They maintain that Protestant churches expanded their popular base through mass revivalism and by establishing social work and sociology in Canadian universities. In fact, Protestant churches were at the centre of social work until the advent of university-based social planning in the 1940s. The authors also demonstrate that there was a "clear divergence from the American model of progressivism which was characterized by specialization, the cult of expertise, and the increasing influence of big business on government structures."[35]

Another scholar who complicates the binary between religion and social work is Sara Z. Burke, in *Seeking the Highest Good*. Burke explores the ideologies that influenced the creation and development of the Department of Social Service at the University of Toronto. In doing so, Burke demonstrates the intimate interaction between religion and social work. "Just as many Protestants found themselves able to espouse simultaneously the goals of social reform and evangelism," she writes, "students at Toronto could pursue an interest in idealism without having to deny their own wish for Christ's redemption."[36] She goes on to substantiate this claim through an examination of William Lyon Mackenzie King who was both strongly influenced by W.J. Ashley, a professor of political economy, and Protestantism. Burke also highlights that the Department of Social Services at the University of Toronto was initially run by the YMCA and promoted evangelicalism.[37]

There are also early works on the history of social work in Canada that ignore the role of religion completely, such as James Pitsula's article, "The Emergence of Social Work in Toronto," published in the *Journal of Canadian Studies* in 1979. The author argues that by 1921, paid social workers "had to a large

---

[34]Christie and Gauvreau, *A Full-Orbed Christianity*, xi.
[35]Ibid., xiv.
[36]Sara Z. Burke, *Seeking the Highest Good: Social Service and Gender at the University of Toronto, 1888-1937* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 32.
[37]Ibid., 29.

extent taken away the management of the poor relief system from volunteers."[38] Pitsula fails to account for the role of religion in the transformation from charity to paid social work. Beverley J. Scott's *Establishing Professional Social Work in Vancouver and at the University of British Columbia,* published in2004, also fails to provide an in-depth examination of the religious nature of social work. The author does, however, include factual information that unintentionally demonstrates the role that religion and religious institutions played in the creation and expansion of social work in British Columbia. For example, Scott notes that Vancouver's Friendly Aid Society, an early social work institution, included four members from each of the Protestant churches, five members from the Salvation Army, as well as three City Council representatives and two members from the Trades and Labour Council.[39] Clearly, religious institutions played a significant role in the Friendly Aid Society.

This thesis suggests that the historiography of social work in Canada needs reworking. In contesting the notion that early social work was secular, this thesis will demonstrate that there was no direct transition from evangelical charity to secular social work in Canada. Instead, secular social work was created in the United States around the 1890s and adopted in Canada by evangelical organizations and leaders. Protestant churches combined evangelicalism with new social science methods and theories. It was not until the 1930s that Canada saw the creation of a secular social work field within universities. In addition, the historiography of social work in Canada needs to be broadened in terms of the social services explored. Most scholarly works only deal with social work as it related to poor relief, the protection of children, and widowed or abandoned single mothers.[40] This thesis will move beyond these areas of social work activity to consider attitudes toward, and services for, sex trade workers and unmarried mothers.

---

[38]James Pitsula, "The Emergence of Social Work in Toronto," *Journal of Canadian Studies,* 14 (Spring 1979): 35.

[39]Beverley J. Scott, *Establishing Professional Social Work in Vancouver and at the University of British Columbia* (Vancouver: Published by Author, 2004), 15.

[40]The only two academic works on the general history of social work in Canada were written by Jennison and Pitsula. Both focus almost solely on social work in relation to unemployment and poor relief. Other works have been written that focus specifically on a certain issue, usually child welfare or unmarried mothers. See, for example, Lori Chambers, *Misconceptions: Unmarried Motherhood and the Ontario Children of Unmarried Parents Act, 1921-1969* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2007).

The historiography of social work in Canada also lacks critical analyses of the field of social work. Social work has been uncritically lauded by many historians as the answer to the inadequacies of religious charity. The first historian to praise the advent of social work was James Pitsula in his article, "The Emergence of Social Work in Toronto." The work presents an over-simplistic explanation of social work as the progressive alternative to deeply-flawed and inefficient charity. He argues that volunteer charity became "inadequate" and that the "volunteer system broke down and was replaced, in the interests of economy and efficiency, by welfare bureaucracies run by trained social workers."[41] Nowhere does Pitsula offer a critical perspective on the social work system itself.

This progressive interpretation of social work can also be found in Gale Wills' book, *A Marriage of Convenience*. The author examines the relationship between social work organizations and the financial institutions that funded their work, along with the role that gender norms played in this interaction. In her introduction, she states that, "[n]o history of social work can overlook the diversified nature of the profession."[42] While she succeeds in complicating historical understandings of social work by highlighting the varied approaches in the field, she presents a progressive narrative when she asserts that all social workers came together "in the common cause of breathing efficiency and standards of professional practice into local charities."[43] Throughout the book, Wills characterizes social work as a modern improvement to old and inefficient charities. Social workers, whether liberal or conservative, all "articulated a basic commitment to social change,"[44]and the profession's reliance on science, rationality, and expertise is assumed to be wholly positive.

Few scholars have been critical of the progressive narrative of social work. John R. Graham, in his article on The Haven, makes one brief, critical statement at the end of his article. He states that the transfer of power to secular social workers "ultimately restricted the compassionate impulses of the

[41]Pitsula, *The Emergence of Social Work*, 37.
[42]Wills, *A Marriage of Convenience*, 3.
[43]Ibid., 6.
[44]Ibid., 13.

volunteers."[45] Beyond this, the only scholar to present a substantial critique is Regina Kunzel, in *Fallen Women, Problem Girls* (1995).This work, however, does not discuss social services in a Canadian context, but details the development of social services for unwed mothers in the United States. She argues that, beginning in the early twentieth century, the new profession of social work challenged the authority of evangelical reformers in maternity homes. Promoting themselves as objective and scientific professionals, social workers criticized benevolent women for their emotions and irrationality. They contended that unwed mothers were not, as evangelicals suggested, victims of seduction and betrayal who could be "redeemed" with religious instruction and sisterly love, but psychologically inferior individuals who required "treatment" involving institutionalization and sterilization. By the 1940s, after a long and arduous struggle, social workers succeeded in gaining control over the "discourse of illegitimacy."[46]

Throughout her book, Kunzel presents evangelical charity in a fairly positive light. She claims that evangelicals were heirs to a long traditional of female benevolence and that they believed in the redemption and reclamation of unwed mothers. She suggests that evangelical reformers "brought skills of sisterhood, sympathy and piety," and that they treated the women they considered as their "fallen sisters" with the "maternal, religious, and domestic influence that made up the redemptive tonic of womanly benevolence."[47] In contrast, social workers are portrayed as cold and dehumanizing. Kunzel states that "maternity homes changed from being shelters dedicated to the redemption and reclamation of 'fallen women' to places of scientific treatment."[48] Women were no longer viewed as victims, but as the problem: "[r]ather than looking to environmental causes to explain a person's problem, social workers were increasingly inclined to look to 'maladjustment' on the part of the individual."[49] Social work, she explains, "stigmatized working-class women's sexuality as pathological and criminal."[50] Kunzel also critiques social work as a patriarchal alternative to the feminine field of religious charity."By joining their male

[45]Graham, "The Haven," 306.
[46]Kunzel, *Fallen Women,* 42.
[47]Ibid.,2.
[48]Ibid.
[49]Ibid., 44.
[50]Ibid., 64.

colleagues in posing professionalism and femininity as mutually exclusive," she explains, "they participated in the process of gendering professionalism in a way that equated professionalism with masculinity."[51] Social workers also encouraged a "literal and visible male presence in positions of authority."[52]

This thesis will add to critical discussions of social work in North America by arguing that scientific understandings of social problems are just as socially constructed as religious ones. It will also highlight that scientific understandings have accrued an incredible amount of conceptual power, which has resulted not simply in the discursive dehumanizing of female sexual "deviants," but also in their very real and physical dehumanization and denial of human rights through forced institutionalization and sterilization.

The historiography of female sexual "deviance" in North America, which includes the history of sex work, pre-marital sex, and other acts deemed "deviant" by contemporaries, was largely produced in the 1980s and 1990s. The literature is mostly written by female scholars from a feminist framework and tends to focus on the Social Gospel and Progressive Era. Some of the first works to examine the subject in Canada included James H. Gray's *Red Lights on the Prairies* published in 1971; Wendy Mitchinson's "The YWCA and Reform in the Nineteenth Century" published in 1979; Margaret Prang's "'The Girl God Would Have Me Be': The Canadian Girls in Training, 1915-1939" published in 1985; and Diana Pederson's "'Keeping Our Good Girls Good': The YMCA and the Girl Problem, 1870—1930" published in 1986. At the same time, in the United States, Mark T. Connelly published, *The Response to Prostitution in the Progressive Era* in 1980, Ruth Rosen published *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918* in 1982, and Christine Stansell published *City of Women: Sex and Class in New York, 1789-1920* also in 1982. In 1983, Barbara M. Brenzel's *Daughters of the State: A Social Portrait of the First Reform School for Girls in North America, 1856-1905*, was published.

[51]Ibid., 48.
[52]Ibid., 50.

The 1990s witnessed a proliferation of scholarship on the subject of female sexual "deviance." The year 1991 saw the publication of Mariana Valverde's *The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925* and Constance Backhouse's *Petticoats and Prejudice: Women and Law in Nineteenth-Century Canada*. In 1993, Karen Dubinsky published *Improper Advances: Rape and Heterosexual Conflict in Ontario, 1880-1929*, Marilynn Wood Hill published *Their Sisters' Keepers: Prostitution in New York City, 1830-1870*, and Linda Gordon published *Pitied But Not Entitled* in 1994. In 1995 alone, five books on the subject were published including Regina Kunzel's, *Fallen Women, Problem Girls: Unmarried Mothers and the Professionalization of Social Work, 1890-1945*; Mary E. Odem's *Delinquent Daughters: Protecting and Policing Adolescent Female Sexuality in the United States, 1885-1920*; Ruth Alexander's *The Girl Problem: Female Sexuality Delinquency in New York, 1900-1930*; Sharon Anne Cook's, *"Through Sunshine and Shadow": The Woman's Christian Temperance Union, Evangelicalism, and Reform in Ontario, 1874-1930*; and Carolyn Strange's *Toronto's Girl Problem: The Perils and Pleasures of the City, 1880-1930*. With the turn of the century came Tamara Myers' *Caught: Montreal's Modern Girls and the Law, 1869-1945*; Joan Sangster's *Girl Trouble*; and Lori Chambers' *Misconceptions: Unmarried Motherhood and the Ontario Children of Unmarried Parents Act, 1921-1969.*

While this thesis critiques much of the early literature on female sexual "deviance," it is important to remember that these are important and foundational works. More recent work in Canada and the United States has taken the analysis of the topic into new theoretical directions and emphasized the political importance of historical research on the subject. Despite such advances, there are still limitations in the scholarship, especially in terms of the persistent one-dimensional portrayals of evangelical reformers and of sex work/sex workers.

The majority of works on the history of female sexual "deviance" present evangelical reformers as a homogenous group of ignorant, middle-class women whose primary aim was to control young women's sexuality and who were devoid of any benevolent intentions. In Carolyn Strange's *Toronto's Girl Problem*, evangelical reformers' motivations and actions are described as regulating, monitoring,

imposing, and assaulting. They "imposed [regulatory mechanisms] on working girls' pastimes," "monitor[ed] urban morality," "set out to impose sexual order," "launched their assault on urban vice and immorality," and attempted to "regulate wage-earning women's time on and off the job."[53] Ruth Rosen, in *The Lost Sisterhood*, describes the intention of Progressives as a "repressive campaign to suppress prostitution."[54] She states that their anti-vice work was an "offensive campaign waged against an internal domestic enemy."[55] Using a militaristic metaphor, Rosen goes on to argue that, "[a]lthough the battle grew out of sporadic skirmishes of the previous century and employed weapons left behind by earlier reformers, a new and dramatic goal had been set: to eradicate prostitution."[56] Despite some statements to the contrary, Ruth Alexander, in *The Girl Problem*, also describes the efforts of Progressives as designed "to control and repress the sexualisation of female adolescence."[57]In general, she fails to make any serious attempt to understand reformers' intentions. Similarly, Christine Stansell, in *City of Women*, argues that evangelical reformers were motivated by a desire to eradicate prostitution in New York City, and does not mention that they also sought to help "fallen women."

Besides being characterized as oppressive, evangelical reformers are also depicted as being unconcerned with or ignorant about the economic circumstances of "fallen women." For example, Strange maintains that,"[t]he YWCA and its wealthy supporters were more concerned with wage-earning women's ability to preserve their reputations, no matter how poorly they were paid, than with their limited earnings."[58]She goes on to argue that, "[u]nwilling to recognize their complicity in the economic exploitation of working women, they [YWCA] described the sorry lot of working girls as an inevitable

---

[53]Carolyn Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem: The Perils and Pleasures of the City, 1880-1930* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995), 15, 17-19.

[54]Ruth Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982), xiii. Rosen's work is an interesting case. In her introduction, she almost glorifies evangelical efforts in the early nineteenth century as feminist, and dismisses later Progressive initiatives in a one-dimensional manner. While she does not necessarily attack evangelical reformers, she does denounce Progressives, a group which encompassed evangelical reformers.

[55]Ibid., 1.

[56]Ibid.

[57]Ruth M. Alexander, *The Girl Problem: Female Sexuality Delinquency in New York, 1900-1930* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1995), 63.

[58]Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem*, 61.

fact of life in the industrializing city."[59] Rosen portrays Progressives as dismissive of the economic motivations for entering sex work. "Jessie Hodder, superintendent of the Massachusetts Reformatory for Women during the early 1900s," she maintains, "freely explained how young female deviants needed to find redemption more than economic rehabilitation."[60]Alexander depicts reformers as ignorant of the desires of "fallen women," stating that they ignored "the possibility that some of these wage earners might take pleasure in confounding Victorian standards of female respectability..."[61]Stansell claims that, "[t]he problem of prostitution as reformers defined it had no necessary relation to the experience of the women involved" and characterizes reformers' understandings of sex work as a "tragic fate."[62] Chambers argues that, despite unmarried mothers' attempts to explain the realities of their circumstances, reformers and social workers refused to accept their descriptions. "The central irony of these case files," she states, "is how little social workers learned from the repeated stories of the women they were supposedly helping."[63]

Scholars also depict evangelical reformers as incompetent and the services they provided as ineffective. For example, Strange describes YWCA efforts to reform leisure activities as follows: "Their clumsy early attempts were decided flops."[64] Mariana Valverde, in *The Age of Light, Soap and Water*, dismisses Salvation Army homes for "fallen women" as inefficient: "the women were considered to be 'fallen' by virtue of the fact that they were in a Rescue Home, and 'rehabilitated' by doing commercial laundry work."[65] She also states that, "[t]he practices of rescue work continued to treat all women in rescue homes as requiring conversion and reform, regardless of their guilt or innocence."[66] Rosen maintains that the work undertaken in evangelical reformatories "did not eradicate prostitution."[67] "In most cases," she continues, "'rehabilitation' in reformatories meant practicing sewing, scrubbing, and

---

[59]Ibid.
[60]Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood*, 21.
[61]Alexander, *The Girl Problem*, 35.
[62]Stansell, *City of Women*, 172, 176.
[63]Chambers, *Misconceptions*, 57.
[64]Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem*, 118.
[65]Mariana Valverde, *The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc., 1991), 102.
[66]Ibid., 103.
[67]Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood*, 20.

cooking in preparation for work as a domestic servant – an occupation for which many prostitutes felt special contempt."[68]

These scholars fail to highlight any of the effective and positive impacts that evangelical reformers had on the lives of "fallen women." Carolyn Strange is highly critical of the work of the YWCA, arguing that,"[i]n its efforts to protect respectable women and rescue fallen women, the YWCA perpetuated and rigidified the moral distinction between single wage-earning women who had preserved themselves from urban immorality and those who had become the embodiment of 'the social evil'."[69] Rosen states that "the female reformatory rarely helped prostitutes."[70]In critiquing Ontario's legislation for unmarried mothers, Chambers maintains that the acts "reinforced a hierarchical ordering of families, were not-so-subtly coercive, and defined motherhood as appropriate only for women who met specific moral criteria."[71]

In opposition to the majority of works that present evangelical reformers as one-dimensional oppressors is the work of Sharon Cook who portrays evangelical reformers as one-dimensional heroes. In her introduction she writes:

> Just who were these fearless young women? They belonged to a dynamic youth group within the Woman's Christian Temperance Union, one of the most productive, yet today forgotten, evangelical temperance organizations in nineteenth-century Ontario. Its central evangelical task was to reform society around the concept of a re-constituted family committed to Christian values. These women not only had a major impact on Canadian society, but reflected a leading religious and intellectual current of their age. This book is their story.[72]

In her book, the author depicts members of the WCTU as feminists who made great advances for women of all classes in Ontario. She overlooks the contradictions between their rhetoric and their interactions with "fallen women," and the many injustices that working-class women endured as a result of WCTU initiatives.

---

[68]Ibid., 21.
[69]Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem*, 61.
[70]Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood*, 20.
[71]Chambers, *Misconceptions*,32.
[72]Sharon Anne Cook, *"Through Sunshine and Shadow": The Woman's Christian Temperance Union, Evangelicalism, and Reform in Ontario, 1874-1930* (McGill-Queen's University Press, 1995), 6.

A few scholars, however, have succeeded in offering a more complex and comprehensive understanding of evangelical reformers and their work. The first to do this was Wendy Mitchinson in her 1979 article, "The YWCA and Reform in the Nineteenth Century." Mitchinson addresses the historiographical issue of one-dimensionality by explaining that,"[s]ome historians have seen reformers as saints, while others, especially those analysing from the perspective of the working class, have viewed them as sinners or, at the very least, exploiters."[73] She further maintains that, "[t]he idea that individuals acted through a single motivation seemed to dominate historical writing."[74]In an effort to offer a more nuanced understanding, Mitchinson argues that, "[t]he YWCA wanted to help these women. Unfortunately, it was hindered in this by several factors."[75] She also suggests that "[t]he YWCA truly believed that an acceptance of Christ would lead to a better life for all."[76]

Mitchinson also demonstrates that the YWCA was not ignorant of the needs of "fallen women" and that they did provide some effective services. Female reformers, she maintains, "organized coffee rooms so they would be able to purchase hot, nourishing meals cheaply...organized classes in nursing, dress making, millinery, domestic science, phonography, stenography and typing to help more young women develop skills with which to obtain better employment."[77]Mitchinson further asserts that, "[g]iven reality and the YWCA's own orientation, the Y was responding in an effective way to the plight of the working woman."[78] Mitchinson also avoids glorifying YWCA women by highlighting that YWCA rules and regulations were "highly insulting to the boarders," that the women "stressed the separation between themselves and those they were trying to help," and that they had "little feeling of affinity with their boarders."[79] She also claims that they could be oppressive and patronizing toward boarders through

[73]Wendy Mitchinson, "The YWCA and Reform in the Nineteenth Century," *Histoire Sociale / Social History*, 12, no. 24 (1979): 368-369.
[74]Ibid., 369.
[75]Ibid.
[76]Ibid., 374.
[77]Ibid., 377.
[78]Ibid., 378.
[79]Ibid., 381-382.

practices of close supervision, by requiring character references, and by treating them as children.[80] Overall, Mitchinson seeks to understand the motivations and attitudes of the YWCA women without demonizing or glorifying them.

In 1995, Regina Kunzel further complicated the one-dimensional view of evangelical reformers in her book, *Fallen Women, Problem Girls*. She considers religious motivation and evangelical beliefs, and maintains that nineteenth-century female reformers "had fashioned an ideology of benevolence that celebrated the unique contribution of women...promoted sisterly bonds across the lines of class and reputation, and promised to redeem 'fallen women' through domesticity, religion, and womanly sympathy."[81] She also highlights the contradictions in their work in regard to the ideal of sisterly love; although they referred to unmarried mothers as their sisters, they viewed them as different from and as less than themselves.[82]She also examines the logic behind the curative solutions of work and domesticity, along with the limits of such redemption. Overall, Kunzel provides a complex understanding of evangelical reformers, which aims to understand their motivations without overlooking their limitations.

In their most recent works, both Joan Sangster and Tamara Myers also avoid presenting one-dimensional portrayals of evangelical reformers. Sangster, in *Girl Trouble*, explores the compassionate and altruistic aims of Big Sisters, along with their desire to control and impose. She maintains that the "maternal justice" practiced by the Big Sisters "signified a desire to protect younger women from domestic abuse and violence; moreover, they became advocates for girls whose options were curtailed by economic deprivation and lack of basic educational opportunities."[83]At the same time, she describes the Big Sisters as intent on remaking working-class girls and women in their own middle-class image, "pressing them into a moral and domestic mould that had little relation to, or understanding of, the economic inequality, social marginalization, life experiences, and different cultures of the poor and

[80]Ibid.
[81]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 35.
[82]Ibid., 24-25.
[83]Ibid., 67.

working-class."[84] Their notions of protection also resulted in unjustified incarceration, stigmatization, and marginalization. Reformers are not portrayed as villains or heroes, but as well-intended and often sympathetic individuals "trapped within the definitions of the experts and beholden to the ideological suppositions of the juvenile courts and Juvenile Delinquents Act."[85] There were also successes: "[the] reform efforts of volunteers to halt the pre-delinquent in her tracks, as well as of state-monitored probation, reveals the goals, successes, and limitations of the immense reform, medical and social work apparatus surrounding the JDA (Juvenile Delinquents Act)."[86]

In *Caught*, Myers also offers a nuanced understanding of reformers and other individuals involved in the juvenile justice system. She provides a balanced analysis of reformers' aims and motivations by highlighting their complexities and contradictions. The ethic of child rescue, for example, is described as a "contradictory combination of care/control and protection/punishment."[87]She also takes the religious motivations of reformers seriously. In her examination of The Soeurs du Bon Pasteur, she explains that they were motivated by Catholic faith and a conservative social ideology. Their ultimate aim, she states, was "to redeem the lost souls of wayward girls and fallen women."[88]

The historiography of female sexual "deviance" needs to continue to complicate dominant understandings of evangelical reformers. This can begin by exploring their religious motivations and taking their religiosity seriously. Robert Orsi speaks to this issue as follows:

> When religious historians examine religion within the framework of politics, civil society, and social ethics, there is no question of their historical seriousness. But problems arise when religious historians are drawn instead to study religious experiences in the past, in particular human beings' encounter with special others (gods, spirits, ancestors, the souls of the dead, and so on), which is what religion mostly is, who are taken as really present, and the practices that follow from these encounters, especially if these historians not only refuse to subordinate such experiences to the explanatory frameworks of the social (including the discourses of modern psychological pathology), but actually treat them as primary, generative, and creative.[89]

---

[84]Joan Sangster, *Girl Trouble: Female Delinquency in English Canada* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2002), 66.
[85]Ibid., 42.
[86]Ibid.,6-7.
[87]Myers, *Caught*, 21.
[88]Ibid, 43.
[89]Robert A. Orsi, "Untitled," in *Proceedings: First Biennial Conference on Religion and American Culture*, eds. Philip Goff and Rebecca Vasko, 16-18 (Indianapolis: The Center for the Study of Religion and American Culture: Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis, 2009), 16.

He provides one relevant example that focuses on religion and social services:

> What matters historically about an African American Pentecostal social activist in the South Bronx in the mid-1960s, for instance, is not his or her involvement with neighborhood improvement efforts but his relationship with Jesus, who is present to him in the circumstances of his everyday life, and how this bond leads him to neighborhood activism and gives his political activities their distinctive cast. This man's public career is not social work under another name; it is social work in Jesus' name and in Jesus' company.[90]

In order to understand evangelical reformers, one must understand "imaginary beings as having historical life and agency of their own, which does not entail ignoring questions of social power but understanding how these figures are implicated within, but also cause trouble for, arrangements of power."[91] This means that the religious motivations of actors cannot be understood as simply social motivations (such as moral regulation or social advancement). One must understand that spiritual beings truly existed in the minds of these individuals and impacted their actions. By incorporating this theoretical framework, this thesis hopes to complicate dominant understandings of evangelical reformers and highlight that they were not simply motivated by a desire to morally regulate working-class women, as many historians suggest, but were motivated by the belief that they were working for God.

The historiography of female sexual "deviance" also portrays female "deviants" as one-dimensional. In Ruth Alexander's *The 'Girl Problem'*, Carolyn Strange's *Toronto's Girl Problem*, and Mariana Valverde's *The Age of Light*, sex workers are depicted as a homogenous group that share the same experiences and attitudes. Ruth Rosen portrays sex workers as viewing sex work in the similar light. For example, she maintains that, "[t]o those who lived in the red-light district or practiced prostitution, in contrast [to reformers' ideas of sex work], prostitution was neither a symbol of social disorder nor a symbol of female economic and sexual exploitation...Rather, it was simply a form of work."[92]

In addition to being depicted as homogenous, female "deviants" are described as dehumanized "others" - faceless and nonhuman. This is done by presenting them as different from "normal" people, or failing to present them as people at all. In much of the literature, sex workers are defined solely by what

---

[90]Ibid., 17.
[91]Ibid.
[92]Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood*, xiv.

they do in order to support themselves; they are not given names; they are not presented as students, mothers, sisters, artists, as having talents, or as having personalities. Rosen speaks of "[t]he world of the prostitute," as if sex workers are socially, geographically or psychologically separate from non-sex workers.[93]

Scholars tend to unintentionally dehumanize sex workers by relying heavily on discourse analysis. In *The Age of Light, Soap and Water*, Valverde treats sex work as a symbol and hence, she does not attempt to understand the lives, experiences, or understandings of sex workers as real people. Strange's *Toronto's Girl Problem* also perpetuates a dehumanized view of sex workers by not attempting to understand the realities of sex work or lived experiences of sex workers. Sociologist Robert Weitzer argues that academics tend to slot sex work and sex workers into three paradigms: the empowerment paradigm, the oppression paradigm, and the polymorphous paradigm. The empowerment paradigm "highlights the ways in which sexual services qualify as work, involve human agency, and may be potentially validating or empowering for workers."[94] He further explains that this paradigm "holds that there is nothing inherent in sex work that would prevent it from being organized for mutual gain to all parties – just as in other economic transactions."[95] Several historians adhere to this conceptualization of sex work and present sex workers as liberalized, revolutionary women actively fighting the patriarchal system.

In Alexander's *The 'Girl Problem'*, female "deviants" are all presented as actively engaging in sexual activity in protest against societal norms. She does a great job of humanizing sex workers and other "deviants" by offering case studies and giving sex workers names and stories. However, she goes too far in trying to demonstrate that they had agency and almost glorifies all female "deviants" as revolutionaries. Nellie Roberts is described as "a young woman of working-class origins, [who] was an

---

[93]Ibid.
[94]Ronald John Weitzer, *Legalizing Prostitution: From Illicit Vice to Lawful Business* (New York: New York University Press, 2012), 7.
[95]Ibid.

active participant in the nation's emerging urban youth culture."[96] "Through lively use of America's streets and consumer commodities and bold exploration of heterosexuality," Alexander goes on to suggest that, "she and her peers were reinventing female adolescence, rejecting Victorian standards of girlhood virtue to lay claim to sexual desire, erotic expression, and social autonomy."[97] This assertion is a problematic, in that Alexander assumes that all females "deviants" had the same goals and attitudes.

The second paradigm, the oppression paradigm, is described by Weitzer as "grounded in a particular branch of feminist thinking, radical feminism, and differs from the religious right's objections to commercial sex, which centers on the threat it poses to marriage, the family, and society's moral fiber."[98] He explains that the oppression paradigm "holds that sex work is the quintessential expression of patriarchal gender relations and male domination. Indeed, the very existence of prostitution rests on structural inequalities between men and women: women would not sell sex if they had the same socioeconomic opportunities as men. But prostitution is not only rooted in inequality; it also *perpetuates* inequality both symbolically and instrumentally."[99]

Historians writing about female sexual "deviance" adhere to this paradigm, although perhaps more unintentionally since this paradigm is less popular among feminist historians. One such scholar is Ruth Rosen. Rosen is one of the few scholars who clearly outlines her conceptualization of sex work in the introduction to her book. She writes that, "I regard prostitution neither as the worst form of exploitation women have ever suffered, nor as a noble or liberating occupation, but rather as a dangerous and degrading occupation that, given the limited and unattractive alternatives, has enabled thousands of women to escape even worse danger and deprivation."[100] Not surprisingly, then, her book gives little credence to the possibility that sex workers may have found their experience rewarding or fulfilling.

The polymorphous paradigm presents the notion that both the oppression and empowerment paradigms are one-dimensional and essentialist. Weitzer explains that, while "exploitation and

---

[96]Alexander, The Girl Problem, 12.
[97]Ibid.
[98]Weitzer, *Legalizing Prostitution*, 10.
[99]Ibid.
[100]Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood*, xvii.

empowerment are certainly present in sex work, there is sufficient variation across time, place, and sector to demonstrate that sex work cannot be reduced to one or the other."[101] What he terms the polymorphous paradigm "identifies a constellation of occupational arrangements, power relations, and participants' experiences. Unlike the other two perspectives, polymorphism is sensitive to complexities and to the structural conditions shaping sex work along a continuum of agency and subordination."[102]

This conceptual approach is largely absent in the majority of historical works on female sexual "deviance." It is only recently that this understanding of sex work or female sexual "deviance" more generally, has begun to appear. In *Their Sisters' Keepers*, Hill emphasizes her desire to "avoid talking about these women in any particular category, but to see them as the immensely varied group of human beings they were, drawn together by the way they earned money, whether as a temporary expedient or a long-range commitment."[103] In *Girl Trouble*, Sangster argues that girls had neither full control over their sexual options nor no control. Instead, "the girls' own stories reveal a mix of bravado, curiosity, desperation, and confusion."[104] However, perhaps the best example of presenting a polymorphous understanding of sex work is Myers' *Caught*. In the introduction, Myers makes clear that modern girls "were not a homogenous group, though their stories generally substantiated and reverberated anxieties about gender, adolescence, and the autonomy of modern girls in urban life."[105] Throughout the book, Myers continues to highlight the diversity of modern girls' experiences, while also finding commonalities among them.

The historiography of female sexual "deviance" needs more scholars to step away from one-dimensional understandings of sex work and to embrace a polymorphous understanding. Along with understanding the complexities of sex work, scholars need to stop using the terms "prostitution" and "prostitute" which commonly appear, and replace them with "sex work" and "sex workers" respectively.

---

[101]Weitzer, *Legalizing Prostitution,* 10.
[102]Ibid.
[103]Marilynn Wood Hill, *Their Sisters' Keepers: Prostitution in New York City, 1830-1870* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 1.
[104]Sangster, *Girl Trouble,*84.
[105]Myers, *Caught,* 8.

The term "prostitute" is defined by the Oxford English Dictionary as a "woman who engages in sexual activity in return for payment, esp. as a means of livelihood; (formerly also) any promiscuous woman, a harlot" and "Debased or debasing; corrupt, meretricious; seeking personal gain or advantage by immoral or dishonourable means; (as past participle) prostituted."[106] The term is problematic for several reasons; most obviously, the second part of the definition implies that "prostitutes" are doing something wrong. The term "sex work" was coined in 1978 by activist and sex worker Carol Leigh at a workshop she attended in the United States. Leigh explains why she coined the term "sex work":

> As I entered I saw a newsprint pad with the title of the workshop. It included the phrase 'Sex Use Industry.' The words stuck out and embarrassed me. How could I sit amid other women as a political equal when I was being objectified like that, described only as something used, obscuring my role as an actor and agent in this transaction?[107]

Leigh explains that it is crucial "to create a discourse about sex trade that could be inclusive of women working in the trades."[108] The online Oxford English Dictionary defines "sex worker" as "*n.* a person who works in the sex industry, *esp.* a prostitute (usually used with the intention of reducing negative connotations and of aligning the sex industry with conventional service industries)."[109] This term is clearly preferable to "prostitute" as it was coined by sex workers and is devoid of negative connotations.[110]

More social history also needs to be incorporated into histories of female sexual "deviance" so that sex workers are humanized. The majority of works on female sexual "deviants" offer only a cultural history, forgoing any attempt at understanding the experiences of the "deviants" themselves. There is nothing wrong with offering a cultural history, but when the literature is sorely lacking in social history

---

106"prostitute," Oxford English Dictionary, http://www.oed.com/search?searchType=dictionary&q=prostitute &_searchBtn=Search (accessed 18 February 2014).

107Carol Leigh, Unrepentant Whore: Collected Works of Scarlot Harlot (San Francisco: Last Gasp, 2004), 69.

108Ibid.

109"sex work," Oxford English Dictionary, http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/176989?redirectedFrom=sex+work#eid23490098 (accessed 18 February 2012).

110Even the most recent works of Joan Sangster, Tamara Myers, Lori Chambers and Elizabeth Alice Clement use the terms "prostitute" and "prostitution." Clement uses the term "sex work" and presents prostitution as a type of sex work, along with "courting" and "treating" as other types of sex work. Such analyses are steps in the right direction, but continue to be problematic.

on the topic, the result is that female sexual "deviants" are presented solely as objects of study and not as human with agency.

A handful of historians have successfully explored the diversity of "deviant" women's experiences using a social historical approach. Hill draws on personal letters and newspaper articles to examine the lives of sex workers, such as Helen Jewett, Mary Berry, Rosina Townsend, and Adeline Miller, among others. Alexander uses reformatory records in order to bring to life the experiences of several inmates, including Deborah Herman and Sophie Polentz. Sangster relies on case files produced by Ontario training schools, courts, and reform groups in order to shed light on the experiences of girls within the juvenile justice system, including Jane, Yvette, Kathleen Boyle and Rona.[111] Myers draws on official court documents along with more than one thousand juvenile case files concerning delinquent girls in order to illuminate the experiences of "modern girls," like Anne-Marie B., caught in the juvenile justice system. Myers argues that the "seemingly mundane details about their daily lives," are of "critical importance to the histories of adolescence and delinquency."[112] Chambers examines case files throughout her work to illustrate, "on a more personal level, what it was like to be unmarried, pregnant and in need of the assistance of the state."[113] In this thesis, I aim to take a similar approach by offering case studies of female sexual "deviants," even though there are no official case file records produced in Canadian Salvation Army homes.

Patricia Cline Cohen's *The Murder of Helen Jewett: The Life and Death of a Prostitute in Nineteenth- Century New York*, takes a different approach, by exploring the experience of a single sex worker, Helen Jewett, in great detail. The work is set up as a narrative about the life of Helen, focusing on her murder at the age of twenty-three and the subsequent trial of a man who was accused of the crime. The work provides incredible detail on New York's sex trade, including information on the daily life of

[111]Sangster, *Girl Trouble,* 79-97.
[112]Myers, *Caught,*11.
[113]Chambers, *Misconceptions,* 9.

white, female sex workers, including the safety hazards of the brothels they lived and worked in."[114] Overall, Cohen demonstrates ingenious detective work and thoughtful analysis in her humanizing and enjoyable narrative.

Within all four historiographies, authors have made significant advancements by complicating static understandings of the Canadian Salvation Army, sex workers, and evangelical reformers, as well as problematizing binary understandings of religion and science. I will build upon these works by nuancing the experiences of sex workers in both rescue homes, and more broadly within their trade; by complicating one-dimensional understandings of Salvationist reformers as seeking to morally regulate working-class women; and by showing how the ideologies of religion and science overlapped in evangelical publications and organizations.

Sources

In undertaking this study, I draw on a broad spectrum of primary sources, which include Canadian Salvation Army reports, letters, manuscripts, and newspaper articles produced in the period between 1884 and 1940, as well as secular social work reports and journal articles published between 1918 and 1948. A key source is *The War Cry*, the official organ of the Canadian Salvation Army established in November of 1884 and digitized online by the Canadian Salvation Army Archives. *The War Cry* was a tool designed to promote the organization's ideology and work. Despite its propagandistic character, the newspaper is useful for gaining an understanding of the Army's attitudes toward female sexual "deviants" and details about the services it provided. I also draw on other Salvation Army publications, such as progress reports, annual reports, and publications designed to garner financial support for the organization's social services, all of which are housed in the Canadian Salvation Army Archives in Scarborough, Ontario and cover the period from 1884 to 1940. Like *The War Cry*, these publications reflect the evangelical biases of the organization, but they also give us a sense of the mindset

[114]Patricia Cline Cohen, *The Murder of Helen Jewett: The Life and Death of a Prostitute in Nineteenth-Century New York* (New York: Vintage Books, 1998), 77.

of Salvationists, especially in regard to why they thought women became sex workers and how they could be reclaimed.

The War Cry, along with these other Salvationist sources, also offer glimpses into the experiences of female inmates of rescue homes. Between 1886 and 1900, the Army occasionally published letters received from former inmates, which were used for propaganda purposes. These letters need to be approached with caution. It is possible that these letters were filtered or partly reconstructed by the Army. Even if they remained untouched, the young women may have written positively about their experiences as inmates in order to achieve certain goals, such as obtaining gifts from the organization or in an effort to be left alone. That said, these sources are valuable as they constitute the only sources written by inmates that describe their experiences. In discussing the use of legal case files, Karen Dubinsky points out that, while it is easy to dismiss such sources as only reflecting the perspectives of those who sought to regulate the lives of young women, they also have the potential to provide details about the attitudes and lives of girls and women who have left few other records.[115] The same holds true for the inmates' letters.

In order to gain an understanding of Salvationist attitudes during the second stage of their social service provision for unmarried mothers, from 1910 to 1940, I draw on a limited number of available reports from maternity homes and hospitals, as well as biographies of Salvation Army Rescue Officers. The Canadian Salvation Army Archives is a fairly recent creation, and until the 1980s, many documents were simply stored in Army Officers' garages, resulting in damage and loss. Some of the historical sources that survived and are housed in the Scarborough Archives include a staff handbook from a maternity home, a progress report on the Army's hospital work, and a biography of Blanche Read Johnston, a leader in early rescue work – all of which reflect the evangelical perspectives of the organization.

In an effort to investigate the attitudes of and services provided by secular social workers, I researched reports and journal articles written between 1900 and 1940. These include Helen

[115]Karen Dubinsky, "Afterward: Telling Stories about Dead People," in Franca Iacovetta and Wendy Mitchinson, eds., *On The Case: Explorations in Social History* (Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1999), 364.

MacMurchy's reports on "feeblemindedness" in Ontario produced between 1907 and 1912, and articles published in two journals, *Social Welfare* and *The Social Worker*, in the period between 1918 and 1948. Not unlike the materials produced by the Salvation Army, these publications were used by secular social workers to promote their scientific and secular agendas and offered statistics on unmarried motherhood just as flawed as those cited by the Salvation Army. At the same time, these sources are very valuable for gaining an understanding of social workers' perspectives on female sexual "deviants."For this purpose, these sources are extremely rich.

Author's Bias

Along with primary source biases, the personal biases of the author should also be highlighted. I approach the topic of female sexual "deviance" not only from an academic perspective, but also from a personal perspective. As a child I engaged in sexual barter; from the ages of ten to twelve, I occasionally offered oral sex in return for narcotics. I do not consider myself a former sex worker since what I engaged in was not legitimate work (I was a child and did it solely for recreational purposes), but I definitely feel an affinity with sex workers. These personal experiences have shaped my conceptual understanding of sex work as a complex industry of diverse labourers with a vast array of experiences. They have also driven my desire to study the history of female sexual "deviance," partly as a quest to find context for my personal experiences and as a form of activism in which I can delegitimize popular discourses on female sexual "deviance." Studying this topic is also an assertion that the history of sex work is important, and that the injustices of the past toward sex workers should not simply be ignored.

I also approach the history of social work and institutional reformatories from a personal perspective. From the ages of ten to eighteen, I was in and out of the social service sector/ mental health care system. I was involuntarily admitted to a psychiatric ward for the first time at the age of ten when I swallowed a bottle of Tylenol as a cry for help. I was locked up in the adult psychiatric ward of McMaster Hospital for two weeks, during which time I was introduced to the serious shortcomings and injustices of the mental health care system. From the ages of fifteen to seventeen, I was involuntarily admitted to

eating disorder wards for anorexia seven times, each stay averaging two months. During these admissions I had my human rights denied repeatedly, often in an illegal manner. When, at the age of sixteen, a psychiatrist deemed me incapable to make my own decisions, I fought the assertion in court and won. I did not fight the daily verbal and occasional sexual abuse and humiliation in court and this has gone unchallenged. While I am very critical of social work discourses and the mental health care system, I also acknowledge that there are most certainly compassionate and caring individuals within the system who are trying the best they can to help others.

I hope that my personal experiences can offer new perspectives from which to view and understand both the history of female sexual "deviance" and of social work. It is my aim to demonstrate that sex workers are not, nor have they ever been, one-dimensional victims or sexually-liberated heroes, but complex human beings like everyone else who deal with their struggles in the best way they feel is possible, or in the only way they feel they can. I also hope that by better understanding the history of social work ideology, scholars will recognize that many of the foundational elements of the field are harmful and dehumanizing and perhaps this awareness could help make changes to the system. While I certainly feel an affinity with the girls and women who were objects of the Canadian Salvation Army's reform efforts over a century ago, I am also careful to remember the historical differences that separate our experiences. While this is in many ways a personal project for me, I strive to present a professional and historically accurate analysis.

Chapter 2: The Canadian Salvation Army and Sex Workers, 1884-1910

"… religion can revisit them with hope, transform them in character, furnish them with friends, and save them."[1]

In 1884, the Salvation Army officially arrived in the Dominion of Canada to save the souls of the "fallen." From 1886 to 1911, it established one of the country's most expansive chains of rescue homes for "fallen women" operating from British Columbia to Newfoundland. The first rescue home in Canada was opened in 1886 in Toronto, and the last in 1911 in Lethbridge, Alberta. This stage of the Army's work focused on redeeming sex workers through a home-like atmosphere based on an understanding of sex workers as victims and sinners. After 1911, as discussed in the next chapter, the Canadian Salvation Army began to incorporate new social work discourses from the United States and altered its understanding of female sexual "deviants." In this latter period, the organization concentrated its energies on reclaiming unmarried mothers through a system of hospitals.

Salvation Army Rescue Officers

In the late nineteenth century, dozens of women in Canada devoted their time and energy to saving "fallen women" through the services provided by the Canadian Salvation Army. Who were these women? What led them to such work? Where did they come from? What was their race, class, educational background, etc.? Very little research has been completed on the history of Rescue Officers in the Canadian Salvation Army, or even on women more generally in the Canadian Salvation Army during this time period. Lynne Marks is the only historian who has explored the topic in any depth. In *Revivals and Roller Rinks*, Marks explains that within the Army, women could simply be members(called soldiers) or Officers (who were recruited from soldiers)and were "expected to dedicate their entire lives to the salvation of others." The majority of female Salvationists, both soldiers and Officers, were young, working-class women. They tended to come from small towns with populations of less than five thousand

[1]"The General Reviews the Social Operations of the Salvation Army in the Royal Albert Hall." *The War Cry*, 19 June 1909, 9.

and the vast majority were unmarried and previously employed. Most had worked in traditional working-class female occupations as clerks, nurses, teachers, dressmakers, and servants. In the early years of the Canadian Salvation Army, the female members were primarily English immigrants, but later on most were likely Canadian-born. The majority of female Officers were relatively young in age, with twelve per cent less than eighteen when they became Officers, and almost 80 per cent less than twenty-five when they began their Army careers.[2]

For many women, the decision to join the Salvation Army led to disapproval from their families. Marks uses autobiographies published in *The War Cry* to show that female Officers who entered the Army were often pressured to leave home or were disowned by parents. Marks explains that some parents' opposition was based on a rejection of Salvation Army theology, while for others, the lifestyle of Salvationists was not considered respectable. Lieutenant Nancy Maxwell, for example, was regarded by her mother as "nothing better than a street singer" for choosing to become a Salvation Army Officer. The life of a female Salvation Army Officer did indeed challenge traditional gender roles as the notion of female clergy was not widely accepted and more than half of all Salvation Army Officers in the 1880s were women, a "striking contrast to all other Canadian denominations." Female soldiers in the Army also defied gender norms by playing active public roles, selling copies of *The War Cry* door to door and speaking publically at meetings. But female soldiers were also expected to abide by certain conventions such as practicing benevolence and chastity until marriage. In some ways, then, the Army appealed to traditional female roles through its use of familial rhetoric, but "in a variety of other ways it either required or provided the space for female soldiers to behave in a manner that ran counter to the conventional female roles of docility, passivity, and domesticity."[3]

So why would a woman choose to join the Canadian Salvation Army as an Officer? Aside from the religious motivations, Marks suggests that women were drawn to the Army to escape parental supervision. Joining the organization, she explains, enabled young women to access more autonomy or

---

[2]Lynne Marks, *Revivals and Roller Rinks: Religion, Leisure, and Identity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Small-Town Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 177-179, 255.
[3]Ibid., 169-173.

could justify leaving an oppressive household. Becoming an Officer or soldier also allowed young women to gain access to public roles. Marks maintains that, while "the circus or theatre may have given a small number of working-class access to the public stage, there were certainly few opportunities for working-class women to play as active and powerful a public role as that available through the Salvation Army." Women were also motivated by a desire for companionship or financial security. Marks points out that the Salvation Army Training Home for Women "provided an opportunity for young working-class women to live, work, and study together, at least briefly, in a manner that was generally only available to middle-class women who attended boarding school or university." The Army also offered stable and dependable wages. Although Army wages were not high for single women, as they earned only five dollars a week, they were at least equal to those they might earn in other employment. Marks states that if a woman was facing "the choice between drudgery in a factory or someone else's kitchen or the life of a Salvation Army officer – with its sense of high spiritual calling, relative freedom, and male and female companionship – it is not surprising that many young women chose to become officers."[4]

Between 1886 and 1911, very few female Officers in the Canadian Salvation Army were involved in rescue work. Marks claims that the Army had great difficulty in attracting women to rescue work posts. Half of the women who were posted to rescue work left the Army immediately after their posting had finished. Marks argues that this could imply a rejection of or indifference to middle-class norms of femininity among Army Officers, since rescue work fit contemporary ideals of womanhood more closely than preaching before crowds did. She also suggests that, "the reluctance to enter social service work reflected not just an unwillingness to give up preaching, but a refusal to work with 'fallen' women and female alcoholics." "Neither self-denying religious commitment nor sisterhood," she explains, "could overcome both a distaste for the 'fallen' and the fear of moral contagion instilled by the mores of the dominant culture."[5] Marks' analysis of why Salvationists were reluctant to partake in rescue work is supported by what little has been written by Canadian Salvation Army Rescue Officers about

[4]Ibid., 172, 182-183.
[5]Ibid., 185-6.

their experiences. Mrs. Read, a Salvation Army Officer from the late nineteenth to early twentieth century who would later lead Canada's female rescue work, initially declined to work in the field when first asked in 1886. A 1919 biography of Mrs. Read states that she wrote that a Staff-Captain from England who came to Canada in order to commence work with "fallen women," frequently met with her and urged her to join the field. "I was filled with admiration for her and for the sacrifices she was making," Read explained, "but I shrank from the connection, the environment, and I did not consent. My parents also objected very strongly."[6] Mrs. Read also described the state of the rescue work at that time as "surrounded by difficulties."[7] All the workers were inexperienced and there was "much prejudice against the class who were to be benefitted."[8]

So what motivated the few female Salvationists who did devote their lives to saving "fallen women"? For Mrs. Read, it was initially pressure from Mrs. Coombs that got her into the field, but why she chose to continue is not known. An article from *Sins Chains*, a booklet published by the Canadian Salvation Army on their social services for women, titled "Why I Became a Rescue Officer," offers some insight into what attracted women to the work and kept them in the field. In the article, Ensign Mrs. Jordan explained her reasons for joining the Canadian Salvation Army's rescue work. She indicated that she had "frequently visited the city of Montreal with an intense desire to help the poor and wretched,[and] I had always sought out the workers among this class and assisted in any way I could."[9] When she heard that the Army had established a rescue home in Montreal, she was eager to become a matron. She pointed out that, "It was a beautiful summer evening when I turned my steps towards 11 Plateau Street...All nature seemed to be praising God, but my heart was in sadness at the thought of again coming in contact with so many lives blighted through sin."[10] A lieutenant answered her knock at the door and "at my request took me down to the dining-room where some fifteen or twenty women and girls with the Officers were seated

---

[6]Mary Morgan Dean, *The Lady with the Other Lamp: The Story of Blanche Read Johnston* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1919), 61.
[7]Ibid., 62.
[8]Ibid.
[9]*Sin-Chains Riven, A Description of Women and Children's Social Work in Canada, North-West America and Newfoundland* (Toronto: The Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, 1896), 40.
[10]Ibid.

around the tea-table engaged in the devotional exercises which follow every meal in the Homes."[11] The inmates and Officers then read passages from the Bible and sang hymns. Mrs. Jordan went on to say that, "As we rose from our knees one of the Officers put her arm around the poor girl next to her and said: 'I'm a Rescue girl too.' 'No you're not,' was answered emphatically. 'Yes I am, I am saved from sin the same as you are,' came the reply. The poor girl's eyes filled with tears at this touching expression of sympathy, and I turned away as from (?) scene almost too scared to look upon."[12] Mrs. Jordan wrote, "I had before felt a Heavenly influence pervading the place, but now I felt really conscious of the presence of Him...You have here the answer to that question, 'Why am I a Rescue Officer?'"[13]

This article suggested that some Officers, such as Ensign Mrs. Jordan, became interested in rescue work out of a benevolent motivation to help others. Interestingly, this article also highlighted the fact that several Canadian Salvation Army rescue home workers were former inmates of the same institutions, who had reformed and become Salvationists. Their motivation was to assist others in the same way that they had been helped. There are several examples of former inmates becoming matrons of rescue homes discussed in *The War Cry* articles and other Salvation Army publications. For example, in an article included in *Fair Canada*, the Army explained that Sergeant Emma, a former rescue home inmate, now worked in a rescue home. The article stated that, "The Lord has done a great deal for Sergeant Emma. Once she was in the 'Way of Hell.' Now she is devoting her time to soothing those sins and sorrows she so well understands."[14]

The one factor that motivated all Salvation Army Rescue Officers was their dedication to "Red-hot Salvation." General Booth made it very clear in a speech at the Rescue Council in London in 1889, that only red-hot Salvationists could be Rescue Officers. He indicated that there "is a mistaken notion

---

[11]Ibid.
[12]Ibid., 41.
[13]Ibid.
[14]*Fair Canada's Dark Side ! Being s Description of the Canadian Rescue Work, and of The Children's Shelter; Containing also Startling Statistics and Accounts of Sights and Scenes as Witnessed by Our Rescue Officers* (Toronto: The Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, 1892), 27.

abroad that anybody will do for Rescue Work; that if a girl loves the poor women and can cry over them, that is sufficient. I need not say that this is all a delusion."[15] He went on to point out that,

> *It is essential for a Rescue Officer to be a Salvationist*. I have no doubt there are thousands of women in London among whom you have quite a reputation. They would like you to save them, but they are not prepared to become Salvationists; therefore they cannot be saved at all, for they must be damned if they cannot be persuaded to come out and be thorough out-and-out people. Jesus Christ said – 'Because thou art neither cold nor hot, I will spue thee out of my mouth.' There is a chance for holy people, and nobody else.[16]

Understanding the motivations of Salvation Army Rescue Officers requires an appreciation of their religious beliefs. As Robert Orsi explains, what matters when trying to understand a social activist from the past is their relationship with Jesus, as this bond motivated their involvement in activism. Therefore, when exploring any historical actor's motivations, religious experience is just as important as any other causal factor. By taking into account Salvationists' religiosity, this thesis will complicate dominant understandings of evangelical reformers by highlighting their religious motivations for engaging in work with "fallen women."

Salvation Army Theology

In order to take Salvation Army Officers' religious beliefs seriously, the basic theology of the denomination must be explored. In the mid-nineteenth century, William Booth of England moulded the theology of the future Salvation Army. William Booth was born in Nottingham, England in 1829 to a poor family. At the age of fifteen, he converted to Wesleyan Methodism and began a career preaching outdoors. He switched churches frequently in his early years, but this ended when he agreed to conduct services for a nondenominational group called the Home Mission Movement in Whitechapel in 1865. Booth took over the movement and renamed it the Christian Revival Association, later known as the Christian Mission, and still later the Salvation Army.[17] The Christian Revival Association consisted of a

---

[15]William Booth, "What Should A Rescue Officer Be?" *The Deliverer*, 1 July 1889, 7, Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives, Scarborough, ON.
[16]Ibid.
[17]Glen K. Horridge, *The Salvation Army: Origins and Early Days: 1865-1900* (Rochester: Ammonite Books, 1993), 12 -15.

small group of about 60 who were all like-minded evangelists.[18] They preached in order to convert individuals and offered poor relief. According to historian Glenn Horridge, Booth "believed in God, he believed in Satan; he believed in Heaven, he believed in Hell; he believed that Christ had died to save sinners, he believed that without conversion no sinner could be saved – and there his theology stopped."[19]

Between 1877 and 1879, Booth restructured the Christian Mission into the Salvation Army. He redefined the power structure of the organization, giving himself overall control and dispensing with "any pretence of democracy" by ending conferences, committees, discussions, and interviews.[20] The mission took on a military role and in September 1878, the mission's new name – The Salvation Army - became official when Booth put it in print.[21] He began referring to himself as the "General," and introduced ranks, brass bands, and volunteer-style uniforms. He also decided to expand internationally, to "bring America, Europe, even India and Africa, under his flag."[22]

Roger Green, a professor of theology, has written extensively about Salvation Army theology. He argues that "[o]ne word summarizes the theology of both William and Catherine Booth: redemption."[23] He maintains that the Salvation Army's redemptive theology included three interwoven elements: sanctification, the kingdom of God, and salvation. Booth believed in the Wesleyan doctrine of sanctification, which "taught that a person's redemption begins with justification by faith. From that moment, the believer begins to grow in God's grace until, by faith he or she is filled with perfect love and realizes...'that full divine conformity to all my Saviour's righteous will.' With this perfect love, the believer is freed from both the power of sin and the agony of constant sinning and is, thereby, both purified and empowered for the work of the kingdom."[24] Green further explains that Booth believed that sanctification, or full salvation, "was a second, definite work of grace in the believer, who could thereby be kept free from actual sin in his or her life (although there never would be an escape from the manifold

---

[18]Ibid., 21.
[19]Ibid.
[20]Ibid., 33.
[21]Norman H. Murdoch, *Origins of the Salvation Army* (Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1994), 104.
[22]Ibid., 111.
[23]Roger J. Green, "William Booth's Theology of Redemption," *Christian History* 26 (1990): 1.
[24]Ibid.

temptations, trials, suffering, and sorrows that are part of the fallen human condition)."[25]According to Green, William Booth saw sanctification as the "forefront of our doctrines."[26]

Booth's conception of the kingdom of God was also key to Salvationist redemptive theology. Green argues that the Booths' theology "included a concept of the kingdom of God, the final triumph over all evil."[27] In this sense, Booth believed that all sinners would be redeemed. Green explains that,

> The Booths were postmillennialists; they believed the Army would usher in a thousand-year reign of Christianity in this world, a perfect society, after which Christ would return. William had a more fertile imagination than Catherine about this coming kingdom. Nevertheless, as desirous as he was for the full realization of this kingdom on earth, he held that such a kingdom was primarily spiritual and could not be created and sustained by human effort apart from God. He knew that many people who made no claim to God or Christianity hoped for some sort of millennium and occasionally even sought to fulfill such longing. But social, educational, or political endeavours apart from God were useless to Booth. In his Darkest England Scheme of 1890, he clearly stated that he was under no delusion 'as to the possibility of inaugurating the Millennium by any social specific.'[28]

The third way in which Salvationist theology is redemptive relates to salvation. In 1889, William Booth wrote an article titled, "Salvation for Both Worlds," in which he argued that redemption meant "not only individual, personal, and spiritual salvation, but corporate, social and physical salvation as well."[29] Green maintains that, "just as the message of personal salvation was offered to all, so the new message of social salvation should be universally announced."[30] Booth wrote that, "As Christ came to call not saints but sinners to repentance, so the New Message of Temporal Salvation, of salvation from pinching poverty, from rags and misery, must be offered to all."[31]"William," Green argues, "was convinced of the theological justification for a doctrine of salvation that included both personal salvation and social salvation. With the writing of *In Darkest England and the Way Out* he committed his Army to a war on two fronts – the war for souls and the war for a rightly ordered society."[32] In order to convert souls, Booth had to save them socially first. Feeding and housing the poor, or helping alcoholics leave the bottle behind were all part of conversion – it was all part of the path to the kingdom of God.

---

[25]Ibid., 2.
[26]Ibid.
[27]Ibid.
[28]Ibid., 3.
[29]Ibid.
[30]Ibid.
[31]Ibid.
[32]Ibid., 4.

With this understanding of Salvation Army theology as redemptive, it is easier to comprehend why the Army wanted to "save" "fallen women" and how they envisioned accomplishing that goal. Their redemption first necessitated a social redemption, which required them to stop disobeying God's desire for them to be pure, including the need to end promiscuous lifestyles, leave the sex trade, or marry the father of their baby. This would be followed by a spiritual redemption, which involved the women's conversion to Christianity. These theological tenets shaped Salvationists' perceptions of "fallen women," which were based on three principles. These included that "fallen women" were: victims; sinners living shameful, ruined lives; and as capable and worthy of full redemption.

Understandings of "Fallen Women"

Salvation Army Rescue Officers believed that women did not voluntarily engage in sex outside of marriage or in sex work, but that they were manipulated and/or forced to do it. Who was to blame? The most common targets were "evil" men who seduced women and betrayed them. Other targets included parents, society's vanity, and bad wages, as well as racialized groups including Jews and the Chinese. In *Sisters of Sorrow*, a female Salvation Army Officer explained that, "Woman, so tender and frail, the most beautiful thing God created, is seldom – no! never, never to blame!"[33] The author noted that, when writing the book, someone suggested that the title of the chapter on rescue work should be "Sisters of Shame!" The author's response was that, "No, we thought, that is too hard a name, let us call them Sisters of Sorrow, for there is no suffering so keen as the sea of sorrow through which a fallen woman is forced to go. Her story might be written: Wooed, trusted, betrayed, forsaken, jeered, buffeted, and cast out, to be treated worse than a criminal."[34]

In 1888, the *Toronto Globe* published an interview with Mrs. Bailey, the matron of the Salvation Army rescue home for "fallen women" in Toronto. The interviewer asked, "What in your opinion, Mrs. Bailey, is the chief cause of the downfall of young girls? It is impossible to believe that it can be

[33]Incomplete photocopies from a book titled, *The Unknown Half*, of the chapter titled "Sisters of Sorrow." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON., 26.
[34]Ibid.

inclination on their part for such a life."[35] Mrs. Bailey explained that women did not end up as "fallen women" by choice, but were manipulated or forced into the life due to bad wages, the vanity of society, bad parenting, and evil (Italian) men. She was quoted as saying, "Inclination! Oh dear no, first of all, the wretched wages paid to women has much to do with it. How can girls earning only $2 or $3 a week, often the lesser sum, pay their way and remain honest?"[36] She continued by pointing out that, the "extravagance of dress well-to-do ladies exhibit is another cause of girls' ruin. They notice the dress of these ladies on the street and they think they can be no lady unless they also dress extravagantly. To get the money to do so, they yield to temptation."[37] "Parents sometimes ruin their own daughters," she further added, "We have had in this Rescue four girls who were seduced in the first place by their own fathers; we have one such case in the Rescue now."[38] Finally, Mrs. Bailey stated that, "some of the Italians in this city are a bad lot and have led many young girls astray. Keepers of houses of ill-fame also hold out inducements to young girls."[39] These same causes were reiterated by Mrs. Coombs, a leader of rescue work in Canada, when she was interviewed by *The War Cry* in 1907. In the interview, Mrs. Coombs indicated that the "main causes which bring girls to our Homes are lack of proper home training, undue love of finery and so-called freedom, and the machinations of bad men."[40] She also blamed bad parenting.

Of all the factors, the Salvation Army believed that "evil" men were the main cause of women "falling from grace." Story after story is told of "bad" men seducing innocent girls and then abandoning them, leaving them with sex work as their only option, or seducing them and then inducing them to solicit. In William Booth's *In Darkest England and the Way Out*, published in 1890, he stated that "beneath our very eyes, in our theatres, in our restaurants, and in many other places, unspeakable though it be but to name it, the same hideous abuse flourishes unchecked. A young penniless girl, if she be pretty, is often hunted from pillar to post by her employers, confronted always by the alternative – Starve or

[35]"A Refuge for Girls: The Noble Work Carried on by the Salvation Army," *The Globe*, Thursday 1 November 1888.
[36]Ibid.
[37]Ibid.
[38]Ibid.
[39]Ibid.
[40]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.

Sin."[41] In 1896, Booth wrote that the "bulk of the victims of this heartless arrangement are Young Girls, the majority still in their Teens, while many are mere Children with ages ranging from ten years upwards."[42] "These White Slaves of Lust," he continued, "are practically kept caged up, as it were like so many animals, for their condition and circumstances place them as truly beyond the possibility of escape, and as much compel their infamous mode of life, as though they were enclosed within prison walls, ready to be called forth at the bidding of the Monsters for whose unnatural amusement they only exist."[43]

Booth's understanding of sex workers as young victims of "bad" men seems to have been embraced by the majority of Salvation Army Rescue Officers in Canada. In 1892, the Canadian Salvation Army published *Fair Canada*, a booklet describing their rescue work. The publication's author explained that, "Pure and innocent girls, who have left other countries to seek a home here, have been entrapped, enslaved, and ruined, their betrayers leaving them to the mercy of a cold world."[44] In 1908, a *War Cry* article described a sex worker as a girl "not twenty years of age...induced by a designing scoundrel."[45] In 1909, an article told the story of a seventeen-year-old girl whose "youth was taken advantage of in the most heartless fashion by a man much older than herself."[46] The same article also described how two young girls had been "induced by two men to leave their homes in Hamilton. The men, after corrupting the girls, had induced them to go soliciting on the streets."[47]Many stories like these were distributed through Salvation Army publications that discussed their rescue work.

The Canadian Salvation Army also believed that there was a large, international sex trade in women. On 27 July 1907, *The War Cry* published an article titled, "White Slavery: Girls Decoyed from New York for Immoral Purposes, Rescued by the Salvation Army."[48] The story reported that, on "the arrival at Kingston, Jamaica, of one of the R.M. boats from New York recently, word was brought to

---

[41]William Booth, *In Darkest England and the Way Out* (London: International Headquarters of the Salvation Army, 1890), 22.
[42]"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit," *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.
[43]Ibid.
[44]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 3.
[45]"Police Court Work in Toronto," *The War Cry*, 19 December 1908, 3.
[46]"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 22.
[47]Ibid.
[48]"White Slavery: Girls Decoyed from New York for Immoral Purposes," *The War Cry*, 27 July 1907, 14.

Salvation Army Headquarters that a woman on board had several girls with her, whom it was suspected were being taken to [the colony] for immoral purposes."[49] "Early next morning," it continued, "Colonel Lindsay went aboard, saw the girls, ascertained the facts of the case and invited the girls to leave the woman, offering to intercede for them. Two of the five young women resolved to break away from their procuress, and were handed over to the care of Mrs. Lindsay."[50] The two girls then told their story to Salvation Army Officers. *The War Cry* explained that the girls had immigrated to America and were struggling to survive on low wages when they met "the temptress." The "temptress" told one girl that she wanted to adopt her as a daughter so she could accompany her around the world. The other girls were told they were being taken to a large cigar factory where they would earn good wages. *The War Cry* went on to report that, while on the boat, the girl who was supposedly adopted became suspicious and "became very wretched, and threatened to throw herself overboard. Travelers on board interested themselves in her, and quietly assured her that it would be all right when she got to Kingston, as the Salvation Army would help her."[51] The Canadian Salvation Army's concern about the existence of sex trafficking resulted in their close working relationship with W.T. Stead, an international leader in the fight against the so-called White Slave Trade.[52]

Another popular reason cited for why women entered the sex trade was the influence of racialized men, specifically the Chinese and Jews. In 1907, Mrs. Coombs claimed that, "As you know, there are numbers of Chinese in British Columbia, but so far as I can learn, the practice of Chinese forms of vice is not nearly so prevalent there [Canada] as in certain Australian cities. Still it is there, as we know by cases which have come under the care of our officers."[53] In an article on the white slave trade in *The War Cry*, the author was quick to highlight that the temptress was a Jew. The article stated that, "Then came the temptress (also a Jewess) posing as a rich lady, desiring to adopt a daughter to accompany her around the

[49]Ibid.
[50]Ibid.
[51]Ibid.
[52]Murdoch, *Origins of the Salvation Army*, 149-151.
[53]Ibid.

world. The young girl, ignorant and credulous, believed the story."[54] The fact that the article identified the temptress as a "Jewess" suggests that there was an imagined link, in the minds of Salvation Army Officers, between Jews and the sex trade. There is no proof to suggest that such a link existed in reality.

Along with trafficking, parents were also blamed by the Salvation Army for their daughters' "fall from grace." Mrs. Coombs stated in an interview in 1907that, "I read a very impressive article in a magazine a few days ago in which an American judge stated that nine-tenths of the girls who go wrong do so because of the carelessness of parents. I am inclined to agree with that view. Certainly I believe that the seeds of an impure, and perhaps vicious, life are sown in the years of say nine to twelve, and that parents, for various reasons, do little or nothing to counteract the vicious influences of the public streets and school playgrounds."[55] In *Sin Chains,* the Army shared the tale of Madge, a woman who "fell" into sex work. The first chapter described Madge's upbringing under a harsh and unfair mother. The story indicated that after "Madge's experience of a mother's injudicious training, 'twas little wonder she did not develop into a model mother and housekeeper herself."[56] The same publication included an article titled, "Her Mother's Curse," that stated that a young girl named Jessie was no stranger "to the evils and taste of liquor as her parents always had it on the table at meal-time, and the children's cups were filled as well as those of their parents."[57] Again, Jessie ended up as a sex worker because of bad parenting.

The Salvation Army also blamed capitalist society for inducing women to enter the sex trade. The privileged classes' love of finery was suggested as one cause. Salvationists argued that, if "those who 'can afford it' will do it, they are setting an example which if the poorer classes follow, (and it is natural for them to want to look as well as their superiors) they will have to adopt some dishonest means to raise the money to do it."[58] They explained that this "is only one of the many arguments that might be brought up to show the need of simplicity and temperance in dress."[59] The Salvation Army also blamed the low

---

[54]Ibid.
[55]"White Slavery: Girls Decoyed from New York for Immoral Purposes," *The War Cry*, 27 July 1907, 14.
[56]*Sin-Chains Riven*, 9.
[57]Ibid., 21.
[58]"Why Should We Dress Plain," *The War Cry*, 11 October 1890, 14.
[59]Ibid.

wages paid for women's work as a factor that drove women to engage in sex work in order to survive. In *Fair Canada*, the Army maintained that many "a poor girl finds her way to our Home simply because she has had no domestic training, consequently she is not competent to take a good situation or to command wages enough to keep herself clothed half decently."[60] In a *War Cry* article published in 1907, the Army told the story of "Jane" who was forced into sex work due to the low wages she earned doing factory work. The article explained that the "wages paid for work in the factory not being sufficient to keep her, Jane had supplemented them by the wages of shame."[61]

Along with an understanding of "fallen women" as victims, the Canadian Salvation Army understood them as sinners living shameful, ruined lives and hence, they were routinely described as such. In 1896, an Officer reflected that, "While I hate the sin, I love the sinner, and the lower down they get the more I seem to love them."[62] They were also characterized as unhappy, suffering, and pitiable creatures. In *The War Cry* articles "fallen women" were described as "wretched beings," "poor, fallen sisters," "girls who live abandoned lives," "unhappy creatures," and "the poor, unfortunate, diseased and fallen."[63] Their lives were continually depicted in pathetic terms. In a *War Cry* article from 1888, the author wrote that, "Perhaps someone who reads this will feel that they want to help to raise these dear girls out of degradation..."[64] In an article from 1907, the Army explained that some "of the girls who come to us from a life of shame are very hopeless creatures indeed, and call for all the tact and patience that human nature and divine grace are capable of putting forth."[65]In 1909, an article stated that "some 55, 000 poor girls have been permanently rescued from this deep, dark, abyss of misery and shame."[66] A *War Cry* article from 1887 described sex work as "a terrible under-current of unclean vice with all its

---

[60]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 8.
[61]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 19 January 1907, 3.
[62]"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit," *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.
[63]"Police Court Work in Toronto," *The War Cry*, 19 December 1908, 3.; "A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8.; "The Women's Social Work," *The War Cry*, 24 September 1910, 9.
[64]"Rescue Notes," *The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.
[65]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[66]"The General Reviews the Social Operations of the Salvation Army in the Royal Albert Hall," *The War Cry*, 19 June 1909, 9.

concomitant evils of ruined lives, desolated hearth-stones, prostituted bodies, decimated constitutions, and early dishonoured graves."[67]

No matter how low women had "fallen," however, the Salvation Army believed they could be fully reclaimed. A poem published in an 1887 edition of *The War Cry* highlighted the Army's belief in the reclamation of sex workers:

> Rescued from a life of shame!
> In our homes are gems and jewels saved from
> Such a fearful doom;
> When their sisters ask for shelter, must we
> Answer them, No room?[68]

This poem emphasized the fact that the Army believed sex workers were no different than children of God in terms of their potential, since sex workers could become "gems and jewels" in the eyes of Salvationists. The important point here is that there was no notion that sex workers were biologically or inherently different than other human beings. They were just as worthy of Christ as everyone else; all they needed was to find God and live by his rules. In 1909, a *War Cry* article explained that, "religion can revisit them with hope, transform them in character, furnish them with friends, and save them."[69]

The Army's belief that "fallen women" could be fully reclaimed was also demonstrated through the plethora of success stories shared in their publications. In a *War Cry* article from 1887, the Army stated that,

> Two girls from the States have been restored to friends, another at the solicitation of her parents was sought out, rescued and restored. Two who jointly kept a disreputable house, have been reclaimed, and are in respectable business. Three houses of ill-fame have been broken up, and the keepers are living respectably, and many others are now occupying decent situations and doing well, and some of them are Salvation Soldiers unmistakably converted to God.[70]

In 1886, the Canadian Salvation Army published *The Canadian Advance*, a record of their progress in the Dominion. It included a story about "E.W." who had "never known her parents, was reared in vice and

---

[67]"Our Rescue Home," *The War Cry*, 24 December 1887, 1.
[68]Ibid.
[69]"The General Reviews the Social Operations of the Salvation Army in the Royal Albert Hall." *The War Cry*, 19 June 1909, 9.
[70]"Our Rescue Home," *The War Cry*, 24 December 1887, 1.

earned a living on the stage of low theatres...became a hard drinker, and drifted to a life of shame."[71] One of the female Salvation Army Rescue Officers " found her upon the streets, cared for her, led her to Jesus, and for nearly a year she has led an exemplary life, a living witness in word and life to the power of the precious blood to cleanse and keep."[72] As Green's interpretation of Salvationist theology suggests, the Salvation Army truly believed that all sinners could be redeemed, and this redemption was the mission of Canadian Salvation Army Rescue Officers.

Services for "Fallen Women"

Rescue work with "fallen women" began in Canada in 1886 when Mrs. Jones, a Salvation Army Officer from England, travelled to Canada to set up its first rescue home. Mrs. Jones came to Canada with Rebecca Jarrett, a former procuress of sex workers in England who had been manipulated by Bramwell Booth and became famous in the Stead trial over the age of consent and white slavery. Jones and Jarrett bought a home on Wilton Avenue in Toronto which they converted into a rescue home.[73] An article from the *Toronto Globe* in 1888 described the home as "an unpretentious looking low wooden cottage, having attached to it in the rear a tall plain building of brick and stone."[74] The article went on to describe the inside of the home:

> In the first place, everything about the place is scrupulously clean and bright. The floors, the walls, the windows, the tables and the dressers in the kitchen, the bedrooms, everything is as white as wood can be made. And then there are pretty curtains to the windows and bright looking flowers in pots on the tables, pictures are not wanting and the whole place has a bright, happy, cheerful look that to many of the inmates must be a glorious change to what they have been accustomed. Downstairs in the basement is a large dining room and the kitchen.[75]

The article explained that the bedrooms for the inmates were upstairs and that each girl "has a room to herself and in each room there is a wash-stand, basin and water jug, looking glass and table...The

---

[71]*The Canadian Advance Being a Record of Progress of Work of the Salvation Army in the Dominion of Canada During the Year 1886* (Toronto: Commissioner Headquarters Salvation Temple, 1887), 79.
[72]Ibid.
[73]In 1885, Stead wrote a series of articles under the title, "The Maiden Tribute of Modern Babylon," in order to expose sex trafficking and to promote raising the age of consent from 13 to 16. As part of his exposé, he "purchased" a thirteen-year-old girl named Eliza Armstrong. Eliza was placed in a Salvation Army rescue home and the occurrence was deemed proof of the white slave trade in Stead's series. For this stunt, he was tried for abduction and imprisoned for three months.
[74]"A Refuge for Girls: The Noble Work Carried on by the Salvation Army," *The Globe*, Thursday 1 November1888.
[75]Ibid.

bedsteads are iron and the beds are covered with...coverlets."[76] "On the upper flat," there was "a large room nicely carpeted, containing a piano and easy chairs; books and flowers are on the table and on the walls there are pictures."[77] The matron's room was downstairs.

In 1888, the rescue home moved to a house on Richmond Street, a location that could house six girls.[78] The Army was looking for more volunteers and Officers to join the rescue work at this point. As noted above, one Salvation Army Officer, Mrs. Read, who would later lead Canada's rescue work for women, was asked by Mrs. Jones to join her in rescuing "fallen women," but Mrs. Read declined on the basis that her parents strongly objected and that she "shrank from the connection, the environment." Mrs. Read also indicated that the state of rescue work at that time was not encouraging. "The inception of the Canadian Rescue work was surrounded by difficulties," she explained. "There was much prejudice against the class who were to be benefitted. All the workers were inexperienced."[79]

After running the Toronto rescue home for only a short time, Mrs. Jones learned that Jarrett was using the home to procure sex workers instead of reforming them. Mrs. Jones gave up on the rescue home and went back to England. A Canadian Salvation Officer named Mrs. Glover then took over running the home. Around this time, a Salvation Army Officer named Mrs. Coombs became involved in the rescue work of "fallen women" in Canada. She was the wife of the Commissioner in Canada, Mr. Thomas Coombs. Mrs. Coombs asked Mrs. Read to temporarily help with the women's rescue work and this time she agreed. "I shrank from it unspeakably, but I felt I could not refuse," she explained.[80] Mrs. Read and Mrs. Coombs became the main initiators in the establishment of rescue homes for "fallen women" across Canada from 1886 to 1911.

Mrs. Read was a young woman when she became involved in the field of women's rescue work. A biographer explained that Mrs. Read had to endure teasing about her age and described an incident that occurred at a leading Society meeting on rescuing "fallen women" in Ottawa:

---

[76]Ibid.
[77]Ibid.
[78]Dean, *The Lady with the Other Lamp*, 62.
[79]Ibid.
[80]Ibid., 63.

> As Mrs. Read entered the room, the audience burst into a buzz of comments, and she felt many inquisitive glances directed towards her. She instinctively divined the purport of their remarks. She sent for a young girl that she knew at the back of the room to enquire if she was correct in her surmises. The girl answered, 'They are all saying you are too young to know anything about the work.' When she rose to speak she commenced by saying, 'Ladies; I am aware that you are much amused at my youthful audacity in venturing to speak to you on such grave subjects, but before I have finished, I think you will see I have had practical experience.'[81]

Despite her young age, Mrs. Read quickly climbed the ranks in Canada's rescue field and accomplished a great deal. In 1896, Mrs. Read opened rescue homes in Halifax and St. John's, and shortly after opened a new rescue home in Winnipeg. Later, she moved to Toronto and became the leader of the Salvation Army's Women's Social Work in Canada.[82] Still later, Mrs. Read opened new rescue homes in Montreal and St. John, New Brunswick. During this time, Mrs. Coombs was also opening homes throughout Canada. By 1911, there were thirteen rescue homes operating from British Columbia to Newfoundland. The dates when the rescue homes were established and their locations are listed in the table below:

Table 1: Salvation Army Rescue Home Locations and Years Built

Year	**City/Province**	**Original Address**
1886	Toronto, Ontario	Wilton Avenue
1890	Montreal, Quebec	11 Plateau St.
1890	Victoria, British Columbia	103 Vancouver St.[83]
1890	St. John, New Brunswick	103 Pitt St. (1900)
1890	Winnipeg, Manitoba	480 Ross St[84]
1894	Ottawa, Ontario	88 Salter St. (1900)
1895	Hamilton, Ontario	119 Wentworth street north[85]
1896	Halifax, Nova Scotia	14 Church St. (1900)
1896	London, Ontario	Clarence st/708 Dundas St. (1900)
1896	St. John's, Newfoundland	Boncloddy St. (1900)
1904	Vancouver, British Columbia	1334 Pender St. "Mercy Home"[86]
1904	Calgary, Alberta	211 11th Avenue East
1911	Lethbridge, Alberta	Unknown

[81]Ibid., 87.
[82]Ibid., 130.
[83]"Vancouver Island 1891 Census," *viHistory*, http://vihistory.ca/search/searchcensus.php?start=0&show=n&form=full&year=1891&familynumber=394&districtid=4&subdistrictid=c-3 (accessed 10 November 2013).
[84]Untitled Manuscript, Grace Index Binder, Grace Hospital Box, Salvation Army Archives, Scarborough, ON.
[85]Doris N. I. Boniface, Letter to Colonel Mabel H. Crolly, 20 October 1966, found randomly on shelf, Canadian Salvation Army Archives, Scarborough, ON., "The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1900," Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.
[86]"The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1904," Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

The layouts of the rescue homes were all fairly similar. The Army often purchased family houses in the hope that they would create a home-like rather than an institutional atmosphere. In the home, there was usually a kitchen, dining room, bathroom, bedrooms shared by inmates, bedrooms shared by staff, and a nursery for babies. There would also be a "sewing room" or "sitting room" in which inmates could relax. There was also often a room used for religious meetings. After the opening of the Ottawa rescue home in 1894, *The War Cry* described the interior of the building as follows:

> On entering the hall, on the left is a nice, bright room, for a play-room for the daytime, and a lecture-room for meetings in the evenings... The next room is the matron's room and office... In the hall, we come to the dining room, with two long tables – one for the children, with six pretty high chairs...the other table is for officers and girls...To the back of the house is a hall, bath-room, and a bright little sewing room...In the children's bed-room there are six pretty, pink, wire cots.[87]

In 1896, Mrs. Booth described the layout of the rescue home in Hamilton, Ontario. She wrote:

> The Home accommodates twelve girls and five children...It is quite a large house, and well adapted to our work. It has three flats, with thirteen rooms, besides a large basement, in which is a laundry, and large store and furnace rooms. On the first floor are the reception room, sewing and dining rooms, kitchen and pantry. On the second are the nursery, bath, office, and three dormitories; on the upper flat three dormitories and a store-room.[88]

Many homes had nurseries, and following 1897, they began to have maternity wings.[89] The maternity wing at this point was not much more than a nursery as well as a delivery room. In 1907, Mrs. Coombs explained the importance of the layout of the Home and how it helped the Army to achieve its goals of redemption:

> You know the Army holds the opinion – a view I share to the full – that most of us are creatures of our environment; that overcrowded and inconvenient homes produce slatternly wives; while convenient and roomy houses produce methodical, cleanly house-keepers. Thus in the buildings we select for our Rescue Homes we aim at three things, viz. ample accommodation for economical running of the institution; a house that shall be homelike and enable us to thoroughly train the inmates for duties as service-girls or housewives; and a situation that shall be elevating in character and quite distinct from the usual surroundings of the class we seek to benefit.[90]

All of the rescue homes across Canada shared a similar set of rules and a similar schedule. In 1896, Mrs. Booth published the schedule, and the rules and regulations of Salvation Army rescue homes. The schedule was as follows:

---

[87]Ibid.
[88]*Sin-Chains Riven*, 7.
[89]"Brief Summary of the Year's Work," *The War Cry*, 1897.
[90]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.

> Rise at 6 a.m.
> Breakfast at 7 a.m.
> Housework till 9:30 a.m.
> Prayers from 9:30 to 10 a.m.
> All hands in workroom at 10 a.m.
> First bell for dinner, 12:15 p.m.
> Dinner from 12:30 till 1 p.m.
>
> Open-air recess till 1:30 p.m.
> All hands in workroom, 1:30 p.m.
> First bell for supper, 5:15 p.m.
> Supper at 5:50 p.m.
> Night school or meeting, 6:30 p.m.
> Prayers from 8 to 8:30 p.m.
> Retire to bed, 8:30 p.m.[91]

The rules for the home were listed under the title, "Every Order must be Punctually Obeyed":

> Girls must be willing to do such work as the Officers appoint cheerfully.
> Girls must render willing obedience to their Officers.
> Girls must lay aside flowers, feathers, bangs and bustles while in the Home.
> Girls must be neat and clean in their person and habits.
> No tobacco must be brought into the Home, neither snuffing nor chewing.
> Girls must address their Officers respectfully, always using their titles.
> No allusion must be made to former life, neither bad language used.
> No talking allowed in bedrooms.
> No girl allowed to go to their bedroom during the daytime.
> Every girl is expected to stay six months.
> Girls infringing these rules are subject to dismissal[92]

These documents, published in 1896, make it clear that the rescue homes were highly structured and regulated. It is important to remember that different homes, under the command of different matrons, would have varied in terms of strictness and enforcement of rules. It is almost impossible to know how these rules and schedules functioned in reality. These documents do, however, offer a rough understanding of how the homes were run and managed.

How did women end up in a rescue home? It appears that some came of their own accord, others came on a remanded sentence from court in order to avoid serving prison time, and others were pressured by parents. It is not difficult to imagine why some women would willingly enter a Salvation Army rescue home: if a woman was pregnant out of wedlock, was poor, and had been disowned by parents; or if a woman was unhappily working as a sex worker and wanted help getting out of the trade. There are a

---

[91] *Sin-Chains Riven*, 44.
[92] Ibid.

plethora of imaginable circumstances in which a woman would seek shelter and support in a rescue home. A letter written in 1909 to Mrs. Coombs was published in *The War Cry* and offered an example illustrating why women would choose to enter a rescue home. The letter read as follows:

> If The Salvation Army cannot help me, I think I shall kill myself. I never could go to my friends again with this disgrace upon me. They have no idea of the trouble I am in. Oh, God, why did I not die when I was a child! The one who has wronged me is the son of the head of the firm. He has gone to Europe. I am eighteen. Mrs. Coombs, for the love of God help me. Let me come to one of our Homes.[93]

The Salvation Army did not simply wait for "fallen women" to come to their rescue homes, however, but actively sought out women from brothels, bars, prisons, and the street. In 1887, an article published in *The War Cry* indicated that Army Officers visited brothels in order to persuade both madams and inmates to come to their rescue home and reclaim themselves. The article explained that a "poor fallen girl, now in heaven, found her way to the penitent form at the Temple, and was sent to be cared for by Capt. Jones, and this broke the ice; the house in which she had been an inmate was visited, after a terrible struggle was broken up, more girls came to the Homes, and with them more information, and soon the Home was filled. Access was gained to a number of houses, known and unknown, and the work of rescue went grandly and gloriously on."[94] This story suggests that Rescue Officers questioned women about the locations of brothels and then went to these brothels with the aim of inducing the inhabitants to their rescue home. The story also makes the Army sound much more successful than they actually were. The majority of *War Cry* articles on rescue work highlight the extreme difficulty Officers had in persuading women to leave brothels to come to their homes. Nonetheless, Army Officers continued to visit brothels, bars, and streets known as sites of sex work, in order to entice women into their rescue home.

A *War Cry* article published in 1888 described what was perhaps a more common response to the Army's efforts to entice "fallen women" into their homes:

> About 8:30a.m. the doors of the jail were to be thrown open, and two girls who had served their time were to come out. We had often visited the female prisoners and told them the gospel story. One of the girls referred to sought and professed to have found pardon. Her chum used to scoff her and us saying that Lily would not be so pious when she got out, and by her actions said she would prevent it if possible; but we

[93]"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8.
[94]"Our Rescue Home," *The War Cry*, 24 December 1887, 1.

> were resolved to do all in our power to help her, and so started for the grim dark doorway underground to give her a welcome, and a helping hand, by taking her with us to the 'Home,' if she, or both of them would come...The heavy doors creaked and swung open, but instead of the coarse brown suit, we met them attired in the latest fashion, made of the most costly plush brocades, satins, fringes, ribbons, laces, and feather in profusion. Would they come with us? Not these two. A cab was waiting for them, they entered it, and started for their old haunts.[95]

The above scenario highlights the fact that the Army worked with prisons in order to get sex workers into their homes. They had an agreement with certain prisons which allowed Salvation Army Officers to visit prisoners before their sentencing, and if the inmate was a first offender, the magistrate would sometimes offer her a remanded sentence in a Salvation Army rescue home instead of serving prison time. A *War Cry* article from 1908 explained that, the "Officers, whose work it is to attend the police courts – in Toronto there is a man for the males, and a woman for the females – go to the police station about half-past nine in the morning, and converse with the wretched beings who are incarcerated in a huge iron-barred enclosure – not at all unlike the cage of a wild beast in a zoological garden."[96] The article went on to point out that, "the cases that can be helped are located; first offenders are noted, their stories taken down and considered, and then the Officer calls upon the Crown Attorney."[97] The Army stated that "it is quite a customary thing for the magistrate, rather than to send a young woman to mix with abandoned characters in the prison, to send them on remanded sentences to The Salvation Army Home."[98]A *War Cry* article from 1909 provided an example of how this worked:

> Edna Goodspeed was brought before His Honour Judge Forbes in Chambers this morning and sentenced to one year in The Salvation Army Rescue Home. Before passing sentence, the prisoner was asked if she would go to a Home for one year or Kingston Penitentiary for five years. She evidently preferred the latter, as she was most emphatic in her protestations about going to the Home mentioned. His Honour then asked her if she would prefer going to The Salvation Army Rescue Home. This she agreed to do, and accordingly was sentenced to one year in that Institution. The judge gave her some sound advice as to her future conduct. She will be allowed out on the streets only when accompanied by a member of The Army, and if the police find her out alone, she will have to go to Kingston penitentiary for five years[99]

The Army also encouraged the public to inform them of any woman they knew to be a sex worker so that they could search her out and try to get her into a rescue home. In a 1888 *War Cry* article, the

---

[95]"Rescue Notes," *The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.
[96]"Police Court Work in Toronto," *The War Cry*, 19 December 1908, 3.
[97]Ibid.
[98]Ibid.
[99]"The Authorities and Army Homes," *The War Cry*, 20 February 1909, 16.

Army asked readers to "Write to us, giving the name and address of anyone who seems in danger of going astray, or who has gone wrong, that we may visit her and help her."[100] Army Officers regularly walked through downtown streets in the evenings trying to entice women to enter their rescue home. An article in *The War Cry* explained that, "They talk and pray with the girls in the houses and on the streets, and although some of them cannot at present be induced to leave their life of shame, they say if ever they are in need of a friend they will come to us."[101]

Girls and women also ended up in rescue homes when parents forced them to go. An 1894 article published in *The War Cry* described a situation that occurred in Ottawa:

> One day a mother came begging us to take her 13-year-old daughter. We promised, and shortly after the portly woman's voice was heard at the door saying to the child, who was clinging to the door post in terror, not knowing where she was being taken to, 'Go in, go in; you're lost.' The poor woman explained that her child had been away all night with bad companions, and she had found her in a house of shame.[102]

The girls and women that stayed in Salvation Army rescue homes came from a range of circumstances. They could have been streetwalkers looking to escape the cold or wanting to get help finding work outside the sex trade; they could have been prisoners looking to escape a jail sentence, or young girls being shunned by their mothers for deviating from sexual norms. Despite such diverse backgrounds, significant trends in the inmates' race, class, and age can still be identified. It appears that the majority of inmates were white. This is based on the fact that the Army consistently highlighted the racial background of a person if they were not white. Many articles emphasized that procurers were Chinese or Jewish, that women captured in the trade were Jewish, or that the lovers of sex workers were Black or Chinese. Also, one article published in *The War Cry* told the story of how they admitted a Black girl to one of their rescue homes.[103] The fact that this alone called for an entire article suggests that it was rare to admit Black women. The absence of any documentation of inmates' race also implies that the majority of inmates were white.

---

[100]"The Rescue Homes," *The War Cry*, 30 June 1888, 2.
[101]"Rescue Notes, "*The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.
[102]"Ottawa's New Rescue Home," *The War Cry*, 29 December 1894, 5.
[103]The article stated that, "A colored girl asked for admittance to our Home, was taken in, and in asking about her we found that she was a noted character." "Two Incidents From Toronto." Clipping from *War Cry*. Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

It also seems likely that the majority of women admitted to the rescue homes were young, probably under the age of twenty-five. Whether or not this was intentional cannot be known for sure, but it is understandable that the Army would attempt to attract young women. Younger women were most likely seen as easier to convert as they were viewed as less hardened in their ways. Army Officers even articulated this point later on, in the 1910s, when describing the different categories into which they divided inmates. Although they did not categorize women at this stage of their work, it can be reasonably assumed that they had already begun to view young women as easier, and perhaps worthier, to reclaim.

The suggestion that Salvation Army rescue homes housed mostly young, white women is supported by the work of historians who have examined other rescue homes in the United States and Canada. Peggy Pascoe's book, *Relations of Rescue,* for example, suggests that non-white women were housed separately from white women. For example, the Chinese Mission Home was opened in 1874 to deal specifically with Chinese women in San Francisco.[104] Pascoe had access to detailed information on the inmates of the rescue homes she examined, including their ages. It appears that the majority of inmates were teenagers.[105]

Pascoe's work, along with the work of Carolyn Strange and Mariana Valverde, suggest that the majority of inmates in rescue homes were also working-class. This is understandable since women with means, who defied sexual norms, would likely wish to avoid the scandal of entering a rescue home and ruining their reputation. It was also mostly working-class women who laboured in the sex trade in Canada at this time.[106]The fact that the majority of inmates got jobs as domestic servants supports the notion that these women came from the working-classes.[107]

---

[104]Peggy Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), 15.
[105]Ibid., 3.
[106]For more on sex work in the United States and Canada at this time, see Mark T. Connelly, *The Response to Prostitution in the Progressive Era*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1980; Ruth Rosen, *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982);Carolyn Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem: The Perils and Pleasures of the City, 1880-1930* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995); and Mariana Valverde, *The Age of Light, Soap and Water* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc., 1991).
[107]Ibid.

Inside rescue homes, Salvation Army Officers aimed to reclaim "fallen women" through both social and spiritual redemption. The main goal, however, was spiritual redemption, which meant conversion. In September 1888, *The War Cry* explained that, "In the first place we try to teach them that no mere reformation will do, but that they must give up their sins and God must make a thorough change in their hearts before they can ever hope to regain their character and womanhood again."[108] The article further indicated that they "are also instructed in all kinds of housework and sewing so that when they are fit to go out and face the world again they may be able to earn their living honestly."[109] In an annual report, the Canadian Salvation Army stated that, "Let it be distinctly understood at the onset, we do not aim at the mere reformation of these characters, but at their conversion, for we are conscious, if we can get them into a change of heart, we shall effect something that will keep them, in the hour of temptation."[110] The Army made it clear that learning discipline and finding a job were secondary to finding God. In a1907 article, the Army explained that, "Our great hope is the power of Christ's Salvation; the changing of the heart by the power and love of God is what we look to for a permanent social Salvation."[111] In 1910, one Officer expressed hope that "the daily prayers and personal ministries of the Officers may lead them, not merely to social rehabilitation, but even to that great fundamental change of character and nature-conversion."[112] And indeed, the Army aimed for a genuine conversion – not just lip-service; they sought to reach their inmates on a deep and personal level. "The underlying and yet leading principle throughout," one Officer explained, "will be found in the fact that it is absolutely essential to secure the heartiest co-operation from the girl herself towards her own rescue."[113]

Along with spiritual redemption (conversion), the Army believed that "fallen women" required social redemption. This included the need to learn discipline. In 1896, Mrs. Booth explained that, "Next

---

[108]"Rescue Notes," *The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.
[109]Ibid.
[110]"'Within Rescue Doors': Being The Annual Report of The Women's Social Work of The Salvation Army Under the Direction of Mrs. Bramwell Booth together with Statistics and Statement of Accounts," Rescue Homes Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives: Scarborough, ON, 17.
[111]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[112]"A Mansion of Mercy," *The War Cry*, 26 November 1910, 3.
[113]"'Within Rescue Doors,'" 17.

to salvation of God, the girls must be disciplined. They come to us in a lawless and wild spirit. Self-will is in most cases the first cause of their downfall. The habits of the life they have led make it difficult and almost impossible to submit to discipline."[114] In an annual report on their rescue homes, Mrs. Bramwell Booth highlighted the importance of discipline in the rescue home. She wrote that, "Over and above the maintenance of order, cleanliness, and regularity, there is the work-room itself, where hands, little used to toil, are to be taught with infinite patience and adaptation the art of industry! That is not learned in a day."[115] Discipline was taught through the rigorous schedule imposed in the rescue home and the mandatory laundry and sewing work which inmates had to complete.

Social redemption also entailed learning domestic skills in order to get a "respectable" job upon leaving the rescue home or in order to get married and be a good Christian housewife. In *Fair Canada,* the Army explained that, "Many a poor girl finds her way to our Home simply because she has had no domestic training, consequently she is not competent to take a good situation or to command wages enough to keep herself clothed half decently. Part of our plan is to try and remedy this by taking them in hand and patiently teaching them how work should be done."[116] A 1907 *War Cry* article indicated that, "...we want to teach our girls how to properly handle furniture and clean rooms, so that when they go into well-appointed households they may be able to perform their duties in a well-trained manner." [117] The Salvation Army believed that the best position for a working-class woman was as a domestic servant in a good Christian home.[118] In order to get such a job, the Army's rescue workers taught girls how to cook, clean, do laundry, and sew.

The Salvation Army's efforts to teach discipline and domestic skills to inmates were tied to their efforts to ensure that the homes were at least partly self-supporting. Early on, there seemed to be little hope that self-sufficiency could be achieved. In 1898, the leader of women's rescue work in Canada, Mrs. Coombs, stated, however, that "during the previous year the girls in the Homes, under the instruction of

---

[114]*Sin-Chains Riven*, 19.
[115]"'Within Rescue Doors,'" 17-18.
[116]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 8.
[117]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[118]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 19 January 1907, 3.

the officers, had earned a good income towards this."[119] In 1907 Mrs. Coombs explained that, "we aim at making the Homes self-supporting is certainly true, but in that respect I am sorry to say we do not yet realize our aims."[120] She indicated that, "We help ourselves, however, in the Vancouver Homes, by laundry work and needle work...The basement will be well equipped as a laundry, and we are hoping to do a good business in that line."[121] An advertisement in a Salvation Army publication released in 1896 offered "Goods Knitted at Rescue Home."[122] It lists men's socks at a cost of35 and 40 cents per pair, women's stockings at 50 cents per pair, men's shirts at 1.75 each, and cardigan jackets at 3.50.[123] It does not appear that the rescue homes were ever successful in making significant profits as Officers continued to ask for much-needed donations through *The War Cry*, and repeatedly stated how few resources they had access to.

Aside from the money they made from laundry and sewing services, the Canadian Salvation Army rescue homes were sometimes funded by grants from municipal and/or provincial governments. In a 1904 *War Cry* article, the Army provided some information on how many homes received grants, of what type, and amount involved. The author stated that in 1904, the rescue homes in Vancouver and Ottawa received municipal grants and the homes in Winnipeg, St. John and St. John's received provincial grants. The grant for the St. John's rescue home was $450 for the year. The rescue homes in Montreal and Halifax received no grants, and nothing was mentioned about the homes in London, Hamilton or Toronto.[124] Aside from grants and the inmates' work, the Canadian Salvation Army rescue homes relied on donations.

The services of the rescue home did not end when the inmate left the home, which was preferably after a six month period, but continued for an additional three years. A Salvation Army rescue Officer explained that, "our officers remain in touch with girls placed into situations, by visitation or

---

[119]Dean, *The Lady with the Other Lamp*, 139.
[120]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[121]Ibid.
[122]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, unnumbered page in front of booklet.
[123]Ibid.
[124]"Sketch of Our Rescue Institutions and Matrons," *The Easter War Cry*, April 1904, 10.

correspondence, and so keep a watchful eye and a guiding hold upon them until they are strong and firm beyond fear." [125] The Army did not describe their "after-care" work in any detail, but it appears that Officers encouraged visits or letters from former inmates so that they could continue to support them and ensure that they stayed right with God.

Having established a sense of the basic operations of the rescue homes, it is important to consider how successful they were. Some questions that arise include: how many women entered these homes? How long did they stay? How many got jobs? Got married? Returned to family? Converted? Or left unredeemed? The only sources that offer answers to these questions are Salvation Army statistics, which could have been inflated. The Army had an interest in presenting the organization as successful in order to maintain legitimacy and continue to receive donations. The other source used to obtain statistics on inmates is the online 1891 census for Victoria, BC. In that year, the census listed only one female inmate along with her one-year-old baby, Henry, as residing in the Victoria rescue home. Since the Victoria home remained open for only four years, it could be characterized as one of the "unsuccessful" homes. As such, its history is different from the longstanding rescue homes operating in Toronto and other major cities.

In general, it appears that the majority of rescue homes housed one to twenty women on average. In 1894, a Salvation Army publication stated that, in the St. John, N.B. home, there were "five girls and two children in the Home."[126] A *War Cry* article from the same year indicated that in the Parkdale, Toronto home, there "are eighteen women there, and five officers in charge."[127] In 1904, an Officer claimed that their Toronto rescue home housed an average of twenty women and fourteen children on a weekly basis. The Ottawa home contained fifty-five to sixty inmates, and in St. John, N.B., there were "seventeen women and twenty children housed weekly."[128] The homes in Hamilton, London, Halifax, and other cities were not accounted for. This might have been because the number of inmates was low and the

[125]"Sisters of Sorrow,"27.
[126]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 23.
[127]"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit," *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.
[128]"Sketch of Our Rescue Institutions and Matrons," *The Easter War Cry*, April 1904, 10.

Army did not wish to advertise that reality. In 1907, the Canadian Salvation Army indicated that they had thirteen rescue homes in operation and accommodation for about 250 women throughout all of Canada.[129]

In 1896, the Army compiled statistics on all their rescue homes in Canada (nine) plus two in the United States. The numbers are as follows:

Table 2: Salvation Army Rescue Home Statistics for 1896

Name of Home	**Accommodated Girls-Children**	**Admitted Girls-Children**	**Sent to hospital and other Homes**	**Situations**	**Returned to Friends**	**Unsatisfactory**	**Now in**
Toronto	20-10	104-37	31	40	15	2	16-9
London	20-12	77-33	20	30	12	6	9-8
St. John, N.B.	20-8	41-35	6	15	4	8	10-3
Montreal	16-5	141-29	35	50	22	21	13-9
Winnipeg	9-13	65-51	7	30	13	10	5-3
Halifax, N.S.	15-13	46-24	2	23	7	5	9-11
St. John's, Nfld.	8	29-8	4	14	0	6	5-2
Ottawa	12-13	55-40	12	12	15	6	10-13
Hamilton	12-7	73-20	11	25	9	14	14-3
Helena	10-3	19	2	6	3	0	8
Spokane	6	7-8	1	1	1-1	3	1-3
Total	**148-84**	**657-285**	**131**	**246**	**101**	**81**	**100-64**

For the year of 1897, the Army compiled statistics for all their homes in Canada (nine) plus two in the United States. The numbers are as follows:[130]

Table 3: Salvation Army Rescue Home Statistics for 1897

	Girls	**Children**
Admitted	642	241
Saved	164	
Employed in the S.A.	16	
Employed outside	305	
Sent to Friends	101	66
Sent to other Homes	34	22
Married	3	
Adopted		25

[129]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[130]"Brief Summary of the Year's Work," *The War Cry*, 1897.

Died	8	21
Unsatisfactory	80	
In Homes	95	107

In 1904, the Army published statistics on all their homes in Canada. The numbers are as follows:

Table 4: Salvation Army Rescue Home Statistics for 1904

No. of Women Admitted into Homes....560
No. Sent to Situations.....275
No. Sent to Friends.....145
No. Still in Homes.....131
No. Unsatisfactory.....28
No. Professed Conversion.....112
No. of Children in Homes.....439[131]

What do these statistics tell us? The rescue homes usually housed a small number of women at onetime, usually around five to twenty women together with their children. These statistics also suggest that shifts occurred between 1896/1897 and 1904. In this period, it appears that the number of women who were admitted to rescue homes decreased from 657 women to 560, while the number of babies admitted increased from 285 to 439. This indicates that more women entering the homes were pregnant or already had children. This interpretation is supported in the next chapter, which provides evidence that the Canadian Salvation Army began to redirect their services from "fallen women" to unmarried mothers at the turn of the twentieth century. The statistics also indicate some consistencies, such as the percentage of inmates sent to other homes or hospitals. In 1896, 20 per cent were sent out and in 1904 that figure increased to 23 per cent. The percentage of inmates who converted also remained relatively constant; in 1897, 26 per cent reportedly converted, while in 1904, 20 per cent had. However, over the course of eight years, the percentage of inmates who received situations rose slightly from 37 per cent to 49 per cent, the percentage who returned to friends increased from 15 per cent to 26 per cent, and the percentage of women deemed unsatisfactory decreased from 12 per cent to less than 1 per cent. In general, what these statistics seem to suggest is that, while the number of inmates was decreasing, the Salvation Army was increasingly more successful in placing inmates in respectable jobs and/or in homes with friends or

[131]"Sketch of Our Rescue Institutions and Matrons," *The Easter War Cry*, April 1904, 10.

family. The Army's conversion rate remained at about 20 per cent. While these statistics cannot be taken at face value, they can be used in conjunction with other evidence to develop a more complete and accurate picture of rescue home success rates and inmate trends.

Lived Experiences

It is one thing to understand the aims and motivations behind Salvation Army rescue homes in Canada, but how did they function in practice? What was life like inside one of these homes? This section begins with an exploration of the lived experiences of Salvation Army Officers who worked in rescue homes between 1886 and 1911. While some historians who have examined rescue homes in Canada and the United States at the turn of the twentieth century have explored the experiences of inmates, few have examined the lived experiences of the matrons.[132]As discussed below, the experiences of Canadian Salvation Army Rescue Officers were complex and ranged widely. They cannot be characterized as either purely positive or negative, but rather as a combination of both.

Working as a Rescue Officer in one of the Canadian Salvation Army homes could be stressful. This was largely because of the financial challenges of running the institution on small grants and donations. A 1904 *War Cry* article stated that Ensign Butler of the Vancouver rescue home received a grant from the municipal government and was also hoping to get a grant from the provincial government which she explained "would place us in a much better position financially."[133] The article also indicated that Adjt. Ogilvie of the rescue home in Butte, Montana, had "a somewhat trying experience during the past year, in moving and other things. The expenses are high, and though the work is so much needed, is not supported as well as it should be." In the Montreal home, "Brigadier Turner is trying to secure municipal aid for the Home, which would be a great help," and in the Halifax home, "the financing of this institution is a difficult matter, as it receives no assistance from the Government or city."[134]*War Cry* articles continually ask for furniture, clothing, and cash donations for the rescue homes between 1886 and

[132]One example of this is Regina Kunzel's *Fallen Women, Problem Girls: Unmarried Mothers and the Professionalization of Social Work, 1890-1945*(Connecticut: Yale University Press), 1995.

[133]"Sketch of Our Rescue Institutions and Matrons," *The Easter War Cry*, April 1904, 10.
[134]Ibid.

1911. It appears that matrons were continually struggling to make do with inadequate resources and that this caused them stress.

The work was also emotionally draining. Working with girls who may have suffered from sexual abuse or sexual exploitation, parental neglect, poverty, and/or struggled to raise children as single mothers, could tax the emotional stability of an Officer. These struggles were occasionally highlighted in *War Cry* articles and other Salvation Army publications. In an interview with Capt. Mrs. Rogers, the matron of the Ottawa rescue home in 1888, she stated that "some of the scenes they have witnessed are too sad to relate."[135] In a 1896 interview, one rescue home matron indicated that, "I want to tell you of one girl who was in the Home. She was such a trouble to us, and used to try and lead the others astray, so that the Adjutant had to send her away."[136] In *Fair Canada*, a rescue worker stated that their work "is very difficult, it is so hard to reach the class we want to deal with when we go visiting."[137] In *Sin Chains*, Mrs. Bramwell Booth, who had at the time commanded the rescue work in England for eleven years, wrote the following about Salvation Army rescue work: "Our discouragements are many. We are often defeated before we finally triumph. We have few big meetings to cheer us on. Our work is largely and necessarily behind the scenes. Therefore, it is only love that can sustain the faith and courage of a Rescue Officer."[138]

Aside from the stressful nature of rescue work, it appears that those who committed to it did find fulfillment and pleasure in their work. One Rescue Officer expressed that, while "there have been many discouragements and difficulties which seemed insurmountable, there has also been much to cheer our hearts and reward us for the labor expended."[139] Another stated that in rescue homes, "many a hard battle is fought, many a fierce encounter with the powers of darkness take place, and many a victory won which only God and the angels know anything about."[140] In one 1896 interview, a Lieutenant of rescue work was asked to describe her experiences. She replied that, it is "glorious work. I was for some time a field

---

[135]"Rescue Notes," *The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.
[136]"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit," *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.
[137]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 27.
[138]*Sin-Chains Riven*, 20.
[139]"The Rescue Homes," *The War Cry*, 30 June 1888, 2.
[140]"Rescue Notes," *The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.

officer, but oh, I love this work! While I hate the sin, I love the sinner, and the lower down they get the more I seem to love them. And oh, we do have some grand times. Sunday evenings we have some lovely meetings with the dear girls. Although we have much to discourage us in the work, still, praise God, he does bless us."[141]

What were the experiences of inmates within rescue homes? The experiences of inmates, like those of Officers, were complex, wide ranging, and should not be over-simplified as either positive or negative. Kunzel explores the complexity of inmate experiences in maternity homes in *Fallen Women*. While American maternity homes differed from Canadian rescue homes, her understanding of women's experiences within institutions is applicable. She explains:

> The range of social relations in maternity homes and the continuum of appreciation on the one hand and resistance on the other documented in logbooks and case records complicate the tendency of historians to view social welfare institutions either as humanitarian refuges or as instruments of social control. Unmarried mothers were neither universally appreciative nor universally resentful. Homes were not the harmonious retreats portrayed by evangelicals or hotbeds of protracted and explicit resistance. Gratitude and resistance existed simultaneously in the homes. Although unmarried mothers were capable of reactions at both poles, most social relations were probably negotiated in the wide and complicated territory that lay in-between.[142]

Understanding the experiences of inmates is more difficult than comprehending those of matrons. This is due to the dearth of available sources beyond a handful of letters written by former-inmates to the matrons after leaving the rescue home. Some of these letters were published in *The War Cry* and other Salvation Army publications.

Salvation Army publications produced between 1886 and 1910 presented very little to suggest that inmates had any negative experiences in rescue homes. Only one source, *Sin Chains*, provided any evidence of negative reactions inmates had toward the homes. In one article included in *Sin Chains*, a Rescue Officer not only admitted "difficulty in reaching the girls," but also stated that the girls feared "the Home, its restraints, and discipline," and that they "attributed to it the character of a prison, with inflexible rules and an atmosphere of bondage."[143] The worker then claimed that after settling into the home, the girls found their fears were quickly assuaged. Despite its clear dismissal of any negative

---

[141]"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit," *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.
[142]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 102.
[143]*Sin-Chains Riven*, 8.

realities in rescue homes, the article is significant as it demonstrates that the Officers acknowledged that it was not uncommon for inmates to be fearful, at least initially, and that some were dissatisfied with rescue home life.

There is also evidence to suggest that inmates had more positive experiences in rescue homes and were genuinely grateful for the help offered to them. This is demonstrated in the letters written by former inmates which were published by the Salvation Army. In 1909, a letter from a former inmate, identified as "R", to Adjt. Tassle, a Rescue Officer in a Winnipeg rescue home, was printed in *The War Cry*. It read:

> Dear Mother, - The only way I have of showing my love for you is by being a true rescued girl. There is no condemnation resting on my soul. At the close of the day, I have not to ask my Saviour to forgive me, but to thank Him for His saving and keeping power. It is not because I am in a pleasant home that that I say I am saved, but because I know I have a new heart, and I keep it clean by clinging to Jesus, telling Him all my little joys and sorrows. I keep away from all them that would lead me astray, and seek help continually from God.
>
> Captain and soldiers have gone to the outpost to-day, so there is no meeting this evening. I go out to the meetings every night, and twice on Sunday.
>
> Dear Mother, your prayers have not been in vain for me. Dear Mrs. R says she would like to help the Home. The only way we can help the Home is by our prayers. It is true, I had a very deceitful heart and yet very tender, but I know the past is under the Blood.
>
> Mr. and Mrs. R are as kind to me, as the first day I came and the children are so good.
>
> We feel the Lord is here. It is a happy house. We feel the Lord's ways are the pleasantest and all His paths are peace.
>
> Please Mother, remember me to the dear girls, and officers Cowan, Wright, and the rest that knew me. With much love from your rescued
>
> -R[144]

Another letter written by a former inmate, Hattie, to Captain Lauler of the same Winnipeg rescue home in 1891 was printed in the Canadian Salvation Army publication *In Fair Canada*. It read:

> Dear Mother – You will be glad to know that I am getting on well both bodily and spiritually. God is giving me the needed spiritual strength day by day to do my work, so as to glorify Him through it. I know, praise God, that I am growing in grace – that I have not the hankering after sin and the evil desires I once had, and that I love Him more, and am seeking to know and do His will. God is keeping me good because I am letting Him lead me. I loved sin, and very soon I should have filled a sinner's grave. But God had patience with me, and when Major led our little meeting in the Home, God convicted me, and very soon I was willing to come publicly and confess my sins, and God did a definite work in my soul. I never forget to pray for you and the girls in and out of the Home. – Hattie[145]

While such letters were likely printed for propaganda purposes, it would be too simplistic to assume that no inmates had positive experiences in the rescue homes or that their lives were not changed for the better. It is also possible that inmates were truly grateful for the Army's services. It is reasonable to

---

[144]"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8.
[145]*Fair Canada's Dark Side*, 23.

assume that these women found people who loved and cared for them in the home, and that they found peace in God and becoming a Salvationist. It also seems likely that they were grateful for assistance in finding a job outside of sex work. Some women must have had positive experiences since some of them ending up joining the Army and becoming rescue Officers themselves.

Kunzel's research into maternity homes also suggests that inmates were grateful. She states that "harmony between maternity home staff and unmarried mothers did not exist entirely in the imaginations of evangelical matrons."[146]As evidence, positive statements provided by inmates are presented including one by a girl who described the staff as "sympathetic and helpful."[147] How common it was for inmates to feel grateful is an open question, but there is no reason to believe that such experiences did not occur.

Conclusion

From 1886 to 1911, the Canadian Salvation Army established a vast system of rescue work for "fallen women" across the country. In every home, the main goal was conversion to Christianity and the secondary goals included teaching discipline, and finding respectable work and a place to live, preferably with family, friends, or through marriage. In order to achieve these goals, the homes taught inmates Salvationist theology and domestic skills such as cooking, cleaning and sewing in order to help them get jobs as domestic servants or to prepare them for marriage. The historical evidence suggests that the experiences of those who worked and lived in the rescue homes varied. The lives of Officers were often stressful and their work emotionally taxing due to financial worries and the challenges of trying to assist women in crisis. Despite this, it appears that the Officers who stuck with the work found a great satisfaction and happiness in it. Many inmates experienced fear and felt dissatisfaction with their lack of power in the home. Some inmates also expressed happiness and gratitude for the services offered in the rescue homes and the genuine concern and kindness they received.

By demonstrating the complexities of both sex workers and evangelical reformer's experiences and motivations, the one-dimensional portrayal of such historical actors, often found within the

[146]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 94.
[147]Ibid.

historiographical literature, is complicated. Sex workers are presented as neither oppressed victims nor liberated heroes, but complex individuals whose lives encompassed a combination of both oppression and agency. Similarly, evangelical reformers were neither evil matrons simply seeking to morally regulate young working-class women, nor completely benevolent and selfless saints of God. They constituted a diverse range of qualities and characteristics, and perhaps most importantly, were motivated by their religious beliefs.

Chapter 3: The Canadian Salvation Army, Unmarried Mothers, and the Rise of Social Work, 1911-1940

"We know that unmarried mothers are usually emotionally immature...that often there is neurosis present...."[1]

This chapter argues that, through the incorporation of the methods and theories employed by social workers in the United States, as well as the establishment of some of Canada's first social work institutions, the Canadian Salvation Army, along with other evangelical organizations, largely introduced the field of social work into Canada. In the 1920s, however, evangelical social workers began to face competition from secular social workers. Evangelical and secular social workers utilized the same scientific concepts and methods; the only striking difference between the two was the role of God and the notion of reclamation in their work. As the field of secular social work grew, it began to distance itself from evangelical social work and to claim that religion should not play a role in scientific treatment. The two groups of social workers battled for dominance and by 1940, secular social workers had achieved dominance in the profession. Government officials had been persuaded that the care of sex workers and unmarried mothers was the prerogative of the "medical-scientific community," which included secular social workers, as well as psychiatrists and general practitioners. These groups argued that there was no role for God or reclamation in the treatment of female sexual “deviants”; rather, the women were classified as "incurable."

Terminology

Before developing this argument, some terms need to be defined. In this chapter, I use the terms "evangelical social work" and "secular social work." They highlight the fact that the only difference between evangelicals and non-evangelicals working in the field of social work was their belief in the role of God and the possibility for full-reclamation of "deviant" women. In using these terms, I challenge the

[1]Betty Isserman, "The Casework Relationship in Work with Unmarried Mother," *The Social Worker* 17, no. 1 (October 1948):12-17.

notions that early twentieth-century evangelicals cannot be considered social workers or professional. While Regina Kunzel argues in *Fallen Women* that there was a division between evangelical benevolent workers and professional [secular] social workers in early twentieth century America, no such division existed in Canada where evangelicals were also social workers and professional.

This chapter clearly demonstrates that evangelicals were the first social workers in Canada. But how were evangelical social workers professional? A profession is defined as "a paid occupation, esp. one that involves prolonged training and a formal qualification."[2] Evangelical social workers were "professional" as many received "prolonged training" as clergy, nurses, or rescue workers, all of which trained them for their duties working with "fallen women." Canadian Salvation Army rescue homes and maternity hospitals were staffed by Army Officers, all of whom were official members of the clergy, meaning they were ordained for religious duties. In this sense, Salvation Army Officers were religious professionals. Many were also trained medical professionals. Beginning in 1906, the Canadian Salvation Army established government-approved nursing schools in their maternity hospitals. The first course began on 15 May 1906 at the Grace Maternity Hospital in Winnipeg.[3]Initially it was a one-year course, but in 1914, it was extended to fifteen months and in the 1920, to three years. From 1916 to 1930, there was an average of fifteen graduates per year.[4] In the 1920s, seven additional Salvation Army maternity hospitals began to offer nursing degrees. The curriculum was approved by provincial governments, which meant that, at the conclusion of her training, a nurse could take the provincial examinations and achieve Registered Nurse's standing. Salvation Army nurses were often then employed in Salvation Army maternity hospitals or general hospitals. In 1974, the Canadian Salvation Army stopped offering programs in nursing.[5]

Officers involved in what the Army called its "Women's Social Work" had to have certain qualifications and received special training for the job from the Army itself. Many articles printed in *The*

---

[2]"profession," *Oxford English Dictionary*, http://www.oed.com/search?searchType=dictionary&q=profession&_searchBtn=Search (accessed 18 February 2014).
[3]Untitled Manuscript. Grace Index Binder, Grace Hospital Box, Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.
[4]Ibid.
[5]Ibid.

War Cry outlined the mandatory qualifications of rescue workers. One such article titled, "A Model Social Officer," listed six qualifications: honesty, assurance of a full salvation, wisdom, courage, self-forgetfulness, and love.[6] This article also explained that young Rescue Officers would serve a type of apprenticeship. At first, their duties would be quite limited and they were not allowed contact with the inmates. As their training progressed, they assumed more responsibilities along with inmate contact. While this may not seem like the sort of training that professional social workers would later undergo in the 1920s, this was the only type of professional training offered to social workers in Canada at the time. When Canadian universities began to offer degrees in social work, some Canadian Salvation Army Officers would attain such credentials. For example, Captain Mary Webb of the Canadian Salvation Army graduated from the University of Toronto's School of Social Work in the 1940s and then worked in Salvation Army homes for delinquent girls and women.[7]In light of this evidence, evangelical social workers were not untrained, incompetent, and ignorant as is often assumed, but were trained professionals, skilled, and knowledgeable.

Sex workers to Unmarried Mothers

Prior to adopting American social work theories and methods in the early twentieth century, the Canadian Salvation Army, as noted above, shifted much of its focus from "saving" sex workers to "saving" unmarried mothers. Through its work over two decades, the Army found that there was a need for maternity services for unwed mothers and that they were much more successful converting "fallen women" who were expecting a child.

Ann R. Higginbotham has written about the Salvation Army's rescue work with unmarried mothers in England from 1884 to 1914. She argues that rescue homes in England in the late nineteenth century were "receiving frequent requests for aid from both pregnant single women and women with

[6]"Love Did It," Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON., 14-15.
[7]Mary Webb, "Treatment of the Delinquent Girl in England," *The Social Worker*, 15, no. 3 (February 1947): 30.

illegitimate children."[8] The Army, according to Higginbotham, began to build maternity homes for unmarried mothers in response to this demand. Higginbotham also states that unmarried mothers were "seen as the most hopeful of all rescue cases."[9] A leader in women's social services in England, Florence Booth, stated that, "no class of women for whom we have worked has yielded such uniformly encouraging results."[10] Higginbotham further explains that unwed mothers were understood to have "more potential for reform than prostitutes because of their inherent respectability and their limited experience of sin."[11] She adds that this "view of the tractability of unmarried mothers is not surprising; they were, to some extent, a captive group." In other words, their pregnancy limited their options for assistance and so they were more often willing to comply with Army regulations and rules.

Historical sources suggest that the Canadian Salvation Army shifted their focus from sex workers to unmarried mothers for many of the same reasons as their British counterparts. Some sources also suggest that the Salvation Army in Canada had more success attracting women into rescue homes if they were pregnant. The 1891 census for Victoria, BC indicates that the Salvation Army rescue home had only one inmate, Maria Shuttleworth, and that Maria had a one year old son, Harry, with her.[12] Statistics on Canadian Salvation Army rescue homes show that 148 women and 84 babies were admitted in 1896.[13] The rescue home was clearly attracting a large number of pregnant sex workers. It is easy to understand that a sex worker would be more willing to enter a rescue home if pregnant. She would likely need help paying for prenatal care and hospital bills. She may also need help in learning how to care for a child and

[8]Ann R. Higginbotham, "Respectable Sinners: Salvation Army Rescue Work with Unmarried Mothers, 1884-1914," in *Religion in the Lives of English Women, 1760-1930*, ed. Gail Malmgreen, 216-234 (London: Croom Helm, 1986), 219.
[9]Ibid., 220.
[10]Ibid.
[11]Ibid.
[12]"Vancouver Island 1891 Census," *viHistory*, http://vihistory.ca/search/searchcensus.php?start=0&show=n&form=full&year=1891&familynumber=394&districtid=4&subdistrictid=c-3 (accessed 10 November 2013).
[13]"Brief Summary of the Year's Work," *The War Cry*, 1897.

getting set up for such a task. It is also reasonable to assume that pregnancy may have encouraged a sex worker to change her life for the supposed betterment of her child.[14]

The Canadian Salvation Army also claimed to have more success in converting pregnant women than women without children. In a 1907*War Cry* article, Mrs. Coombs explained that, with "maternity cases...as high as 95 per cent are saved to a better life," while non-maternity cases only saw 75 per cent of women "reformed."[15] An article published in 1909 affirmed that the Army's success rate among "maternity cases" was approximately twenty percent higher than other "rescue cases."[16]

The Canadian Salvation Army's change in focus from sex workers to unmarried mothers did not, however, signify a significant shift in attitudes toward "fallen women." The unmarried mother, like the sex worker, was understood as a victim above all else. With respect to unwed mothers, the Canadian Salvation Army explained that, "Pampered, cajoled, enticed, excited with liquor to which they are little accustomed, how easily many become victims both in our country and city life! Then it is the old story of shame, disgrace, disownment, ruthless abandonment and desertion by human (or fiendish!) sharks, who have left such to go in search of other unwary innocent girls."[17] The Army further emphasized that a "large proportion of these are truly more 'sinned against' than sinning."[18] And just as sex workers could be fully reclaimed, so could unmarried mothers. A Salvation Army maternity hospital worker in London indicated that the staff believed "that every child has a right to be born under the best conditions possible" and that they had an "unswerving faith in the possibility of a girl who has fallen from virtue being restored to a place among the most virtuous of her sex."[19] The only distinctions the Canadian Salvation

[14]I do not wish to suggest that sex work has any negative impact on a sex worker's child; I simply wish to suggest that some women may have felt more pressure to conform to society's notion that sex work harmed the children of sex workers.

[15]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.

[16]"Women's Social Work," *The War Cry*, 1 May 1909, 12.

[17]"'Within Rescue Doors': Being The Annual Report of The Women's Social Work of The Salvation Army Under the Direction of Mrs. Bramwell Booth together with Statistics and Statement of Accounts." Rescue Homes Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON., 36.

[18]Ibid., 37.

[19]Clipping of newspaper article, unknown source, unknown date, Women Hospital London folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Army made between sex workers and unmarried mothers were that, as noted above, the latter were easier to reclaim and were somewhat more respectable.

The Rise of Social Work

The term "social work" was coined in 1900 by American educator Simon Patten.[20] In the early twentieth century, the term was used broadly to describe the work of benevolent women, such as settlement workers and women involved in organized charities, who applied new scientific theories and methods to their charity work.[21] In the early years, social work professionals worked in a wide variety of settings and were involved in the major social reform movements of the day, but by 1920, they had "shifted to a more scientific, medical approach that emphasized mental and social hygiene and eugenic concerns."[22] Social workers began to work closely with the field of psychiatry at this time, as they "shared a common interest in scientific understanding and control of behaviour through casework practiced by a professional, technical elite."[23] Both fields were strongly influenced by the scientific methods of investigation, coordination, and systematic implementation, as well as the eugenics movement.[24] Historian Angie C. Kennedy argues that, in the early twentieth century, "eugenic ideas became increasingly popular and influential, shaping the work of social scientists, politicians, social reformers, and social workers of many different political persuasions."[25]

Historians usually identify American Mary Richmond as the first professional social worker. Richmond began her career in social work in 1888, when she became the Assistant Treasurer for the Charity Organization Society (COS).[26] Richmond was trained as a "friendly visitor," later called a "caseworker." She visited the homes of people in need and tried to help them improve their situation.

---

[20]Beverley J. Scott, *Establishing Professional Social Work in Vancouver and at the University of British Columbia* (Vancouver: Published by Author, 2004), 18.
[21]Ibid.
[22]Angie C. Kennedy, "Eugenics, 'Degenerate Girls,' and Social Workers During the Progressive Era," *Journal of Women and Social Work*, 23, no. 1 (February 2008): 28.
[23]Roy Lubove, *The Professional Altruist: The Emergence of Social Work as a Career, 1880-1930* (New York: Harvard University Press, 1973), 56.
[24]Ibid., 4.
[25]Kennedy, "Eugenics," 22.
[26]Elizabeth N. Agnew, *From Charity to Social Work: Mary E. Richmond and the Creation of an American Profession* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2004), 5.

Through this work, she began to develop ideas about how to standardize and systematize casework, which served as the foundation for the scientific methodology of professional social work. She published many books on the topic, including *Friendly Visiting among the Poor (1889)*, *Social Diagnosis* (1917), and *What is Social Case Work (1922)*. Casework or the scientific study of a client's social relationships became central to the field. Richmond saw social relationships as "the central core" of an individual's difficulties and argued that altering social relationships within and outside the family were the chief means of treating a client.[27]

Social workers' concepts and practices, including that of casework, were institutionalized throughout the United States in the early twentieth century. Formal education in social work began in 1898, when the New York Charity Organization Society established its Summer School of Philanthropy.[28] In 1904, the New York School of Applied Philanthropy (which would become Columbia's School of Social Work) opened. By 1915, there were five independent and two university-affiliated social work programs in the United States.[29]Social work was established somewhat later in Canada. In the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, before Canada had its own social work programs or professional associations, benevolent women went south of the border for their education, belonged to American associations, and attended American conferences. It was not until the 1910s that Canada began to create its own social work institutions. Social work was introduced at the University of Toronto in 1914, McGill University in 1918, and the University of British Columbia in 1926. Also in 1926, the Canadian Association of Social Workers was created. But before social work was established in universities, the Canadian Salvation Army, along with other evangelicals, was a leader in introducing the field into Canada. As early as 1904, the Salvation Army began to refer to their rescue work as "social work" and

[27]Ibid.
[28]Lubove, *The Professional Altruist*, 19.
[29]"The Adoption History Project," *University of Oregon*, http://pages.uoregon.edu/adoption/topics/socialwork.htm (accessed 12 October 2013).

their Rescue Officers as "social workers."[30] The Army also helped to introduce American social work theories and methods into Canada, one of most influential being "feeblemindedness."

"Feeblemindedness"

In the late nineteenth century, the term "feebleminded" became popular among doctors, social workers, and other professionals in the United States. "Feebleminded" was an overly-broad, ambiguous term used to define an individual who exhibited anything from a lack of morality or behavioural problems to mental disability. However, in this period, it was considered to be a scientific breakthrough and a legitimate mental condition.[31]In 1904, the Report of the Royal Commission on the Care and Control of the Feeble-Minded in England defined the "feebleminded" as "persons who may be capable of earning a living under favourable circumstances, but are incapable from mental defect existing from birth or from an early age – (a) of competing on equal terms with their normal fellows; or (b) of managing themselves and their affairs with ordinary prudence."[32] In 1907, Dr. Helen MacMurchy claimed that the "feebleminded" were "difficult to define, but not difficult to recognize."[33] She described them as lacking "the power of restraint and inhibition," as well as "proper will or judgement."[34] "They are able to act and may speak fairly well," she added, "though usually more or less foolishly...Hence we often find them in maternity hospitals, gaols, and poor houses."[35] By the late 1920s, the term fell into disfavour and was replaced with "mental defectiveness," though "feebleminded" continued to be used as a synonym into the 1940s.[36]

The concept of "feeblemindedness" was used widely as an explanation for female sexual "deviance" in the United States. Kunzel explains that, while "feeblemindedness in men seemed to

---

[30]Cox, "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results," 88.
[31]Tamara Vrooman, "The Wayward and the Feeble-Minded: Euthenics, Eugenics, and the Provincial Industrial Home for Girls, 1914-1929," (M.A. thesis, University of Victoria, 1994), 27.
[32]Helen MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1908* (Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1909), 37.
[33]Helen MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1907* (Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1908), 4.
[34]Ibid.
[35]Ibid.
[36]Steven Noll, *Feeble-Minded in Our Midst: Institutions for the Mentally Retarded in the South, 1900-1940* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1995), 2.

correlate with criminal activity and inability to succeed economically, feeblemindedness in women was defined almost exclusively in sexual terms."[37]The "feebleminded" girl was understood to be prone to immoral sexual conduct due to a lack of power to resist sexual temptation or to protect herself from the predatory advances of evil-minded men.[38] In the early twentieth century, "feeblemindedness" was particularly linked with illegitimacy. It was accepted by a wide range of medical experts, psychologists, sociologists, and social workers that "feebleminded" women were a major source of illegitimate births. These experts argued that "feebleminded" women "reproduced prolifically, typically giving birth to illegitimate children who were themselves likely to be feebleminded."[39] American social workers, in particular, promoted the link between "feeblemindedness" and female sexual "deviance." Josephine Shaw Lowell, for example, was an early social worker in late-nineteenth century America who suggested that many "fallen women" were "feebleminded."[40] In 1879, she proposed a new form of institution for "feebleminded" girls and women and stated that any woman should be admitted "upon the birth of a second illegitimate child."[41]Kunzel argues that the link between illegitimacy and "feeblemindedness" became generally accepted amongst social workers in the 1910s and into the 1920s.[42]

The Canadian Salvation Army, following the lead of American social workers, incorporated the theory of "feeblemindedness" into their own work with female sexual "deviants." In 1911, the annual report of "Hope Hall," the Salvation Army Rescue Home in Hamilton, described girls who had been ruined in the following terms: "Whence do they come? The answer comes all too readily to our lips. We have in view the feeble-minded girls whose lack of character is so often taken advantage of by the unscrupulous?"[43] At the Royal Commission in 1911, Mrs. Booth recommended: "(1) That every feeble-

[37]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 53.
[38]Reekie, *Measuring Immorality*, 121.
[39]Ibid., 120.
[40]James W. Jr. Trent, *Inventing the Feeble Mind: A History of Mental Retardation in the United States*. (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1994), 75.
[41]Ibid., 74.
[42]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 52.
[43]Helen MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1911* (Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1912), 7.

minded woman should be registered and cared for. (2) That every feeble-minded woman should be made a ward and placed under the care of a guardian."[44]

When compared to American social workers, the Canadian Salvation Army's understanding of "feeblemindedness" appeared to be less scientific. The Army seemed to adjust the concept to make it more consistent with their moral and religious beliefs. It is perhaps for this reason that the Army often used the term "folly" rather than "feebleminded" in *War Cry* publications. In 1911, Dr. Helen MacMurchy stated that "supreme folly" was the "most urgent of the feeble-minded problem."[45] By using the term "folly," then, the Canadian Salvation Army seemed to use the concept of "feeblemindedness" as an explanation for female sexual "deviance." In 1907, an article printed in *The War Cry* maintained that maternity cases involved "girls who, through betrayal and folly, get into trouble."[46] In 1908, a *War Cry* article declared that, the "folly of some young women is incredible. A girl not twenty years of age, was induced by a designing scoundrel..."[47] A 1909 article explained that one girl's "folly in trusting a deceiver made her a mother and cost her her life."[48]

The Canadian Salvation Army also appeared to develop a close working relationship with and support the work of Dr. Helen MacMurchy, a key proponent of the idea of "feeblemindedness" in Ontario. In each of her reports on "feeblemindedness" published between 1907 and 1911, the Salvation Army was listed as an ally in her research. In 1910, MacMurchy stated that, "The Salvation Army has afforded us every assistance possible to them in dealing with this class. The late Brigadier Stewart had a practical grasp of the problem and repeatedly told us that she recognized Feeble-Minded men and women every day in the Police Court of Toronto."[49]

The Canadian Salvation Army seemed to combine the idea of "feeblemindedness" and older notions into explanations for why women were "led astray." The Army continued to perceive sex workers

---

[44]Ibid.
[45]Ibid.
[46]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.
[47]"Police Court Work in Toronto," *The War Cry*, 19 December 1908, 3.
[48]"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8.
[49]Helen MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1910* (Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1911), 18.

and unmarried mothers as victims of evil men, bad parenting, capitalist society, and racialized individuals and continued to believe they could be reclaimed through conversion. To this, the Army added the idea that women were more likely to fall in these circumstances due a biological defect – that of "feeblemindedness." A 1909 *War Cry* article illustrates the incorporation of the idea of "feeblemindedness," or "folly," into understandings of "fallen women" as victims of evil men: "It was the old story. A girl's trust and folly, and a bad man's perfidity. She was at work in a city factory, but was too much ashamed to go to her country home. She had saved some dollars, and would have more in the course of two or three months, but she was afraid she would not have the usual fee for the maternity hospital."[50] If anything, a lack of mental abilities made this girl even more helpless or vulnerable to the perfidity of "bad men."[51]

The Canadian Salvation Army's incorporation of the concept of "feeblemindedness" is significant, as it led to the further dehumanization of sex workers and unmarried mothers. Earlier Salvationist understandings of "fallen women" saw such individuals as victims and sinners, which was dehumanizing as it implied that they lacked "normal" moral sensibilities. Through the incorporation of "feeblemindedness," however, the Salvation Army further dehumanized "fallen women" by asserting that they were biologically "defective." Psychologist Nick Haslam defines dehumanization as the denial of full humanness to another.[52] He conceptualizes humanness as possessing characteristics that are uniquely human and those that constitute human nature. Uniquely human characteristics include civility, refinement, moral sensibility, rationality, and logic and maturity.[53] Human nature includes emotional responsiveness, interpersonal warmth, cognitive openness, agency, individuality, and depth.[54]Based on these definitions, it is clear that the Canadian Salvation Army dehumanized "fallen women" by labelling them as "feebleminded," since the "feebleminded" were understood to lack most of these qualities.

---

[50]"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8.
[51]Ibid.
[52]Nick Haslam, "Dehumanization: An Integrative Review," *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 10, no. 3 (2006): 252.
[53]Ibid., 257.
[54]Ibid.

Psychologist Gerald V. O'Brien has explored the ways in which the "feebleminded" were dehumanized in the United States throughout the eugenics era. He argues that five metaphors were employed as vehicles for fostering the dehumanization of the "feebleminded," and for providing justification for the extreme actions taken against them.[55] The five metaphors include the organism metaphor, the animal metaphor, the war metaphor, the religious metaphor, and the object metaphor. The organism metaphor involves viewing target groups like germs, bacteria, or viruses, as invasive or destructive social elements that are capable of infecting the broader community. The animal metaphor involves describing members of a target groups using animalistic terminology. The war metaphor includes the extensive employment of military rhetoric or a general framing of the group in question as an imminent threat to the nation. The religious metaphor involves portraying the target group as evil, immoral, or detrimental to the spiritual foundations of the community. Finally, the object metaphor involves comparing the characteristics of the target group to those of impersonal objects. Together, these metaphors rendered the "feebleminded" less than human.

Prior to their adoption of the concept of "feeblemindedness," the Canadian Salvation Army utilized what O'Brien calls the religious metaphor which involves portraying individuals as immoral or detrimental to the spiritual foundation of the community. This is demonstrated through the Army's clear demarcation of female sexual "deviants" as immoral, as demonstrated in the previous chapter. By incorporating the concept of "feeblemindedness" into their understanding of sex workers and unmarried mothers as victims and sinners, the Army added the dehumanizing organism metaphor, which presents individuals as germ-like and destructive social elements. While the Army did not embrace eugenics beliefs completely as they still believed that God could save these women and reclaim them, the organization did move toward promoting the idea that they were not fully human, through the adoption of the explanatory notion of "feeblemindedness."

[55]Gerald V. O'Brien, *Framing the Moron: The Social Construction of Feeble-mindedness in the American Eugenics Era* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013), 25.

Maternity Hospitals: Classification and Casework

At the same time that the Canadian Salvation Army was promoting the concept of "feeblemindedness," they also began to employ the methods of classification and casework, which were developed by social workers in the United States. These new methods were integrated into the Army's new maternity hospitals for unmarried mothers; these institutions differed significantly from the Army's earlier rescue homes, as they both maintained traditional evangelical ideologies and practices, as well as integrated modern American scientific discourses and methodology. These hospitals were the sites in which the Canadian Salvation Army was able to introduce new social work practices into the country.

In the early twentieth century, the Army began to convert their rescue homes into joint maternity hospitals and rescue homes by simply adding a maternity ward. By 1910, rescue homes in Toronto, Vancouver, Calgary, and Halifax had all been transformed into joint maternity hospitals and rescue homes. In addition, the Canadian Salvation Army built fourteen maternity hospitals across Canada between 1898 and 1938, most of which were built in the 1920s. Maternity hospitals always included a maternity "home," located either in a building next to the maternity hospital, or as a ward within the hospital itself.[56] Young, unmarried females were ideally admitted into maternity homes prior to their due dates, were transferred to a maternity hospital to give birth and recover, and then sent back to the maternity home to prepare for finding employment and to obtain daycare for the babies.[57] Whether they stayed in a maternity home or in a hospital, however, unmarried mothers were subject to the same routines and regulations. Even during their stay in the hospital section, patients were expected to complete work and perform religious duties.

The following chart indicates where and when the Salvation Army maternity hospitals were built:

Table 5: Salvation Army Maternity Hospitals Locations and Years Built

Year	City/Province	Original Address
1898	St. John, New Brunswick	
1904	Winnipeg, Manitoba	"Grace Hospital"

[56]Clipping of newspaper article, unknown source, unknown date, Women Hospital London folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.
[57]Ibid.

1905	Toronto, Ontario	
1908	London, Ontario	
1909	Toronto, Ontario	"Women's Hospital" Bloor Street
1920	Windsor, Ontario	"Grace Hospital" Crawford and London Streets
1922	Halifax, Nova Scotia	Old campus of Dalhousie
1922	Ottawa, Ontario	"Maternity Hospital" Wellington St.
1923	St. John's, Newfoundland	"Grace Maternity Hospital" Cook St.
1925	Edmonton, Alberta	"Maternity Hospital"
1925-73	Montreal, Quebec	"The Catherine Booth Hospital" Walkley Ave.[58]
1926	Calgary, Alberta	"Maternity Hospital" in the former Pinkham College
1927	Vancouver, British Columbia	"Grace Hospital" Heather and Twenty-sixth street
1938	Saskatoon, Saskatchewan	"Bethany Home"

The layouts of maternity hospitals differed from rescue homes, as they were medical institutions instead of mock-family households. The hospitals were divided into different wards which separated patients. Most maternity hospitals, while established to serve unmarried mothers, added wards for married patients because of the general lack of maternity care for women in many of the cities where the hospitals were located. For example, the Salvation Army Maternity Hospital that opened in Halifax in 1922 was the first maternity hospital in the city. *The War Cry* wrote that, "Professor Fraser Harris, of the Faculty of Medicine, Dalhousie University, stated that he was indeed delighted at the success of the Salvation Army in getting the funds needed for the Maternity Hospital. It had always been one of their greatest trials that there was no maternity hospital in Halifax."[59] Adjutant Christian E. Chapman of the Grace Hospital in Halifax explained that, "doctors, observing the care and service rendered to the young women in their distress, began to ask our Hospitals to admit their private (married) patients."[60] In 1910, the Winnipeg Grace Hospital was described as serving "three classes" of patients: "private, who engage an airy, cheerful room entirely to themselves and are attended by their own doctor; semi-patients, who have a room of like character, but share it with another patient, and are also visited by their own medical man; and lastly,

[58]Boniface, Doris N.I. Letter to Colonel Mabel H. Crolly, 20 October 1966, found randomly on shelf, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.
[59]"The Halifax Maternity Hospital," *The War Cry*, 15 November 1919.
[60]Christian E. Chapman, "Hospital Work in Canada," 1937.Women Hospital Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON, 419.

public patients, who are treated by the Hospital staff in larger wards containing several beds. These, however, are on the same hygienic footing as the rest."[61]

All of the maternity hospitals were laid out in a similar fashion. The Ottawa Maternity Hospital, described as "a very fine structure, being constructed of national red press brick and white stone trimmings," was representative of all Canadian Salvation Army maternity hospitals built between 1910 and 1940.[62] A 1922 *War Cry* article explained that the Ottawa Maternity Hospital had a laundry and ironing room in the basement, as well as a large kitchen, serving room, two dining rooms, a lecture room, and a small public clinic. There was also a large sewing room and storage rooms. On the first floor, there were eleven private and two semi-private rooms, a large infants' room, a washroom, operating room, another kitchen, large linen room, and a "large sitting room with a fireplace."[63] The second floor had eleven private, and three semi-private rooms, one public ward, one infants' room, a doctor's room, sterilizing room, operating room, a third kitchen, linen room and large sitting room. The article stated that the "whole of the building has been finished in proper Hospital style, simplicity being the idea throughout."[64]

While maternity hospitals differed from rescue homes in terms of layout, they still sought to save "fallen women" through spiritual salvation. In 1904, Salvation Army Headquarters published a booklet titled, *Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results*. It was written by Commissioner Adelaide Cox and outlines the scientific methods to be adopted in the Army's social work institutions across the globe. At the same time, the booklet emphasized the importance of God and conversion in the Army's social work. The author stated that, "at the front of our work we must place the principle on which, more than any other, we found our hopes for the alleviation of the condition in which these classes are placed, and their permanent deliverance from them; and that is, the *salvation of the*

[61]"A Mansion of Mercy," *The War Cry*, 26 November 1910, 3.
[62]"The Ottawa Maternity Hospital: Description of the Building and Grounds." *The War Cry*, 11 March 1922.
[63]Ibid.
[64]Ibid.

individual through faith in Jesus Christ."[65]In an annual report on their services for "fallen women," the Army explained that unwed mothers were "lovingly received in their extremity (under certain conditions) at our Maternity Home, and every effort is made, in the time of depression and weakness, to lead such to see the sin in which they have fallen, and to repent and seek forgiveness."[66] At the opening of the maternity hospital in Calgary, Salvation Army commissioner Rich stated that, the Army "has one objective in all its work...and that is that the only way to cure all ills is to bring men, women and little children to really know God."[67] The Army aimed to convert their unmarried patients through mandatory daily prayer, Bible study, and scripture reading. A 1919*War Cry* article on the Salvation Army Maternity Hospital in London explained that each morning, "from 8.30 to 9, they all attend prayer and Bible study. A short meeting is also held each night just before retiring, when the Scripture is read and a hymn sung."[68]

Maternity hospitals also continued to teach discipline to unmarried mothers. Unmarried mothers, like sex workers, had been "led astray" and needed help getting back on track. A manual that discussed the Army's social work with women stated that, without "strict order, absolute obedience to instructions, punctuality and promptness, the other work would be largely thrown away."[69] The strict schedule and rules of the hospital as well as mandatory labour were designed to teach the women discipline. A former patient of the Vancouver Salvation Army Maternity Home described the rules and schedule as follows: "Up at the crack of dawn. Line up for your food. Do your chores. Say your prayers. Don't talk about the past. No last names ever."[70] She further described her experience as "Rules and regulations. Work and religion. Shame and secrecy."[71] While the Salvation Army did not publish the schedule introduced in their maternity hospitals, it appears that unmarried mothers were subjected to a similar schedule to that of

[65]Cox, "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results," 288.
[66]"Within Rescue Doors," 36.
[67]"New Maternity Hospital at Calgary," *The War Cry*, 10 April 1926, 7.
[68]"New Wing for London Hospital," *The War Cry*, 15 December 1919, 3.
[69]Cox, "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results," 288.
[70]Petrie, Anne Petrie, *Gone to an Aunt's: Remembering Canada's Homes for Unwed Mothers* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1998), 1.
[71]Ibid.

inmates in rescue homes. This included mandatory labour doing laundry or sewing. This work served three purposes: to teach discipline; to help the women earn their keep; and to provide them with the skills necessary to attain a respectable job in domestic service.

Unmarried mothers, like sex workers in rescue homes, were taught domestic skills so they could secure jobs as domestic servants. The Army explained that, "We have found training in work of the highest value in creating self-reliance and dignity of conduct which are so important for the future success of the women...To teach them that which will make them independent of vice or crime is in itself an enormous help in keeping them right when started on the right path."[72] In 1910, the Grace Hospital in Winnipeg indicated that it "put out into good situations about fifty."[73] In 1919, the London Maternity Hospital maintained that, within the past year, they dealt with sixty-one girls, forty-seven of which were placed into good positions as domestic servants.[74] Since women could not take children with them to live-in positions as domestic servants, the Canadian Salvation Army arranged a sort of day-care for ex-patients. In 1907, Mrs. Coombs explained that, girls "cannot take their babies with them into their situations, so the little ones remain with us – the girls, of course, paying for their maintenance."[75] The Army also arranged adoptions in some cases, but preferred to keep the mother and child together as it was thought that such a bond encouraged a Christian lifestyle. The Army asserted that, they "don't believe in separating mother and child...We try to find situations where parent and little one can live together. The babies often prove the salvation of their mothers, keeping their hearts tender and providing the necessary impetus to industry."[76]

Along with continuing to employ older methods in rescue homes, the Canadian Salvation Army also added new American-inspired social work methods to their work in maternity hospitals. The first was classification. In the early twentieth century, classification was widely adopted by social workers in the United States, particularly in their work with clients with "mental defects," which included unmarried

---

[72]Cox, "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results," 286.
[73]"A Mansion of Mercy," *The War Cry*, 26 November 1910, 3.
[74]"New Wing for London Hospital," *The War Cry*, 15 December 1919, 3.
[75]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 19 January 1907, 3.
[76]"A Mansion of Mercy," *The War Cry*, 26 November 1910, 3.

mothers believed to be "feebleminded." Historian James Trent explains that Josephine Shaw Lowell, an early social worker in the United States, addressed a conference on "feeblemindedness" in 1879 and proposed that within institutions "all inmates be classified according to ability and attitude."[77] In the early twentieth century, Percy Gamble Kammerer published his pioneering study, *The Unmarried Mother*, which was "particularly concerned with the accurate classification and precise definition of the nature of mental abnormality in unmarried mothers."[78] Kammerer claimed there were nineteen different types and sub-types of the "feebleminded." Doctors and social workers employed classification to facilitate care and control based on differentiation and efficiency.[79] Trent, author of *Inventing the Feeble Mind*, argues that classification served various functions in the institution. He claims that discrimination based on ability was often made to accommodate the needs of the institution."[80] He explains that "'high' grades were likely to be classified as such because of their abilities to perform complex tasks needed in the institution."[81] Whatever the rationale, the scientific method of classification was widely adopted by doctors and social workers around the turn of the twentieth century in the United States in their work with unmarried mothers, and the "feebleminded" more generally.

The Canadian Salvation Army also began to classify their patients in maternity hospitals. First, they differentiated sex workers from unmarried mothers. A 1907 *War Cry* article explained that, "Well, you see, as the term 'Maternity Hospital and Rescue Homes' implies, our inmates form two classes – maternity cases, which are girls who, through betrayal and folly, get into trouble; and rescue cases, which are girls from the streets."[82] Second, the Army categorized maternity hospital patients based on their morality and economic status. In 1909, the Army indicated that there "are four classes of women whom it is the intention to serve. There is the bad class, the poor, unfortunate, diseased and fallen, the poor

[77]Trent, *Inventing the Feeble Mind*, 74.
[78]Reekie, *Measuring Immorality*, 122.
[79]Trent, *Inventing the Feeble Mind*, 93.
[80]Ibid., 88.
[81]Ibid.
[82]"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada," *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.

married class, and the better class of patients who are able to pay for the attention received."[83]As indicated in this quote, sex workers, referred to as the “bad class,” were considered to be the most immoral and from the lowest rung of the class structure; unmarried mothers were classified as slightly above them in terms of morality and economic class status; and then there are the two more respectable classes of poor married mothers and wealthy married mothers.

The Army's adoption of classification is significant, as it further dehumanized its patients. In describing the use of the animal metaphor in processes of dehumanization, O'Brien explains that social movements often include a "scale of humanity," in which "various gradations of humans can be gauged, on the basis of racial, personal, behavioural, or other traits."[84] Thus, "even if all members of the species are accepted as human beings, some may be denied certain rights and opportunities on the basis of their placement on such a scale."[85] The Canadian Salvation Army, by classifying women based on their morality and economic class, was asserting that some women were more "human" than others. At the same time, the Army believed that all "fallen women" were capable of full reclamation. This notion of reclamation limited the degree to which their classification system can be characterized as dehumanizing, which is not to deny the existence of degradation, but to acknowledge that there were both humanizing and dehumanizing practices and ideologies at work. Classification, as an aspect of scientific research, is also linked to the object metaphor. O'Brien explains that the "feebleminded" have traditionally filled "the completely passive function of a research object."[86]

The Canadian Salvation Army also adopted the method of casework, which was adopted by professional social workers in the United States. In the early twentieth century, American social worker Mary Richmond introduced casework as the scientific procedure of investigation.[87]Kunzel explains that casework "followed a step-by-step procedure of collecting information about a client's experiences and

---

[83]"New Wing to the Grace Hospital."*The War Cry*, 4 December 1909, 6.
[84]O'Brien, *Framing the Moron*, 25.
[85]Ibid.
[86]Ibid., 145.
[87]Lubove, *The Professional Altruist*, 47.

background, or 'investigation,' followed by 'diagnosis' and 'treatment' of the client's problem."[88] Social workers began to apply this scientific method to their work with individual unmarried mothers in order to gather data on the client's social and family background, personal relationships, health and mental state.[89]

Even though the Salvation Army did not use the term, the organization began to incorporate casework into their social work as early as 1904. In rescue homes and maternity hospitals, the Army kept a "Girls' History Book," in which Officer's entered detailed information on each inmate or patient.[90] The Army referred to this book as "perhaps the most important record of each Home."[91] The Army also continued casework after their patients left their care. The Army explained that Service-Girls' Officers were employed to maintain contact with former inmates and patients who had either entered domestic service work or married. The Service-Girls' Officer kept a record of her visits with each ex-patient in what they called a "Service-Girl Officers' Diary." This information was then entered into the Girls' History Book.[92] While record keeping was a common practice in rescue homes before casework was created, the Army's documents indicate that what they engaged in was more than record keeping. Beyond noting the name and condition of a patient, along with their admission and discharge dates, they adopted such casework methods as recording descriptions of a patient's family background and conducting follow up visits after she was discharged. These suggest that the Army engaged in more than simple record keeping.

The adoption of casework also exacerbated the dehumanization of Salvation Army patients. Just like classification, casework treated unmarried mothers as objects of study. Casework could also include invasive and humiliating questioning as well as a denial of the right to confidentiality. Kunzel explains that, in American Salvation Army maternity homes, as in other evangelical maternity homes, unmarried mothers experienced casework interviews as an "invasive interrogation."[93] One unmarried mother stated,

---

[88]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 6-7.
[89]Reekie, *Measuring Immorality*, 121.
[90]Cox, "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results," 289.
[91]Ibid.
[92]Ibid.
[93]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 135.

"I've had to tell and retell my story so often, that I feel as if I'm on trial for murder."[94] Since casework involved a thorough investigation of a woman's social relationships, Kunzel indicates that social workers would often interview a woman's friends, parents, and even her employer, and in doing so disclose the plight of the unmarried mother. This constituted a breach of confidentiality as many unmarried mothers did not wish to confide their situation to others.[95] As a result, many unmarried mothers felt that social workers could not be trusted with their private information. It is possible that the Salvation Army in Canada adopted similar methods given that it, like its American counterpart, was under the guidance and subject to the direction of the main British headquarters. If so, women likely experienced some level of humiliation and/or degradation when asked to describe embarrassing details of their situations to potentially highly judgemental Army members.

Lived Experiences

In order to understand unmarried mothers' experiences in Canadian Salvation Army maternity hospitals, historians must rely on what few sources exist. There are no known written records documenting the experiences of patients in the period between 1910 and 1940, but a few exist for the 1960s, which offer a glimpse into their lives. For example, Anne Petrie wrote a memoir about her experiences as a patient in a Vancouver Salvation Army Maternity Home. Her experience began in 1967. She described it as follows:

> I had no idea where I was going when the social worker from the Vancouver Children's Aid Society called for me one rainy afternoon. By this time it was mid-March, my waistline was thickening noticeably, and I was relieved to be getting away. I had left all the arrangements to the social worker. I had not seen the Salvation Army home I would be going to. I knew nothing about it. Wanting only to get it all over with, I tried not to think about what might be waiting for me. I only knew that I was already afraid of being detected...As we drove to the south end of the city, the social worker tried to caution me. If I didn't like it there, we could find something else. Like? Not like? I couldn't take in what she was saying. What other choices were there? I walked up to the officious double-glass doors feeling the same queasiness I had felt on the Sunday morning I had first told my parents. Inside the home, the smell of over-boiled vegetables was nauseating. The brown linoleum floors and beige walls confirmed that I was in an institution. Now I was frightened. Where was I?[96]

[94]Ibid.
[95]Ibid., 136.
[96]Petrie, *Gone to an Aunt's*, 46-47.

Petrie revealed that she was taken to Maywood, the Salvation Army Maternity Home in Vancouver, built in 1959. She described the Home looking "as plain as plain could be. I saw only blank walls and dull offices. In one of these I signed in. As was the custom in all the homes, I had to give up my last name for the length of my stay. Now I would just be Anne. My only other identifying feature was my due date."[97] She also described one of the Officer's at the home, Captain Elva Jolly, who "wore a nurse's uniform that had been adapted for the home, with Army badges on the points of her starched white collar."[98] Before writing her memoir, Petrie had met with Captain Jolly and learned that Maywood had been a new assignment for her. "She had started out in the Army's B.C. Headquarters," Petrie explained, "but her friendship with a Maywood officer and early visits to the home revealed a new vocation to her – social work with young girls."[99] Captain Elva Jolly is quoted as saying, "I came in July 1964, and let me tell you, the day I got my appointment to Maywood Home, I thought I had died and gone to heaven. I really wanted to be appointed there. I really loved it."[100]

When Petrie entered the home in 1967, she was twenty years old and Captain Jolly was only eight years her senior. Petrie wrote that when they met, "I saw only the dark red-and-blue Army insignia she wore. I defined her by the roll call of rules she told me: up at seven, chapel every day, work schedules, mail times, day passes, visiting hours, and on and on."[101] Petrie was given a tour of the home and met the other girls. She recalls:

> The depression that I had fought off for weeks was gaining on me as the tour continued upstairs. Off another long hallway were bedrooms with – at four to a room – enough spots for 40 girls...There was one room with only two beds. Captain Jolly must have sensed my reaction. She told me that I could be alone there if I liked, at least for now. I couldn't wait for her to leave so I could cry. But I didn't. I just sat on the bed and stared at the brown linoleum. I couldn't imagine how I was going to pass the next endless months.[102]

While Petrie's memoir presents the experiences of only one woman, it does offer valuable information which, combined with secondary sources, can help historians understand what it was like to

---

[97]Ibid., 47.
[98]Ibid.
[99]Ibid.
[100]Ibid., 53.
[101]Ibid.
[102]Ibid., 54.

be housed in Salvation Army maternity homes and hospitals. Fear appeared to be a key element of that experience. Petrie described being fearful upon arrival: "The brown linoleum floors and beige walls confirmed that I was in an institution. Now I was frightened."[103] She also indicated that she had to deal with "depression" for several weeks leading up to her admission, and that it was 'gaining on [her]' after she had arrived.[104] Finally, after her introductory tour of the home, Petrie "couldn't wait for [the Officer] to leave so [she] could cry."[105] In *Fallen Women, Problem Girls*, Kunzel also emphasizes that women experienced fear when entering American maternity homes in the early twentieth century. As she documents, one girl, upon her arrival at a Crittenton Maternity Homes, was "nearly frightened to death."[106]

In the first chapter of this thesis, the experiences of both inmates and Officers living and working in rescue homes were explored. However, this chapter only explores the experiences of patients housed in maternity hospitals and homes, due to the absence of sources on the experiences of Officers. While the Canadian Salvation Army published several articles on the experiences of Officers working in rescue homes in *The War Cry* and other publications, the organization published nothing on Officers' experiences in maternity hospitals. This is perhaps because the Army's hospitals received much more funding than rescue homes did, and therefore the Army did not need to prove the necessity of their work in order to persuade individuals to donate.

Social Work Organizations and Journals

In addition to introducing social work concepts and methods to Canada, evangelicals also established the first Canadian social work organization and journal. The first social work organization was the Social Service Council of Canada. In 1908, under the leadership of J.G. Shearer, the Protestant churches of Canada, including the Canadian Salvation Army, joined together to form the Moral and

[103]Ibid.
[104]Ibid.
[105]Ibid.
[106]Kunzel, *Fallen Women*, 92.

Social Reform Council.[107] In 1912, the Council was reorganized as the Social Service Council of Canada.[108] This group of Protestant churches shared common social concerns that focused on children, healthcare, housing, and urban reform. They integrated morality and scientific social investigation and in 1914, sponsored the first national congress on social problems.[109] At the Council's annual meetings, a host of professionals including social workers, religious leaders, and scientists from across the country spoke on important issues. Historians Nancy Christie and Michael Gauvreau describe the Council's annual meeting in 1919:

> University of Toronto classicist and reformer C.B. Sissons spoke on housing, Dr. C.M. Hincks gave an address on mental hygiene and feeble-mindedness, J.T. Falk, the director of social work at McGill University, discussed mothers' allowances, Dr. Helen MacMurchy stressed the plight of 'defective' children, Hugh Dobson spoke on illiteracy and retardation, Charlotte Whitton addressed the problem of child welfare, Salem Bland elaborated the progressive farmers' platform, R.M. MacIver of the Department of Political Economy at the University of Toronto outlined his prescription for the democratization of industrial life, and the Rev. G.C. Pidgeon offered the keynote speech on Christ and Social Service.

The Council, while not referring to itself as a "social work" organization, was clearly promoting American social work theories and practices, as they organized scientific studies and conferences on various social problems. They also attracted many leading Canadian social workers, often Protestant as well, to speak at their meetings.[110] In this sense, the Social Service Council of Canada can be understood as the first social work institution in Canada.

In 1918, the Social Service Council of Canada also established the first social work journal in Canada titled *Social Welfare.* The Council published the journal monthly. It was conceived as a publication "devoted to the interests of all forms of social betterment."[111] The original editor of the publication was John G. Shearer and the assistant editor was Charlotte E. Whitton, a prominent Canadian social worker. The journal printed articles written by religious leaders, medical doctors, and social

---

[107]"Social Gospel," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/social-gospel/ (accessed 4 March 2014).
[108]Ibid.
[109]Christie and Gauvreau, *A Full-Orbed Christianity* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1996), 109."Social Gospel," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*.
[110]Charlotte Whitton and Dr. Helen MacMurchy were both Protestant.
[111]"'Social Welfare' – Introductory," *Social Welfare*, 1, no. 1 (1 October 1918): 1.

workers. Popular contributors included Dr. C. M. Hincks, the Associate Medical Director of the Canadian National Committee for Mental Hygiene, Miss Hazel Bell, the Special Case Secretary of The Neighbourhood Workers' Association of Toronto, and Ruth Hill, Associate Field Director of the American Association for Family Social Work. The journal also reported on the annual National Conferences on Social Work held in the United States.

The journal offered a mix of religious and scientific analysis. For example, one article that exemplified this mix was titled "Unmarried Parenthood and the Social Order" and written by Charlotte E. Whitton. The article examined the rates and causes of illegitimacy in Canada. On the scientific front, it analyzed statistics, offered tables of figures, cited scientific studies, and identified "feeblemindedness" as a cause of illegitimacy. With respect to religion, the article maintained that, "Some of the most notable successes on record in Canadian social work, of redemptive work, are to the credit of Church homes. The tremendous rehabilitation in the girl's character occasioned by the re-awakening or creation perhaps of her religious instincts has been as permanent as remarkable. The whole dominating principle of Christianity itself with its wonderful message of absolute redemption for the contrite sinner and of a new life...offers to the girl...wonderful possibilities of a regained place, even in this life."[112]

The Canadian Association of Social Workers (CASW) was founded in 1926. As the Association wished to publish its own articles, it made an arrangement with the Social Service Council of Canada. Every month, articles written by Association members were featured in one section of *Social Welfare*. In October, 1926, the following statement appeared on the journal's front cover: "Announcing the opening in this paper of A Section for Social Workers. This section will be conducted by The Canadian Association of Social Workers and will be concerned with the activities and problems of the Association and matters of interest to its members."[113] The CASW section differed significantly from the evangelical section, as it promoted secular understandings of social problems and cures. Unlike the articles written by members of the Social Service Council of Canada, the CASW never mentioned God or religion. For

[112]Charlotte E. Whitton, "Unmarried Parenthood and the Social Order," *Social Welfare,* 2, no. 6 (April 1920): 223.
[113]"Front Page," *Social Welfare*, 9, no. 1 (October 1926): 1.

example, the CASW's constitution, which was published in *Social Welfare*, made no mention of God or religion:

> The Association aims to bring together professional social workers for such cooperative effort as may enable them more efficiently to carry out their ideals of service to the community. To this end the Association may seek to promote professional standards; encourage proper and adequate preparation and training; cultivate an informed public opinion which will recognize the professional and technical nature of social work; issue an official organ; maintain a professional employment service; conduct research; and carry on such other activities as it may deem appropriate.[114]

By the beginning of the 1930s, the CASW was thriving and in 1932, it established its own secular journal of social work called *The Social Worker*. By the mid-1930s, the Social Service Council of Canada, however, was experiencing a serious financial crisis and in 1939, it published its last edition of *Social Welfare*.[115]

The Medical-Scientific Community

The loss of *Social Welfare* was the first of many defeats experienced by evangelicals interested in the field of social work. Throughout the 1920s, social workers, psychiatrists, and medical practitioners formed a medical-scientific community and used the rhetoric of "science" and "secularism" to successfully assert new ways of understanding female sexual "deviants" and new methods of "treatment" based mainly on the theory of eugenics. Eugenics is the belief in the possibility of improving a human population by controlled breeding in order to increase the occurrence of desirable heritable characteristics. It was largely developed by Francis Galton in the late nineteenth century. He coined the term in 1883 to describe "the study of the agencies under social control that may improve or impair the racial qualities of future generations, either physically or mentally."[116] The theory became very popular in Britain and North America due to fears surrounding criminality, sex work, "feeblemindedness," alcoholism, and the

---

[114]"Official Announcement in Respect to the Organization of the Canadian Association of Social Workers," *Social Welfare,* 9, no. 1 (October 1926): 284.
[115]"The Future of the Social Service Council," *Social Welfare,* 15, no. 9 (June 1935): 113-121.
[116]Angus McLaren, *Our Own Master Race: Eugenics in Canada, 1885-1945* (Toronto: McClelland & Steward, 1990), 15.

"degeneration of the race."[117] Angus McLaren argues that the main supporters of eugenics in Canada were medical professionals, most notably general practitioners and social workers.[118]

While eugenics was integral to social work ideology from the beginning, including the ideology of the Salvation Army with its acceptance of the concept of "feeblemindedness," it became the mainstay of the new medical-scientific community, as they eliminated religion from their understandings of female sexual "deviants." Female sexual "deviance" was strictly understood as a hereditary biological problem which could not be cured. The medical-scientific community promoted long term institutionalization in large-scale, state run reformatories and asylums as the best way to deal with "deviants."These institutions offered very different treatment than that provided in evangelical rescue homes or maternity hospitals. There was no professional impetus to reclaim or treat patients since"[feeblemindedness] was considered a regrettable and incurable condition about which medical practitioners, both orthodox and unorthodox, could do little."[119] Instead, the medical-scientific community promoted segregation and custodial care within closed institutions for the purpose of educating the "feebleminded," with a view to making them potentially "useful" members of society. The putative "protection" of society was also taken into consideration.[120]

From the turn of the twentieth century to the 1930s, the new medical-scientific community gained significant influence. While it had worked with religious organizations to some extent throughout its infancy, it turned away from religion as it gained more widespread acceptance and declared that religion had no place in the field of social work. In a 1928 *Social Welfare* article, secular social workers explained that the field was undergoing a "gradual but persistent replacement of the church as a social agency."[121] According to secular social workers, evangelicals were unscientific and inefficient. An article

[117]Ibid.
[118]Ibid., 28.
[119]David Wright, *Downs: The History of a Disability* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 28.
[120]K. Rossiter and A. Clarkson, "Opening Ontario's 'Saddest Chapter': A Social History of the Huronia Regional Centre," *Journal of Canadian Disability Studies* 2, no. 3 (September 2013): n.p.
[121]E. D. MacPhee, "Psychology of Social Organizations," *Social Welfare*, 11, no. 2 (November 1928): 40.

in *The Social Worker* stated that "the Church" was *not* an "effective social work agency."[122] Even though some evangelical social workers held academic degrees, most probably did not. By arguing that social workers needed to be academically trained, secular social workers worked to discredit evangelical social work.

Secular social workers, as noted above, promoted the idea that religion, and God in particular, had no role in social work. This was concretely demonstrated by the expulsion of evangelicalism from the University of Toronto's University Settlement, and later, social work program.[123] The YMCA withdrew from the board of the University Settlement in 1911 at which point there was no longer an evangelical influence on the board.[124]In devising the curriculum for the University of Toronto's first social work program, the faculty decided to forgo an evangelical approach, instead choosing an idealist approach with the goal of "broadening and elevating."[125] The proposal for the program accentuated the potential of "scientific" education and mentioned nothing of religion.[126]By excluding religious training from academic social work programs, intellectuals were implicitly sending the message that the field of social work should be based purely on science.

Evangelicals sought to challenge secular social workers by continuing to argue for the importance of religion in the field. In a *Social Welfare* article, titled "The National Conference on Social Work," evangelical social workers argued that, in Canada, "the most successful and extensive social work, if not actually under the Churches, is either largely financed by them, or supported by Boards and bodies, in which they are certainly militantly present."[127] It opined that the separation of church and social work could not be "a beneficial ultimate," as "Those undertakings, which involve the relationships of human beings, and the evolution and revelation of that within Man, higher than mere matter, (soul, inspiration, fineness, ray of the infinite, - Christian or pagan, call it what one will) – these things cannot be divorced

[122] Dale, J. A. "Social Work's Coming of Age." *Social Welfare* 9, no. 3 (December 1926): 323.
[123]See Burke, *Seeking the Highest Good*.
[124]Ibid., 61.
[125]Ibid., 64.
[126]Ibid., 86.
[127]"The National Conference on Social Work," *Social Welfare*, 2, no. 9 (June 1920): 232.

from their relation to the origin of that higher element in man, without loss to the whole scheme of life, and to the successful being of the projects themselves."[128] In another article published in *Social Welfare* titled, "The Church as a Social Agency," an evangelical social worker made a similar argument. "[There] has been in the past few years a rapid multiplication of secular [social work] agencies," the author stated.[129] He asked, "In this great movement – this tidal waves of social endeavour, what is the place of the Church?"[130] His answer was as follows:

> In spite of the great development of secular agencies the Church is still strongly entrenched in this field of practical social work...The question now at issue is as to whether the time has come for the Church to surrender this function to the State or secular organizations...It is conceded by all that the Church should remain the soul and inspirational force of social work. Religion should be the spirit behind social work and it is of the highest importance that the workers should go to their work as an opportunity of service and not simply as one vocation or task. A mechanical and soulless administration is thus prevented.[131]

Despite the efforts of evangelicals to remain relevant, arguments in favour of secular, "professional" social work slowly became more accepted. Doug Owram argues that the loss of power that evangelical reformers faced due to the rise of secular, "professional" social workers was linked to larger transformations in Canadian society, which included the rise of secular academic institutions and professionalism, as well as the state's growing desire to partake in social reform work on the municipal, provincial, and federal levels.

Owram also links these changes to the emergence of social work as a secular profession. Social work had traditionally been concentrated in religiously oriented and voluntary organizations such as the YMCA as well as the various church bodies, Owram explains.[132] Toward the end of the nineteenth century, however, federal and provincials governments became interested in social reform, especially in the area of child welfare. This interest in social reform would continue to grow and, throughout the 1920s, the government would initiate social programs, such as Mothers' Pensions Acts, Workmen's

---

[128]Ibid.
[129]F. N. Stapleford, "The Church as a Social Agency," *Social Welfare*, 2, no. 6 (April 1920): 180.
[130]Ibid.
[131]Ibid. This article was written in 1920 and therefore demonstrates that the tensions between evangelical and secular social workers began during WWI and lasted until the 1930s.
[132]Ibid., 123.

Compensation Acts, and public child welfare systems.[133] Owram argues that from 1906 to 1916, the newly formed field of social science also began to encroach upon the work of evangelicals as they worked to build up authority in area social reform. In the 1920s, the field of social work grew significantly and became involved in not only child welfare, but in all aspects of urban poverty and family problems.[134] Owram argues that during the 1920s secular social workers "largely displaced the amateur while loudly proclaiming their secular nature."[135] This study argues that at least in the case of social services for female "deviants," this transition was only beginning to happen in the 1920s, and was not completed until the late 1930s or early 1940s.While differing slightly on timing, the general shift Owram describes remains recognizable and his discussion of increasing government concern with social welfare is also of value in providing a broader context for this study.

Kunzel argues that, in the United States, secular social workers promoted themselves as necessary for the efficient and scientific functioning of evangelical homes.[136] The government accepted the scientific expertise of secular social workers, and pressured evangelical maternity homes to hire a secular social worker for each of their rescue or maternity homes.[137] Once they were inside the institution, secular social workers began to make structural changes that helped to secularize the homes, and hired more secular professionals. Kunzel documents the "extent to which outside social agencies could intervene in the operations of maternity homes and the power they had acquired to enforce their own standards."[138] A Salvation Army matron in a Chicago home reported in 1937 that Salvation Army supervisors had been replaced with trained social workers.[139]WCTU rescue homes in the United States experienced similar developments.[140]

---

[133]Ibid., 108.
[134]Ibid., 123.
[135]Ibid., 122.
[136]Kunzel, *Fallen Women,* 121.
[137]Ibid.
[138]Ibid.
[139]Ibid.
[140]Ibid.

A similar pattern appears to have occurred in Canada. John Graham documents how the transition happened in an evangelical rescue home called The Haven in Toronto. The Haven opened in 1876 and, by 1937, it had become "a specialized, professional social work agency."[141] The "religiously-motivated volunteers had been replaced by professionals trained in secular social work practice."[142] The transition occurred gradually as the organization was pressured to hire non-evangelical professionals. "The increasing number of professionally trained personnel," Graham argues, "helped to spur on this more refined, secular approach to helping."[143] The first professionals to be introduced to The Haven were nurses; after 1914, they were followed by superintendents and then social workers recently graduated from the University of Toronto. "The Haven's greatest incentive to accept social work's ultimate ascendancy," Graham maintains, "came from the Federation for Community Services, a formal associative arrangement of Toronto charities, to which The Haven belonged after 1918. The Federation, which strongly encouraged the hiring of a professionally-trained social worker, influenced every aspect of The Haven's operation."[144] The new non-evangelical professionals slowly restructured the organization until it was run as a completely secular organization.

Based on the histories of the American Salvation Army and The Haven in Toronto, it can be assumed that the Canadian Salvation Army was also pressured to hire non-evangelical professionals such as nurses, superintendents, and social workers in the 1920s and 1930s. A manuscript that focused on the hospital work of the Canadian Salvation Army suggests that this assumption is accurate. Adjutant Christian E. Chapman of the Grace Hospital in Halifax explained that, during the Army's early years of rapid development, "we had not sufficient qualified Salvation Army Nurses to staff these large Hospitals entirely; some difficulty was experienced in procuring the right kind of Supervisors, as we were anxious to maintain the Army spirit in the Institutions."[145] While some Officers held degrees in social work, it is

[141]John R. Graham, "The Haven, 1878-1930: A Toronto Charity's Transition from a Religious to a Professional Ethos," *Histoire sociale-Social History* 25, no. 50 (November 1992): 306.
[142]Ibid., 283.
[143]Ibid., 301.
[144]Ibid., 302.
[145]Chapman, "Hospital Work in Canada," 420.

likely that most did not and therefore the Army would also have had to hire secular social workers as they did in the United States.

As government officials pressured rescue homes and maternity homes to hire individuals with academic degrees, the Army was forced to share control of its rescue homes with secular professionals. This transition in the Salvation Army's maternity hospital in Calgary was described as follows:

> In the early years most administrative positions at the hospital were filled by Salvation Army officers, but as the hospital grew and Salvation Army membership dwindled, many positions were filled by members of the public. However, high-ranking Salvation Army officers remained on the Board of Directors, and the Salvation Army made the final selection of the Executive Director, who was always a member of the Army.[146]

This was the beginning of the end for the dominance of evangelical social services.

While the rise to dominance of secular social work has arguably had many positive impacts upon social services in Canada, it has also negatively influenced the field. Evangelical rescue homes and hospitals were far from ideal in terms of their understanding of sex workers and unmarried mothers, as well as in their treatment of them. Viewed as sinners and victims who could be reclaimed through spiritual salvation, sex workers and unmarried mothers had to endure condescension, judgement, and sometimes abuse. But life would get a lot worse for these girls and women when the medical-scientific community of secular social workers, psychiatrists, and general practitioners began to mould the dominate discourse on female sexual "deviants." The difference lay in the balance between eugenics and humanizing religious understandings. While evangelicals adhered to some eugenic beliefs, they combined these with more humanizing understandings of sex workers and unmarried mothers as victims and as having the ability for full reclamation. The medical-scientific community's conception of female sexual "deviance" lacked these humanizing elements and relied solely on eugenic and other supposedly "objective" scientific concepts. As a result, I argue that the rise of the medical-scientific community led to an increase in the dehumanization of female sexual "deviants" in Canada, not only from 1910 to 1940, but up until the present. Between 1910 and 1940, the dehumanization of sexually errant females was

---

[146]"Salvation Army Grace Hospital (Calgary, Alta.)," *Archives Society of Alberta*, http://www.albertaonrecord.ca/salvation-army-grace-hospital-calgary-alta (accessed 18 March 2014).

increasingly manifested in three ways: the understanding of sex workers and unmarried mothers as solely biologically defective, as well as in the "treatments" which involved long-term involuntary institutionalization and surgical sterilization.

The writings of Dr. Helen MacMurchy, a leading eugenicist in Canada, published in the social work journals, *Social Welfare* and *The Social Worker*, and secondary sources on the Orillia Asylum for Idiots offer insights into the attitudes of the medical-scientific community. While *Social Welfare* was published by an evangelical organization, by 1926, members of the Canadian Association of Social Workers were contributing to it regularly, as were eugenicist doctors. The articles written by eugenicist social workers and doctors offer insight into the medical-scientific community's perceptions of sex workers and unwed mothers. In the period between 1910 and 1940, eugenic ideas about and treatments for female sexual "deviants," including sex workers and unmarried women, emerged and were popularized in Canada.

The first way in which the medical-scientific community increased the dehumanization of female sexual "deviants" was through its understanding of these girls and women as solely "feebleminded" or "mentally defective." These eugenic and psychiatric labels asserted that such women were biologically different than "normal" human beings. In 1907, Dr. Helen MacMurchy stated that "the feebleminded are difficult to define, but not difficult to recognize."[147] She claimed that they are "below those of normal, though small, intellect, but above actual imbeciles and idiots," that they "lack prudence and self-control," and "have not proper will or judgment."[148]As noted above, while the term "feebleminded" could be used to describe men and women with development disorders, it was most often used in reference to female sexual "deviants." MacMurchy supported this idea when describing the "feebleminded" as often found "in maternity hospitals."[149] In providing an example of a "feebleminded" person, she identified a woman of

[147]Helen MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1906* (Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1907), 4.
[148]Ibid.
[149]Ibid.

twenty-seven years who had four illegitimate children.[150]In 1924, Dr. Margaret Patterson described the "feebleminded" as mentally deficient and in need of institutionalization. She claimed that the "findings of a physical and mental examination of the female prostitutes who appear in our courts is not different from the findings in other countries where these examinations are made. Of 142 persons...only 11 were classified as normal mentally."[151]

By 1934, female sexual "deviants" were no longer widely understood as "feebleminded," but as "mentally defective." This shift had serious implications for how the women were viewed and treated. Dr. O. E. Rothwell of Regina published an article titled "Mental Deficiency" in which he explained that, "The subject suggested to me on which I should read a short paper was 'Feeble Mindedness'." "Let me first register an objection to this term," he continued, "as I feel it does not express the present day conception of this condition. Rather would I prefer to call the condition 'Mental Deficiency'?" He explained that, "By this we mean that the individual has been lacking since birth in some essential element of his mental make up. Feeble minded would imply that all essentials were there but weak and impaired. That is not the true state of the condition in these young people as we now consider it, and this has led to a very prevalent misconception, namely, that mental deficiency may by care and treatment be brought to a normal state of mental ability."[152] The term "mental defective" appears to have suggested an even more severe biological difference from "normal" human beings than "feeblemindedness" did.

Evangelicals initially understood sex workers and unmarried mothers as having no biological differences from others, until they accepted "feeblemindedness" to some extent in the early twentieth century. Even when they adopted the concept of "feeblemindedness," it was braided with the notion that female sexual "deviants" were also victims of evil men and that they could be fully reclaimed by God. The medical-scientific community, however, understood sex workers and unmarried mothers solely as "feebleminded" and, later, as "mentally defective." There were no additional elements in their understanding which incorporated a more humanistic approach. In this way, the medical-scientific

---

[150]Ibid.
[151]Margaret Patterson, "The Mental Defective in Court," *Social Welfare,* 6, no. 4 (January 1924): 67.
[152]O. E. Rothwell, "Mental Deficiency," *Social Welfare,* 15, no. 12 (September 1934): 60.

community's attitude toward female sexual "deviants" was highly dehumanizing. In addition, members of the community considered "feeblemindedness," and later "mental defectiveness," as incurable, which justified their strong support for the dehumanizing practice of long-term involuntary institutionalization and segregation.

In the early twentieth century, Dr. Helen MacMurchy submitted reports on "the Care of the Feebleminded in Ontario" to the provincial government. In these reports, she promoted the institutionalization of "feebleminded" women from the ages of six to forty-five.[153] In 1908, she claimed that the "only satisfactory and thorough method of dealing with the problem of the feeble-minded is to recognize mental defect in children, train them in so far as they can be taught and trained and give them all through life the care and supervision that will enable them to earn at least a part of their living, and protect them from the crimes and evils that threaten them in the outside world."[154] This, she maintained, could be achieved through "special classes in the public schools and special Institutions for those needing permanent care."[155] "These children," she explained, "should be taken charge of about the age of six or seven (which is the age of admission at most of the successful Institutions for the feeble-minded)."[156] She added that boys and girls "should be in separate buildings, or in entirely separate parts of the same building, and little children should not be with older ones. Careful classification is important."[157]These proposals relate to female sexual "deviants" since the majority of females deemed "feebleminded" were suspected of being sex workers or unmarried mothers, or else they were the children of sex workers or unmarried mothers (and expected to follow in their mother's footsteps unless intervention was sought). As time went on, the medical-scientific community began to promote longer lengths of stay in institutions. In 1924, C.M. Hincks, the secretary of the Canadian National Committee for Mental Hygiene, argued that

[153]MacMurchy, *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1907*, 3.
[154]Ibid., 29.
[155]Ibid.
[156]Ibid.
[157]Ibid., 30.

the "feebleminded" required "supervision from the cradle to the grave. As far as mentality is concerned they are always children and must be treated as such."[158]

The largest institution for the "feebleminded" in Canada was the Orillia Asylum for Idiots in Ontario. The Orillia Asylum for Idiots was opened in 1876 under the guidance of Superintendent Dr. Wallace.[159] The Asylum acquired its patients through a process of weeding out children from public schools through the use of IQ tests and transferring girls and women from rescue homes and other institutions.[160] The Asylum expanded from 175 acres in 1880 to 456 by 1911.[161] Between 1876 and 1950, Orillia accepted almost 10,000 people with intellectual disabilities, many for life.[162] Although the Asylum welcomed individuals with a wide variety of supposed developmental problems, in the early twentieth century, the majority of admissions were individuals considered to be "feebleminded."[163] The majority of these patients were children and adolescents under the age of twenty.[164]

Abuse was a common feature of institutionalization at the Orillia Asylum, as was the case in many institutions in Canada. Rossiter and Clarkson state that "financial strain, provincial neglect, chronic overcrowding and prevailing cultural attitudes of fear, abjection and the need for social isolation left people with ID (intellectual disability) in institutions vulnerable to widespread abuse."[165] Physical punishment was frequently employed. Rossiter and Clarkson explain that "Secluded areas, 'between doors' or 'cross hall' were used to hide abuses from incoming family or friends who were often abruptly escorted out of the building."[166] The abuses Rossiter and Clarkson speak of were commonly sexual in nature.[167]Scholars have documented that, in the early twentieth century, Orillia, specifically, was unsanitary and patients were neglected. Historian H. Simmons argues that "patients at Orillia were given

---

[158]C. M. Hincks, "The Mental Defective and Permanent Supervision," *Social Welfare*, 6, no. 4 (January 1924): 69.
[159]Rossiter, "Opening Ontario's 'Saddest Chapter.'"
[160]Ibid.
[161]Ibid.
[162]J. Chupik, J., and D. Wright, "Treating the 'Idiot' Child in Early Twentieth-Century Ontario. *Disability & Society 21*, no. 1 (2006): 79.
[163]Ibid.
[164]Ibid.
[165]Rossiter, "Opening Ontario's 'Saddest Chapter,'" n.p.
[166]Ibid.
[167]Ibid.

less meat, fish and poultry than those at other asylums."[168] Historian D.C. Park claims that by 1931, the conditions at Orillia were described as impoverished and unsanitary.[169]

Evangelicals never understood sex workers or unwed mothers to be incurable. Instead, they had always promoted the notion that female sexual "deviants" could be fully redeemed through spiritual salvation. This meant that, while evangelicals *did* encourage women to enter rescue homes, the average stay was six months and there were never long term stays that amounted to years. Also, women were not involuntarily committed to rescue homes. While they could be coerced by evangelicals or parents, and had little choice when they were offered one year in a rescue homes as opposed to five in jail, they could technically leave, although it could amount to homelessness or prison. These two factors, the amount of time and the limitations of freedom, are what made the medical-scientific community's institutional treatment more dehumanizing than that of evangelicals.

Along with long-term institutionalization, many members of the medical-scientific community promoted the involuntary, surgical sterilization of sex workers and unmarried mothers, perhaps the most horrific of their dehumanizing practices. Rossiter and Clarkson explain that throughout the 1920s, "the Canadian public believed that the number of people with genetic abnormalities threatened to exceed the number of people with 'normal' intelligence and thus public debate regarding the use of mandatory sterilization policies as a form of protection rather than a means of punishment arose."[170] The only provinces to pass sterilization legislation were Alberta, in 1928, and British Columbia, 1933. In 1928, the Alberta government passed the Sexual Sterilization Act which "allowed for the sterilization of inmates of mental health institutions if it could be shown that 'the patient might safely be discharged if the danger of the procreation with its attendant risk of multiplication of evil by transmission of the disability to progeny were eliminated.'"[171] The Eugenics Board was created as part of the Act, and the role of its four members was to determine if individuals should be sterilized or not. In the original legislation consent was required

[168]H. Simmons, *From Asylums to Welfare* (Toronto, ON: National Institute on Mental Retardation, 1982), 34.
[169]Rossiter, "Opening Ontario's 'Saddest Chapter,'" n.p.
[170]Ibid.
[171]Jana Grekul, Harvey Krahn and Dave Odynak, "Sterilizing the 'Feeble-minded': Eugenics in Alberta, Canada, 1929-1972," *Journal of Historical Sociology* 17, no. 4 (December 2004): 362-363.

by the patient, but in 1937, the Act was amended so that patient consent was no longer required before sterilization could take place.[172] It was not until 1972, after 2834 individuals had been sterilized, that the Act was repealed and the Eugenics Board dismantled.[173] In British Columbia, a similar Sexual Sterilization Act was passed in 1933, which also involved the creation of a Eugenics Board. The Act was repealed in 1979, "but the practice continued in the community for a number of years until the Supreme Court of Canada made a decision in E. (Mrs.) vs. Eve (1986)."[174]

It appears likely that female sexual "deviants" were a targeted group of sterilization legislation as the majority of individuals sterilized were young women labelled "mentally defective." Sociologists Jana Grekul, Harvey Krahn, and Dave Odynak show that in Alberta, women were twice as likely to be presented to the Board than men and "once presented, they were also more likely to be sterilized."[175] They also argue that the majority of patients under the age of twenty that were to be sterilized were identified as "mentally defective."[176] Since the diagnosis of "mental defective" was strongly linked to female sexual "deviance" and in particular illegitimacy, we can assume that a significant percentage of these young women were thought to be, or feared to become, sex workers or unwed mothers.[177]

While Alberta and British Columbia were the only provinces that succeeded in passing legislation, sterilization was tenaciously promoted in other provinces as well. In 1935, Dr. H.S. Atkinson, medical superintendent of The Manitoba School for Mentally Defective Persons, promoted the use of sterilization in Manitoba. He stated that, it is "generally conceded that the two most effective and practical methods of undertaking the care and control of the mentally defective today is segregation and sterilization."[178] He claimed that sterilization "is an essential part of any programme for the care and

---

[172]Ibid., 363.
[173]Ibid., 358, 364.
[174]"Sterilization Policy," *Inclusion BC*, http://www.inclusionbc.org/about-us/social-policy-positions/sterilization (accessed 4 March 2014).
[175]Grekulet. al, 373.
[176]Ibid.
[177]It has also been discovered that there were significant racial biases in sterilizations, especially toward Indigenous women.
[178]H. S. Atkinson, "The Social Control of the Feebleminded," *Social Welfare*, 15, no. 9 (June 1935): 121.

control of our feebleminded."[179] In 1936, the Lieutenant-Governor of Ontario made a "plea for sterilization" in the pages of *Social Welfare*.[180]He declared that, "there is only one way of putting an end to this baleful, underground sapping of the health and intelligence of our people. That is sterilization of the feeble-minded."[181]Manitoba and Ontario, however, never passed sterilization legislation.[182]

While there were evangelicals who agreed with sterilization and helped to promote it, the medical-scientific community introduced the idea and constituted the majority of its supporters. As stated above, eugenic beliefs were embraced by both the medical-scientific community and evangelicals, but evangelicals added to their dehumanizing eugenic beliefs, more humanizing religious notions that female sexual "deviants" were also victims and that they could be fully reclaimed in the eyes of God. In this sense, even the evangelicals who supported sterilization were less dehumanizing in their understandings of sex workers and unmarried mothers.

Conclusion

Throughout the first half of the twentieth century, the Canadian Salvation Army was instrumental in introducing social work to Canada. The Army changed its focus from sex workers to unmarried mothers who were understood to be more willing to accept help and easier to "save." Despite the fact that the categories of "sex worker" and "unwed mother" could overlap, the Army nonetheless made a distinction between the two, while understanding both as victims and sinners. The Army also incorporated the concept of "feeblemindedness" and the practices of classification and casework, promoted by American social workers. These did not replace traditional religious understandings and methods, but were braided in with them. This braiding resulted in an increased dehumanization of female sexual "deviants" as they were understood to have biological defects and were treated as objects of study. Inmates and patients were not fully dehumanized, however, due to the humanizing religious understandings of female sexual "deviants" which remained. Despite the scientific and professional

---

[179]Ibid.
[180]Lieutenant-Governor of Ontario, "Sterilization and Imbecility," *Social Welfare,* 16, no. 12 (September 1936): 95.
[181]Ibid.
[182]McLaren does show, however, that hundreds of people were nonetheless sterilized in Ontario.

evolution of evangelical social services, they became devalued with the rise of a medical-scientific community, which argued that religion had no role in the treatment of female sexual "deviants." This new community, which claimed to adhere to strictly scientific understandings and treatments, battled evangelicals for dominance and ultimately succeeded by 1940.

Conclusion

The rise of social work in Canada was neither a secular initiative nor a straight-forward and uncontested feat of progress. In its early years, 1886 to 1911, the Canadian Salvation Army focused on redeeming "fallen women" in a home-like atmosphere. The Army understood "fallen women" as victims and sinners who were living shameful, ruined lives, but could be fully reclaimed through salvation. The Army built fourteen rescue homes across Canada which all sought to convert their inmates to Christianity. Secondary goals included teaching discipline and assisting women to find work and a place to live, preferably with family, friends, or through marriage. In order to achieve these goals the homes taught inmates Salvationist theology and domestic skills such as cooking, cleaning and sewing in order to help the women get jobs as domestic servants or to prepare them for marriage. Their understandings and methods were not motivated by a desire to morally regulate working-class women, as some historians have argued previously, but were founded upon genuine religious beliefs.[1]

In the early twentieth century, evangelicals were influenced by the creation of social work in the United States and largely introduced social work to Canada, making evangelicals some of the first social workers in the country. The Canadian Salvation Army incorporated the American social work theory of "feeblemindedness" and the methods of classification and casework into their work with female sexual "deviants." These new methods were integrated into their older methods as well as their evangelical discourse. In Canada, evangelical social workers also established the first social work organization, The Social Service Council of Canada, and the first social work journal, *Social Welfare*. The Army's adoption of American social work methods and theories problematizes the assumption, which animates much of the existing historical literature, that there existed a clear binary between religion and science in the field of Canadian social work.

---

[1]See Mariana Valverde, *The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc., 1991); Carolyn Strange, *Toronto's Girl Problem: The Perils and Pleasures of the City, 1880-1930* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995).

In the 1920s, evangelical social workers began to face competition in their field from secular social workers. Evangelical and secular social workers utilized the same scientific concepts and methods; the only striking difference between the two was the role of God and the notion of reclamation in their work. As secular social workers began to distance themselves from evangelicals and claim that religion should not be involved within scientific treatment, the two groups of social workers battled for dominance. By 1940, secular social workers had come out on top. Government officials had been persuaded that the care of sex workers and unmarried mothers belonged to members of the medical-scientific community. With this transition of power, the dehumanization of female sexual "deviants" increased. While evangelicals braided eugenic understandings with humanizing religious understandings, the medical-scientific community relied solely on eugenic and other supposedly "objective" scientific concepts. They understood sex workers and unmarried mothers as "mental defectives" who could not be cured or reclaimed, and advocated involuntary institutionalization and sterilization, which continued in British Columbia until 1986. Yet much of this history has been suppressed in favour of presenting social work as a progressive field, a field which replaced religious and backward volunteers with secular and scientific professionals. This thesis complicates progressive narratives within the historiography of social work, and offers a contribution to the critical re-assessment of the field's historical and contemporary effects. It also contributes to our understanding of the "secularization debate" – further nuancing the existing literature on the timeframe and nature of "secularization."

This thesis will conclude with a brief discussion of the continued negative impact of “scientific” discourses on female sexual “deviants,” and as well as with a brief discussion of the role that religious organizations, such as the Salvation Army, continue to play in Canadian social service work, although under the control of a secular state.

The Scientific Construction of Female “Deviance” Today

Today, the sterilization of the "mentally defective" is no longer legal, but the dehumanization of sexually errant females continues through psychological diagnoses that present such individuals as

biologically inferior and allows for their forced institutionalization. There is no longer just one dehumanizing psychological diagnosis targeting sexually "deviant" women; there is a large text filled with them called the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM). "Feeblemindedness" has been replaced with a host of disorders just as unfounded and eugenic, but supported just as strongly as "feeblemindedness" once was. One such example of the pathologizing of women's sexual "deviance" is borderline personality disorder. Psychologists Randy A. Sansone and Lori A. Sansone explain that,

> According to the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders*, various forms of impulsivity are associated with borderline personality disorder, including sexual impulsivity. The existing empirical literature indicates that patients with borderline personality disorder appear to differ from patients without this personality disorder in a number of relevant ways. Specifically, those with borderline personality disorder are more likely to exhibit greater sexual preoccupation, have earlier sexual exposure, engage in casual sexual relationships, report a greater number of different sexual partners as well as promiscuity, and engage in homosexual experiences. In addition, patients with borderline personality disorder appear to be characterized by a greater number of high-risk sexual behaviors; a higher likelihood of having been coerced to have sex, experiencing date rape, or being raped by a stranger; and the contraction of more sexually transmitted diseases. Overall, the psychological themes relating to sexual behavior in borderline personality disorder appear to be characterized by impulsivity and victimization.[2]

Therefore, women can be diagnosed as being mentally ill if they exhibit sexual preoccupation, start having sex at a young age, have a large number of sexual partners, or engage in homosexual relations. The part of the diagnostic criteria which targets sex workers perhaps most specifically is the appearance of "high-risk sexual behaviour," which includes the act of selling one's body for money, and contracting sexually transmitted diseases. By including "high-risk sexual behaviour" as diagnostic criteria, the act of engaging in sex work alone can label one as having borderline personality disorder.

These unfounded psychiatric diagnoses directed toward female sexual "deviants" are not just offensive, they are also dehumanizing as they claim that a patient's behaviour and/or emotions are due to a biological, genetic defect – most often a chemical imbalance. In 1997, renowned American psychologist E. Fuller Torrey stated that, "It has now been established that severe mental illnesses...are neurobiological disorders of the brain. These illnesses are thus in the same category as other brain disorders such as Parkinson's disease, Alzheimer's disease, and multiple sclerosis."[3] This notion of mental illness as

---

[2]Randy A. Sansone and Lori A. Sansone, "Sexual Behaviour in Borderline Personality," *Innovations in Clinical Neuroscience*, 8, no. 2 (February 2011): 14.

[3]E. Fuller Torrey, *Out of the Shadows: Confronting America's Mental Illness Crisis* (New York: John Wiley, 2007), 5.

biological defect has become hegemonic. Psychologists Boydell, Gladstone and Crawford argue in *Community Mental Health in Canada* that the biological model is "so ingrained in our thinking as to be almost invisible. We often use it implicitly, without conscious thought, and allow it to shape our research and practice."[4]

Despite the widespread acceptance of mental illness as a biological defect in public discourse, there are major debates among scholars as to whether or not this is so. Many renowned psychologists argue that the notion of mental illness as a biological defect is pushed despite a lack of evidence.[5] Perhaps the best example of this is the notion that depression is a result of a chemical imbalance in the brain. Elliot Valenstein, a professor of psychology and neuroscience at the University of Michigan, states in his book, *Blaming the Brain,* that "there is no convincing evidence that depressed people have a serotonin or norepinephrine deficiency."[6] The issue of mental illness as biological defect is therefore quite complex. This is not to question the legitimacy of people's emotional suffering and the existence of depression symptoms, but to question how such ailments are represented and what impact this has on both doctors and patients.

Beyond psychiatric diagnoses, female sexual "deviants" are also dehumanized today through involuntary admission to psychiatric facilities. In Canada, mental health care is a provincial jurisdiction.[7] Each province and territory has a Mental Health Act which allows for the involuntary admission of an individual to a psychiatric facility. While the criterion for involuntary admission differs from province to province, it remains fairly similar across the country. Each Mental Health Act makes reference to an individual's "safety," "protection," or "harm" to themselves or others as a basis for involuntary admission. For example, the standard for involuntary admission in Ontario is 'physical danger', in the Yukon and the Northwest Territories it is 'serious bodily harm', in Prince Edward Island it is 'safety', and in Alberta it is

---

[4]Simon Davis, *Community Mental Health in Canada: Policy, Theory and Practice* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006), 20.
[5]Bruce Levine, "7 Reasons Why I Became a Dissident Psychologist," 6 January 2012. http://brucelevine.net/7-reasons-why-i-became-a-dissident-psychologist/ (accessed 27 December 2013).
[6]Elliot S. Valenstein, *Blaming the Brain: The Truth and Drugs and Mental Health* (New York: The Free Press, 1988), 15.
[7]Davis, *Community Mental Health,* 273.

'danger'.[8] Manitoba, Saskatchewan and British Columbia also include prevention of "mental or physical deterioration as a basis for involuntary hospitalization."[9] Some jurisdictions also define or qualify their committal criterion in more depth, but in most, it remains unqualified. Even with some further qualification, the criterion is ambiguous and broad.[10]

Since this conclusion cannot explain each province's Mental Health Act, it will explore British Columbia's in order to demonstrate the injustices of the Canadian-wide system. Psychiatrist Muriel Groves wrote a paper in 2011 for the BC Civil Liberties Association titled, "Suggested Changes to BC's Mental Health System regarding Involuntary Admission and Treatment in Non-Criminal Cases." Groves explains that in BC, "only one person – the director or authorized physician – is needed to certify a person for involuntary admission and treatment. This certification can occur without the director or certified physician even personally examining or observing the person: the decision can be based solely on collateral information such as the opinions of others."[11] She adds that, "neither mentally capable patients (estimated to be a sizeable minority of those involuntary admitted and treated), previously patient-designated substitute decision makers (SDMs) nor close family members of incapable people have the right to consent to or refuse the involuntary admission or treatment of the patient; it is solely the physician's decision."[12] Groves further maintains that, "the admission decision by the authorized physician is based on the doctor's interpretation of the broad and imprecise criteria for involuntary admission laid out in the BC Mental Health Act (MHA)5 and in the legal precedent *McCorkell v. Director of Riverview Hospital*."[13] The criteria is threefold: "i) protection from (bodily) harm to self and others, ii) prevention of substantial physical and mental deterioration and iii) prevention of harm in terms of social, family, work and financial relations."[14] Such a system, Groves highlights, allows for the

[8]Ibid.
[9]Ibid., 274.
[10]Ibid., 275.
[11]Muriel Groves, "Suggested Changes to BC's Mental Health System regarding Involuntary Admission and Treatment in Non-Criminal Cases," Position Paper of the BC Civil Liberties Association, February 2011, 2.
[12]Ibid.
[13]Ibid.
[14]Ibid.

unnecessary confinement of individuals and breaches human rights legislation. It is this unnecessary confinement of individuals along with stigmatizing diagnoses that continue the degradation and dehumanization of female sexual "deviants" today.

The Role of Religious Organizations in Contemporary Social Services

Since the 1940s, the Canadian Salvation Army has continued to provide social services for female sexual "deviants," which have both similarities and differences to their earlier work. In the 1950s and 1960s, many Salvation Army maternity hospitals for unwed mothers became general hospitals with Salvation Army Officers on the Board of Directors, or were closed down in the 1980s and 1990s. In 1975, the Army's Grace Hospital in Saskatoon was closed and in 1999, their Grace Maternity Hospital in Ottawa closed. The Army's Grace maternity hospital in Halifax merged with the Izaak Walton Killam Hospital for Children in 1996 to become the IWK Grace Hospital for Women, Children and Families. In 2001, however, the Salvation Army ended its involvement with the hospital. There are some exceptions to this trend. For example, the Army's maternity hospital in Toronto was designated a general hospital in 1969, but continues to be managed by the Army. The Grace Hospital in Calgary closed its maternity program in 1966, but also continues under the guidance of the Army.

Today, the Canadian Salvation Army does not run any maternity hospitals for unmarried mothers. They do, however, run Bethany Homes for homeless teenage girls. The first Bethany Home was built in Saskatoon in 1938 and functioned as a home and hospital for single mothers. In 1975, the hospital section was closed and the home became a transitional unit for teenage girls.[15] The website for the Bethany Home in Saskatoon describes the program as follows:

> Bethany Home is a transitional unit for girls ages 13 – 18 years. The girls are referred to Bethany by their Family Service Worker and are normally expected to stay at Bethany Home for a period of 3 or 4 months while their worker creates a plan for them to return home or move on to a long term program in the community.
>
> Many of the girls that are referred to Bethany Home are at risk in their own homes or in the community. They may come to the home with addictions to drugs or alcohol, or have been abused sexually or

[15]"A little bit about us..." *The Salvation Army Bethany Home*, http://www.bethanyhome.ca/About%20Us.html (acessed 18 March 2014).

> physically and they are often experiencing difficulty in school and may have been involved in illegal activities. Some are connected to gangs or being targeted by gangs.
>
> The girls are expected to participate in school while they reside at Bethany Home or a program of equal value. They are also encouraged to be involved in extracurricular activities such as soccer, dance, music etc.
>
> Spiritual Care Programming and Art Therapy are provided twice a week and we always makes every effort to address cultural needs of the residents of the home.
>
> While at Bethany Home the girls are given the opportunity to learn life skills in a structured environment such as cooking, planning healthy meals, laundry and personal hygiene. They also have the opportunity to learn to make healthy choices and how to deal with conflict and crisis situations.[16]

A website called OpenCharity states that the Salvation Army Saskatoon Bethany Home is designated as a "Charitable Organization" and its category is listed as "Providing care, no treatment."[17] The program description is as follows:

> licensed as a residential service facility under residential care homes, providing the following services for a maximum of ten residents at any given time: primary services are: -emergency receiving services for girls between the ages of 13-18 years of age, who are identified as clients of the ministry. –Residential support for youth 16 and 17 years of age. Secondary services are: - residential support services, in a home-like atmosphere, for young women and teens requiring a supportive environment during pregnancy, post natal, and/or while parenting.

Clearly, there are strong similarities between Bethany Homes and older Salvation Army rescue homes and maternity hospitals for unwed mothers. Like older homes, the Bethany Home provides a highly structured and monitored routine within a home-like atmosphere. It also teaches domestic skills, such as cooking and laundry, as well as religious doctrine. The operation of Bethany Homes demonstrates that, while evangelical resources for sexually errant females lost their dominant position by 1940, they have continued to operate throughout Canada, founded upon their original ideologies and utilizing many of their original methods.

Since the rise of the medical scientific community, however, there have been significant changes to the Army's homes for girls and women. For example, they must adhere to modern provincial legislation regarding residential care or residential service facilities. The licensing of these facilities is the prerogative of a province's Ministry of Health. The regulations include application procedures, policy

---

[16]Ibid.

[17]"The Salvation Army Saskatoon Bethany Home," *OpenCharity*, http://www.opencharity.ca/charity/107951618RR 0218 (accessed May 8 2014).

requirements, health and safety provisions, specific building requirements, as well as staffing and management requirements.[18] The Bethany Home in Saskatchewan is considered a residential service facility and is licensed and regulated by the Residential Services Act.[19] Consultants visit the homes to do pre-licensing inspections, conduct operational reviews, investigate complaints, provide coaching or teaching, and to check up on things more generally. Most visits are unannounced.[20]

Modern restrictions also include resident rights and privileges. All residents of residential care facilities have the following rights and privileges, as mandated by government policy:

> to be treated with kindness and respect by you, your staff, and other people in your home;
> - to tell you about any concerns or recommend changes to your rules or services;
> -to be able to complain to you without being afraid of repercussions, or to anyone else they choose, including staff from Saskatchewan Health if they are not satisfied with things in the home;
> -to attend their own religious services;
> -to have privacy;
> -to use their own belongings, and to have others use them only if they give them permission;
> -to communicate within the home by telephone or mail in private;
> -to have visitors between 9 a.m. and 9 p.m. without having to make any arrangements ahead of time;
> -to come and go as they like, providing they let you know when they leave and when they will return;
> -to be free from any physical punishment, threats, or abuse from you, your staff, or other people in your home; and
> -to choose their own physician, dentist, optometrist, or other health care professional.[21]

Another change in Army services is that the modern Bethany Homes are not considered a "treatment" or "cure," but "care" or a "transitional unit." This highlights the rise of Western medicine as a hegemonic ideology. No longer is female sexual "deviance" an issue of Christian morality, but a medical issue which can only be "treated" by secular, Western doctors. Drugs and psychotherapy have replaced the Bible as "cure."

These changes in the Army's power, both discursively and practically, demonstrates the broader trend of increased government oversight and control of faith-based social services. As briefly explained

---

[18]"Residential Care," British Columbia Ministry of Health, http://www.health.gov.bc.ca/ccf/adult_care.html (accesssed 8 May 2014).
[19]*OpenCharity*
[20]*Licensee's Handbook*, Government of Saskatchewan Ministry of Health, March 2004, 12.
[21]*Licensee's Handbook*, 84.

above, beginning in the 1940s, the government became increasingly involved with the provision of social services. The responsibility for social services became the prerogative of the provincial government for the most part, although some social services continued under the jurisdiction of private or church organizations. In many cases these organizations received, and continue to receive, financing from government bodies. In some jurisdictions these organizations have essentially been taken over by the government; in others, they have been maintained, although they must operate under the mandates legislated by their provincial government.[22] Stricter guidelines and restrictions have not stopped the Army, or other evangelical organizations, in its goal of providing social services. Today, the Army boasts that it is Canada's largest non-governmental direct provider of social services.[23] According to James R. Vanderwoerd, a professor of social work, "religious organizations constitute between 20-40% of all charitable organizations and are clearly one of the single largest categories among all charitable nonprofit organizations in Canada."[24] Despite their significant role in Canada's social service sector, "discussion of the role of faith-based organizations and their relationship with government in the provision of social services is downplayed or even ignored [by scholars]."[25]

In the early-twentieth century, the intersections of religion and secular social work were more complex than much of the historiographical literature suggests. While early social work is often presented as being a secular field introduced to Canada by social scientists, it was, in fact, introduced by evangelicals as part of their evangelical mission. Literature which dismisses the role of religion and acts as a triumphal secular narrative not only presents inaccurate historical understandings, but perpetuates the hegemonic notion of rational secular science as progress and lacks critical analysis of the field of social work. It is important that scholars consider the dangers of such narratives and seek to further uncover the complexities of both "secularization" and the growth of social services. There is also more work to be

---

[22]Jim Albert and Bill Kirwin, "Social and Welfare Services, "The Canadian Encyclopedia (15 December 2013) http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/social-and-welfare-services/ (accessed 8 May 2014).

[23]*Consolidated Financial Statements of The Governing Council of The Salvation Army in Canada* (Toronto: The Salvation Army Canada and Bermuda Territory, 2013), 5.

[24]J. R. Vanderwoerd, "Threat from the South: Is American Religion Bad news for Canadian Social Welfare?"*Critical Social Work* 7, no.1 (2006): 7.

[25]Ibid.

done on the role that both religion and science continue to play today in the field of social work, and in the lives of women deemed "deviant."

Bibliography

Primary Sources

***War Cry* Articles:**

"A Mansion of Mercy."*The War Cry*, 26 November 1910, 3.

"A Morning with Mrs. Coombs."*The War Cry*, 10 April 1909, 8 and 22.

"Brief Summary of the Year's Work."*The War Cry*, 1897. (Clipping from Canadian Salvation Army Archives)

"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada." *The War Cry*, 12 January 1907, 3.

"Mrs. Coombs on Women's Rescue Work in Canada." *The War Cry*, 19 January 1907, 3.

"New Maternity Hospital at Calgary."*The War Cry*, 10 April 1926, 7.

"New Wing for London Hospital."*The War Cry*, 15 December 1919, 3.

"New Wing to the Grace Hospital."*The War Cry*, 4 December 1909, 6.

"Opening of Ottawa Rescue Home and Children's Shelter."*The War Cry*, 22 December 1894, 2.

"Ottawa's New Rescue Home."*The War Cry*, 29 December 1894, 5.

"Our Rescue Home."*The War Cry*, 24 December 1887, 1.

"Police Court Work in Toronto." *The War Cry*, 19 December 1908, 3-4.

"Rescue Notes."*The War Cry*, 22 September 1888, 5.

"Rescue Story."*The War Cry*, 11 October 1890, 4.

"Salvation for Body and Soul: A Rescue Home Visit." *The War Cry*, 4 January 1896, 4.

"Sketch of Our Rescue Institutions and Matrons."*The Easter War Cry*, April 1904, 10.

"The Authorities and Army Homes."*The War Cry*, 20 February 1909, 16.

"The General Reviews the Social Operations of the Salvation Army in the Royal Albert Hall." *The War Cry*, 19 June 1909, 9.

"The Halifax Maternity Hospital."*The War Cry*, 15 November 1919.

"The Ottawa Maternity Hospital: Description of the Building and Grounds." *The War Cry*, 11 March 1922.

"The Rescue Homes."*The War Cry*, 30 June 1888, 2.

"The Women's Social Work."*The War Cry*, 24 September 1910, 9.

"White Slavery: Girls Decoyed from New York for Immoral Purposes." *The War Cry*, 27 July 1907, 14.

"Why Should We Dress Plain." *The War Cry*, 11 October 1890, 14.

"Women's Social Work."*The War Cry*, 1 May 1909, 12.

Canadian Salvation Army Documents:

Boniface, Doris N.I. Letter to Colonel Mabel H. Crolly, 20 October 1966, found randomly on shelf, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Booth, William. *In Darkest England and the Way Out*. London: International Headquarters of the Salvation Army, 1890.Chapman, Christian E. "Hospital Work in Canada." 1937. Women Hospital Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Clipping of newspaper article, unknown source, unknown date, Women Hospital London folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Cox, Adelaide. "Methods of the Women's Social Work in Relation to Permanent Results."In *International Staff Councils Addresses*, 1904. Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Booth, William. "What Should A Rescue Officer Be?" *The Deliverer*, 1 July 1889, p. 7. Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Dean, Mary Morgan. *The Lady with the Other Lamp: The Story of Blanche Read Johnston*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1919.

Fair Canada's Dark Side ! Being a Description of the Canadian Rescue Work, and of The Children's Shelter; Containing also Startling Statistics and Accounts of Sights and Scenes as Witnessed by Our Rescue Officers. Toronto: The Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, 1892.

"Love Did It." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Sin-Chains Riven, A Description of Women and Children's Social Work in Canada, North-West America and Newfoundland. Toronto: The Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, 1896.

"Staff Handbook: The Salvation Army Park Wood House." found randomly on shelf, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

The Canadian Advance Being a Record of Progress of Work of the Salvation Army in the Dominion of Canada During the Year 1886. Toronto: Commissioner

Headquarters Salvation Temple, 1887.

"The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1900." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

"The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1904." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

"The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1907." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

"The Salvation Army – Women's Social Work: Rescue Work 1911." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Incomplete photocopies from a book titled, *The Unknown Half*, of the chapter titled "Sisters of Sorrow." Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

"Two Incidents From Toronto." Clipping from *War Cry*. Rescue Work Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

Untitled Manuscript. Grace Index Binder, Grace Hospital Box, Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

"'Within Rescue Doors': Being The Annual Report of The Women's Social Work of The Salvation Army Under the Direction of Mrs. Bramwell Booth together with Statistics and Statement of Accounts." Rescue Homes Folder, Canadian Salvation Army Archives. Scarborough, ON.

***Social Welfare* Journal Articles:**

"A Word from the Chairman."*Social Welfare* 9, no. 2 (November 1926): 308.

Atkinson, H.S. "The Social Control of the Feebleminded." *Social Welfare* 15, no. 9 (June 1935): 121-123.

Dale, J. A. "Social Work's Coming of Age." *Social Welfare* 9, no. 3 (December 1926): 323-325.

"Front Page." *Social Welfare* 9, no. 1 (October 1926): 1.

Hincks, C. M. "The Mental Defective and Permanent Supervision."*Social Welfare* 6, no. 4 (January 1924): 69-70.

Lieutenant-Governor of Ontario."Sterilization and Imbecility."*Social Welfare* 16, no. 12 (September 1936): 95-97.

MacPhee, E. D. "Psychology of Social Organizations." *Social Welfare* 11, no. 2 (November 1928): 40-42.

"Official Announcement in Respect to the Organization of the Canadian Association of

Social Workers."*Social Welfare* 9, no. 1 (October 1926): 284-302.

Patterson, Margaret. "The Mental Defective in Court."*Social Welfare* 6, no. 4 (January 1924): 67-68.

Rothwell, O.E. "Mental Deficiency." *Social Welfare* 15, no. 12 (September 1934): 60-65.

"'Social Welfare' – Introductory."*Social Welfare* 1, no. 1 (1 October 1918): 1.

Stapleford, F.N. "The Church as a Social Agency." *Social Welfare* 2, no. 6 (April 1920): 180-182.

"The Future of the Social Service Council."*Social Welfare* 15, no. 9 (June 1935): 113-121.

"The National Conference on Social Work."*Social Welfare* 2, no. 9 (June 1920): 232-233.

Whitton, Charlotte E. "Unmarried Parenthood and the Social Order."*Social Welfare* 2, no. 6 (April 1920): 184-223.

***The Social Worker* Journal Articles:**

Isserman, Betty. "The Casework Relationship in Work with Unmarried Mother" *The Social Worker* 17, no. 1 (October 1948):12-17.

Webb, Mary. "Treatment of the Delinquent Girl in England" *The Social Worker* 15, no. 3 (February 1947): 30-32.

Helen MacMurchy Reports:

MacMurchy, Helen. *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1906*. Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1907.

MacMurchy, Helen. *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1907*. Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1908.

MacMurchy, Helen. *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1908*. Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1909.

MacMurchy, Helen. *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1909*. Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1910.

MacMurchy, Helen. *Report Upon The Care of the Feeble-Minded in Ontario 1910*. Toronto: Warwick Bros & Rutter Limited, 1911.

Other:

"A Refuge for Girls: The Noble Work Carried on by the Salvation Army." *The Globe*. Thursday November 1 1888.

Secondary Sources

Agnew, Elizabeth N. *From Charity to Social Work: Mary E. Richmond and the Creation of an American Profession*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2004.

Alexander, Ruth M. *The Girl Problem: Female Sexuality Delinquency in New York, 1900-1930*. New York: Cornell University Press, 1995.

Allen, Richard. *The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada 1914-1928*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971.

Ashley, Stephen M. "The Salvation Army in Toronto, 1882-1896." M.A. thesis, University of Guelph, 1969.

Backhouse, Constance. *Petticoats and Prejudice: Women and Law in Nineteenth-Century Canada*. Toronto: Women's Press for the Osgoode Society, 1991.

Bebbington, David W. "The Holiness Movements in British and Canadian Methodism in the Late Nineteenth Century." *Proceedings of the Wesley Historical Society* 50, no. 6 (1996): 203-228.

Brown, Arnold. *"What Hath God Wrought?": The History of The Salvation Army in Canada: 1882-1914*. Toronto: Salvation Army Printing, 1952.

Burke, Sara Z. *Seeking the Highest Good: Social Service and Gender at the University of Toronto, 1888-1937*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.

Chambers, Lori. *Misconceptions:Unmarried Motherhood and the Ontario Children of Unmarried Parents Act, 1921-1969*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2007.

Christie, Nancy and Michael Gauvreau, eds. *A Full-Orbed Christianity: The Protestant Churches and Social Welfare in Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1996.

Chupik, J., and D. Wright. "Treating the 'Idiot' Child in Early Twentieth-Century Ontario." *Disability& Society 21*, no. 1 (2006): 77-90.

Cohen, Patricia Cline. *The Murder of Helen Jewett: The Life and Death of a Prostitute in Nineteenth-Century New York*. New York: Vintage Books, 1998.

Connelly, Mark T. *The Response to Prostitution in the Progressive Era*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1980.

Consolidated Financial Statements of The Governing Council of The Salvation Army in Canada. Toronto: The Salvation Army Canada and Bermuda Territory, 2013.

Cook, Ramsay. *The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985.

Cook, Sharon Anne. "'Do not ... do anything that you cannot unblushingly tell your mother': Gender and Social Purity in Canada." *Histoire sociale/Social History* 30

(November 1997): 215-39.

Cook, Sharon Anne. *"Through Sunshine and Shadow": The Woman's Christian Temperance Union, Evangelicalism, and Reform in Ontario, 1874-1930*. McGill-Queen's University Press, 1995.

Davis, Simon. *Community Mental Health in Canada: Policy, Theory and Practice*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006.

Dubinsky, Karen. "Afterward: Telling Stories about Dead People." In Franca Iacovetta and Wendy Mitchinsin, eds., *On The Case: Explorations in Social History*, 359-366. Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1999.

Dubinsky, Karen. *Improper Advances: Rape and Heterosexual Conflict in Ontario, 1880-1929*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993.

Eason, Andrew Mark. *Women in God's Army: Gender and Equality in the Early Salvation Army*. Waterloo: Wilfrid University Press, 2003.

Forseille, Ashley. "'Reading Love Between the Lines': Religion, Courtship, and Correspondence in the Salvation Army, 1906-1910." M.A. thesis, University of Victoria, 2012.

Gariepy, Henry. *Christianity in Action: The International History of the Salvation Army*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdman's Publishing Co., 2009.

Gidney, Catherine. *A Long Eclipse: The Liberal Protestant Establishment and the Canadian University, 1920-1970*. London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004.

Graham, John R. "The Haven, 1878-1930: A Toronto Charity's Transition from a Religious to a Professional Ethos."*Histoire sociale-Social History* 25, no. 50 (November 1992): 283-306.

Gray, James H. *Red Lights on the Prairies*. Toronto: MacMillian of Canada, 1971.

Green, Roger J. "William Booth's Theology of Redemption." *Christian History* 26 (1990): 1-5.

Grekul, Jana, Harvey Krahn and Dave Odynak. "Sterilizing the 'Feeble-minded': Eugenics in Alberta, Canada, 1929-1972." *Journal of Historical Sociology* 17, no. 4 (December 2004): 358-384.

Groves, Muriel. "Suggested Changes to BC's Mental Health System regarding Involuntary Admission and Treatment in Non-Criminal Cases." Position Paper of the BC Civil Liberties Association, February 2011.

Haslam, Nick. "Dehumanization: An Integrative Review". *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 10, no. 3 (2006): 252-264.

Hattersley, Roy. *Blood and Fire: William and Catherine Booth and Their Salvation Army*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1999.

Higginbotham, Ann R. "Respectable Sinners: Salvation Army Rescue Work with Unmarried Mothers, 1884-1914." In *Religion in the Lives of English Women, 1760-1930,* ed. Gail Malmgreen, 216-234. London: Croom Helm, 1986.

Hill, Marilynn Wood. *Their Sisters' Keepers: Prostitution in New York City, 1830-1870*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

Horridge, Glenn K. *The Salvation Army: Origins and Early Days: 1865-1900*. Rochester: Ammonite Books, 1993.

Jennissen, Therese and Colleen Lundy.*One Hundred Years of Social Work: A History of the Profession in English Canada, 1900-2000*. Toronto: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2011.

Kennedy, Angie C. "Eugenics, 'Degenerate Girls,' and Social Workers During the Progressive Era."*Journal of Women and Social Work* 23, no. 1 (February 2008): 22-37.

Kunzel, Regina G. *Fallen Women, Problem Girls: Unmarried Mothers and the Professionalization of Social Work, 1890-1945*. Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1995.

Leigh, Carol. *Unrepentant Whore: Collected Works of Scarlot Harlot*. San Francisco: Last Gasp, 2004.

Levine, Bruce. "7 Reasons Why I Became a Dissident Psychologist". 6 January 2012. http://brucelevine.net/7-reasons-why-i-became-a-dissident-psychologist/. (Accessed 27 December 2013).

Lubove, Roy. *The Professional Altruist: The Emergence of Social Work as a Career, 1880-1930.* New York: Harvard University Press, 1973.

Magnuson, Norris. *Salvation in the Slums: Evangelical Social Work, 1865-1920.* Metuchen, N.J.: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1977.

Marks, Lynne. *Revivals and Roller Rinks: Religion, Leisure, and Identity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Small-Town Ontario*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.

Marks, Lynne. "'The 'Hallelujah Lasses': Working-Class Women in the Salvation Army in English Canada, 1882-1892," in *Gender Conflicts: New Essays in Women's History*, ed. Franca Iacovetta and Mariana Valverde (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992), 67-117.

Marshall, David B. *Secularizing the Faith: Canadian Protestant Clergy and the Crisis of Belief, 1850-1940*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992.

McKinley, E. H. *Marching to Glory: The History of the Salvation Army in the United States, 1880-1992*. Cambridge: William B. Eerdman'sPublishing Company, 1995.

McLaren, Angus. *Our Own Master Race: Eugenics in Canada, 1885-1945*. Toronto: McClelland & Steward, 1990.

Mitchinson, Wendy. "The YWCA and Reform in the Nineteenth Century." *Histoire Sociale/Social History* 12, no. 24 (1979): 368-384.

Moyles, R. G. *The Blood and Fire in Canada: A History of the Salvation Army in the Dominion, 1882-1976*. Toronto: Peter Martin Associates Limited, 1977.

Murdoch, Norman H. *Origins of the Salvation Army*. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1994.

Myers, Tamara. *Caught: Montreal's Modern Girls and the Law, 1869-1945*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006.

Noll, Mark A. *The Rise of Evangelicalism: the Age of Edwards, Whitefield and the Wesleys*. Inter-Varsity, 2004.

Noll, Steven. *Feeble-Minded in Our Midst: Institutions for the Mentally Retarded in the South, 1900-1940*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1995.

O'Brien, Gerald V. *Framing the Moron: The Social Construction of Feeble-mindedness in the American Eugenics Era*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013.

Odem, Mary E. *Delinquent Daughters: Protecting and Policing Adolescent Female Sexuality in the United States, 1885-1920*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1995.

Orsi, Robert A. "Untitled." In *Proceedings: First Biennial Conference on Religion and American Culture*, eds. Philip Goff and Rebecca Vasko, 16-18. Indianapolis: The Center for the Study of Religion and American Culture: Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis, 2009.

Orsi, Robert A. "Everyday Miracles: The Study of Lived Religion." In *Lived Religion in America: Toward a History of Practice*, ed. David D Hall, 3-22. Princeton , Princeton University Press, 1997.

Owram, Doug. *The Government Generation: Canadian Intellectuals and the State, 1900-1945*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986.

Pascoe, Peggy. *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Pederson, Diana. "'Keeping Our Good Girls Good': *The YMCA and the Girl Problem, 1870—1930.*"*Canadian Women's Studies* 7, no. *4* (*Winter 1986*): 20-40.

Petrie, Anne. *Gone to an Aunt's: Remembering Canada's Homes for Unwed Mothers*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1998.

Pitsula, James. "The Emergence of Social Work in Toronto."*Journal of Canadian Studies* 14 (Spring 1979): 35-42.

Rawylk, George. *Canada Fire: Radical Evangelicalism in British North America, 1775-1812*. Montreal: McGill University Press, 1994.

Reekie, Gail. *Measuring Immorality: Social Inquiry and the Problem of Illegitimacy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Rosen, Ruth. *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900-1918*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982.

Rossiter, K. and A. Clarkson. "Opening Ontario's 'Saddest Chapter': A Social History of theHuronia Regional Centre." *Journal of Canadian Disability Studies* 2, no. 3 (September 2013).

Rutherdale, Myra. "'Canada Is No Dumping Ground:' Salvation Army Immigrants, Public Discourse and the Lived Experiences of Women and Children Newcomers, 1900-1930." *Histoire Sociale/Social History* 79 (May 2007): 75-115.

Sandall, Robert. *The History of the Salvation Army: Social Reform and Welfare Work*. London: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd., 1955.

Sangster, Joan. *Girl Trouble: Female Delinquency in English Canada*. Toronto: Between the Lines, 2002.

Sansone, Randy A., and Lori A. Sansone."Sexual Behaviour in Borderline Personality." *Innovations in Clinical Neuroscience* 8, no. 2 (February 2011): 14-18.

Scott, Beverley J. *Establishing Professional Social Work in Vancouver and at the University of British Columbia*. Vancouver: Published by Author, 2004.

Simmons, H.*From Asylums to Welfare.* Toronto, ON: National Institute on Mental Retardation, 1982.

Stansell, Christine. *City of Women: Sex and Class in New York, 1789-1920*. Urbana: University of Press, 1982.

Strange, Carolyn.*Toronto's Girl Problem: The Perils and Pleasures of the City, 1880-1930*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995.

Taiz, Lillian. *Hallelujah Lads and Lasses: Remaking the Salvation Army in America, 1880-1930*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001.

Torrey, E. Fuller. *Out of the Shadows: Confronting America's Mental Illness Crisis*. New York: John Wiley, 2007.

Trent, James W. Jr. *Inventing the Feeble Mind: A History of Mental Retardation in the United States*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1994.

Turner, John Munsey. *Wesleyan Methodism*. London: Epworth Press, 2005.

Valenstein, Elliot S. *Blaming the Brain: The Truth and Drugs and Mental Health*. New York: The Free Press, 1988.

Valverde, Mariana. *The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc., 1991.

Vanderwoerd, J.R." Threat from the South: Is American Religion Bad news for Canadian Social Welfare?"*Critical Social Work* 7, no.1 (2006).

Van Die, Marguerite. *Religion, Family, and Community in Victorian Canada: The Colbys ofCarrollcroft*. London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005.

Van Die, Marguerite. "Revisiting 'Separate Spheres': Women, Religion and the Family in Mid-Victorian Brantford, Ontario ." In *Households of Faith: Family, Gender, and Community in Canada, 1760-1969,* ed. Nancy Christie, 234-263. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002.

Vrooman, Tamara. "The Wayward and the Feeble-Minded: Euthenics, Eugenics, and the Provincial Industrial Home for Girls, 1914-1929." M.A. thesis, University of Victoria, 1994.

Walker, Pamela. *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down: The Salvation Army in Victorian Britain*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2001.

Walkowitz, Judith R. *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class, and the State*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980.

Weitzer, Ronald John. *Legalizing Prostitution: From Illicit Vice to Lawful Business*. New York: New York University Press, 2012.

Wills, Gale. *A Marriage of Convenience: Business and Social Work in Toronto, 1918-1957*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995.

Winston, Diane. *Red-Hot and Righteous: The Urban Religion of the Salvation Army*. Boston: Harvard University Press, 2009.

Wright, David. *Downs: The History of a Disability*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Websites:

Albert, Jim and Bill Kirwin."Social and Welfare Services."The Canadian Encyclopedia (15 December 2013) http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/social-and-welfare-services/ (Accessed 8 May 2014).

"A little bit about us..." *The Salvation Army Bethany Home*. http://www.bethanyhome.ca/About%20Us.html.(Accessed 18 March 2014).

"Profession."*Oxford English Dictionary*. http://www.oed.com/search?searchType=dictionary&q=professionte&_searchBtn=Search. (Accessed 18 February 2014).

"Prostitute."*Oxford English Dictionary*. http://www.oed.com/search?searchType=dictionary&q=prostitute&_searchBtn=Search. (Accessed 18 February 2014).

"Residential Care," *British Columbia Ministry of Health*, http://www.health.gov.bc.ca/ccf/adult_care.html (accessed 8 May 2014).

"Salvation Army Grace Hospital (Calgary, Alta.)." *Archives Society of Alberta*. http://www.albertaonrecord.ca/salvation-army-grace-hospital-calgary-alta. (Accessed 18 March 2014).

"Sex work."*Oxford English Dictionary*. http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/176989?redirectedFrom=sex+work#eid23490098. (Accessed 18 February 2014).

"Social Gospel."*The Canadian Encyclopedia*. http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/social-gospel/. (Accessed 4 March 2014).

"Sterilization Policy."*Inclusion BC*. http://www.inclusionbc.org/about-us/social-policy-positions/sterilization. (Accessed 4 March 2014).

"The Adoption History Project."*University of Oregon*. http://pages.uoregon.edu/adoption/topics/socialwork.htm. (Accessed 12 October 2013).

"The Salvation Army Bethany Home." http://www.bethanyhome.ca/About%20Us.html. (Accessed 4 March 2014).

"The Salvation Army Saskatoon Bethany Home."OpenCharity. http://www.opencharity.ca/charity/107951618RR0218 (Assessed 8 May 2014).

"Vancouver Island 1891 Census." *viHistory*.http://vihistory.ca/search/searchcensus.php?start=0&show=n&form=full&year=1891&familynumber=394&districtid=4&subdistrictid=c-3. (Accessed 10 November 2013).